NEW YORK ANTITRUST AND CONSUMER PROTECTION LAW

(THIRD EDITION)

Editors:
Barbara Hart, Esq.
Robert Hubbard, Esq.
Stephen S. Madsen, Esq.

New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2011
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 1-57969-321-0
Product Number: 40258

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface xi

Chapter 1 New York Antitrust Law—The Donnelly Act 1
Elai Katz, Esq.

Chapter 2 Unfair and Deceptive Business Practices 39
April Tabor, Esq.

Chapter 3 Government Enforcement under Executive Law § 63(12) 57
Paul R. Braunsdorf, Esq.
Gregory J. McDonald, Esq.

Chapter 4 Private Enforcement 73
Jennifer B. Patterson

Chapter 5 Settlements of Government Antitrust Cases 93
Lawrence I. Fox, Esq.

Chapter 6 Multistate Enforcement of Antitrust and Consumer Protection Laws—An Overview 209
Emily Myers, Esq.

About the Contributors 231
Table of Authorities 233

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface xi

Chapter 1 New York Antitrust Law—The Donnelly Act
Elai Katz, Esq.

[1.0] I. Introduction 3
[1.1] II. Legislative History and the Antitrust Laws 3
[1.2] A. New York Statutory and Common Law Background of the Donnelly Act 4
[1.3] B. Legislative History Surrounding the Passage of the Donnelly Act 5
[1.4] III. Contemporary Interpretation of the Donnelly Act in Light of Federal Sherman Act Cases 7
[1.5] IV. Donnelly Act Basics: Key Areas of Antitrust Law in the Donnelly Act 9
[1.6] A. Overview—Statutory Language 9
[1.7] B. Concerted Activity and "Arrangements" 9
[1.8] C. Monopolization 11
[1.9] D. Agreements among Competitors 13
[1.10] E. Agreements Between Buyers and Sellers 16
[1.11] 1. Agreements on Resale Prices 16
[1.12] 2. Non-Price Agreements Between Buyers and Sellers 17
[1.13] F. Refusals to Deal 17
[1.14] G. Tying Arrangements 18
[1.15] H. Attempts 20
[1.16] I. Damages and Penalties 21
[1.17] 1. Treble Damage Actions 21
[1.18] 2. Criminal Penalties 22
[1.19] 3. Civil Penalties 23
[1.20] V. Price Discrimination 23
[1.21] VI. Immunities, Exemptions and Defenses to Antitrust Liability 24
[1.22] A. State and Local Government Action 25
[1.23] B. Statutory Exemptions and Defenses 25
[1.24] 1. Labor 25
[1.25] 2. Agriculture 27
[1.26] 3. Right to Contribution 27
[1.27] C. Statutory Exemptions for Regulated Industries 27
[1.28] 1. Insurance 27

[1.29] 2. Utilities 29
[1.30] 3. Farmers Cooperatives 30
[1.31] 4. Motor Carrier Rate Bureaus 30
[1.32] 5. Solid Waste Disposal 30
[1.33] D. Judicially Created Exemptions and Defenses 30
[1.34] 1. Licensed Professionals 30
[1.35] 2. Nonprofit Charitable Associations 31
[1.36] 3. Oil and Natural Gas 31
[1.37] 4. Petitioning Activity 32
[1.38] 5. Primary Jurisdiction Doctrine 32
[1.39] 6. *In Pari Delicto* 33
[1.40] 7. Unclean Hands 33
[1.41] E. Witnesses' Immunities 34
[1.42] VII. Federal Preemption 34
[1.43] A. Introduction 34
[1.44] B. Claim Preclusion 37
[1.45] VIII. Statute of Limitations 38

Chapter 2 Unfair and Deceptive Business Practices
April Tabor, Esq.

[2.0] I. Statutory Authority 41
[2.1] A. Unlawful Practices under N.Y. General Business Law § 349 and § 350 (GBL) 41
[2.2] 1. Employers 42
[2.3] 2. Doctors 43
[2.4] B. Remedies 43
[2.5] 1. Remedies Available to the State Attorney General 43
[2.6] 2. Remedies Available to Private Plaintiffs 44
[2.7] C. Federal Consumer Protection Law 45
[2.8] II. Cases 47
[2.9] A. "Consumer-Oriented" Transaction 48
[2.10] B. Misrepresentation in a Material Way 52
[2.11] C. Injury to P "by Reason of" D's Conduct 54
[2.12] 1. "Actual Harm"/Causation 54
[2.13] 2. Statute of Limitations 56

Chapter 3 Government Enforcement under Executive Law § 63(12)
Paul R. Braunsdorf, Esq.
Gregory J. McDonald, Esq.

[3.0] I. Introduction 59
[3.1] II. The Statute 59
[3.2] A. Text of Executive Law § 63(12) 59
[3.3] B. Legislative History 60
[3.4] C. Broad Applicability of the Statute 61
[3.5] D. Key Terms and Their Judicial Interpretation.. 62
[3.6] 1. Fraud or Fraudulent 62
[3.7] 2. Illegality 64
[3.8] 3. Persistent or Repeated Conduct 66
[3.9] III. Investigatory Powers of the Attorney General 66
[3.10] IV. Proceedings under § 63(12) 67
[3.11] V. Remedies 68
[3.12] A. Injunctive Relief 69
[3.13] B. Restitution and Damages 69
[3.14] C. Cancellation of Business Certificate and Recovery of Penalties and Allowance 70
[3.15] VI. Practical Considerations 71

Chapter 4 Private Enforcement
Jennifer B. Patterson

[4.0] I. Introduction 75
[4.1] II. Private Enforcement under the Donnelly Act—Select Issues 76
[4.2] A. Indirect Purchasers Can Sue for Damages 76
[4.3] B. Remoteness Challenge Upheld Despite Donnelly Act Amendment 78
[4.4] C. Class Actions in State Court Are Barred under the Donnelly Act 78
[4.5] D. The Donnelly Act Prohibition Against Duplicate Recovery 81
[4.6] III. The New York Consumer Protection Act—GBL § 349 82
[4.7] A. Remoteness Bar to Standing under GBL § 349 83
[4.8] B. Class Actions under GBL § 349 84
[4.9] C. Judicial Bar to Duplicate Recovery under GBL § 349 85
[4.10] D. GBL § 349 Claims Require Actual Deception of Consumers 85

[4.11] IV. Unjust Enrichment 88
[4.12] V. The New York False Claims Act 89
[4.13] A. Introduction 89
[4.14] B. *Qui Tam* Actions for False Claims 90
[4.15] C. Construction of the Act 91

Chapter 5 Settlements of Government Antitrust Cases
Lawrence I. Fox, Esq.

[5.0] I. Introduction 95
[5.1] II. Considerations in Settling 96
[5.2] A. Advantages of Settling 96
[5.3] B. Disadvantages of Settling 98
[5.4] C. Bilateral Settlements in Multiparty Cases 98
[5.5] D. Effect of Judgment Sharing/Indemnification Agreements on Advisability of Settlement 99
[5.6] E. Third-Party Intervention 100
[5.7] F. Use of Settlement or Consent Decree as Evidence in Subsequent Litigation 102
[5.8] G. Collateral Estoppel Effect of Antitrust Settlement 103
[5.9] H. Anticompetitive Effects and Implications of Settlement Agreements 105
[5.10] I. Timing Issues: When to Settle 105
[5.11] J. Court Approval of Settlement Agreements 106
[5.12] K. Violation of Consent Decrees 109
[5.13] 1. Introduction 109
[5.14] 2. The Issue of Interpretation 109
[5.15] 3. Recent Developments 111
[5.16] L. Modification & Termination Decrees 111
[5.17] 1. The Early Years 111
[5.18] 2. Current Law 112
[5.19] 3. Modification and the Continuing Microsoft Saga 113
[5.20] III. Form and Contents of Settlement Agreements 115
[5.21] A. Opening Statement 115
[5.22] 1. Parties 115
[5.23] 2. Preamble 115
[5.24] B. Definitions of Terms 117
[5.25] C. Agreement 118
[5.26] 1. Scope of the Settlement 118
[5.27] 2. Bona Fides 119
[5.28] 3. Class Certification 119

[5.29] D. Injunction 120
[5.30] 1. Injunctive Relief 120
[5.31] 2. Divestiture and Dissolution 120
[5.32] 3. Rights Retained by Company 121
[5.33] E. Administration Account 121
[5.34] 1. Amount of Payment 121
[5.35] 2. Nonconsummation Clause 122
[5.36] 3. Event of Nonparticipation by States 123
[5.37] 4. Residual Funds 123
[5.38] 5. Administration of Moneys Paid as Settlement 124
[5.39] F. Restitution 125
[5.40] 1. Nonadmission of Liability 125
[5.41] 2. Use of Funds Paid 126
[5.42] 3. *Cy Pres* revisions in Consent Decrees 129
[5.43] a. *Cy Pres* Distribution in Settlements, Generally 129
[5.44] b. *Cy Pres* Distribution in Antitrust Consent Decrees 129
[5.45] 4. Event of Nonparticipation by States 132
[5.46] 5. Attorney Fees for Private Plaintiffs 132
[5.47] G. Affirmative Relief 133
[5.48] H. Claims Procedure 134
[5.49] 1. Identification of Class Members 135
[5.50] 2. Distribution 135
[5.51] 3. Additional Payments 135
[5.52] I. Preliminary Approval and Notice 135
[5.53] 1. Notice by Mail to Qualified Consumers 136
[5.54] 2. Notice by Publication of Advertisements 136
[5.55] 3. Right of Qualified Purchasers to Opt Out of Settlement 137
[5.56] J. Enforcement 138
[5.57] 1. Continued Jurisdiction of the Court 138
[5.58] 2. Institution of an Action if Settlement Is Breached 138
[5.59] 3. Inspection 139
[5.60] 4. Compliance Procedures 139
[5.61] K. Implementation 141
[5.62] 1. Application for Court Approval 142
[5.63] 2. Entry of Final Judgment 143

[5.64] 3. Dismissal of Claims 143
[5.65] 4. Release by States 143
[5.66] 5. Nonadmission by Defendants 144
[5.67] 6. Event of Disapproval by the Court 144
[5.68] 7. Bona Fides 145
[5.69] L. Benefit and Binding Effect 145
[5.70] M. Term 145
[5.71] N. Information Disclosed During Settlement 146
[5.72] 1. Tunney Act Section 16(b): Publication of Information 146
[5.73] 2. Standard Provisions 147
[5.74] O. Agreement Voidable 147
[5.75] P. Bankruptcy Provisions: Language and Purpose 148
[5.76] Q. Integration Clause 149
[5.77] IV. Conclusion 150

Appendix A Settlement Agreement (Sample 1) 151
Appendix B Settlement Agreement (Sample 2) 167
Appendix C Settlement Agreement (Sample 3) 187
Appendix D Settlement Agreement (Sample 4) 195

Chapter 6 Multistate Enforcement of Antitrust and Consumer Protection Laws—An Overview
Emily Myers, Esq.

[6.0] I. Introduction 211
[6.1] II. Legal Authority 211
[6.2] A. Federal Law 211
[6.3] B. State Law 214
[6.4] III. Multistate Enforcement 218
[6.5] A. Antitrust 219
[6.6] B. Consumer Protection 224
[6.7] IV. The National Association of Attorneys General 226
[6.8] A. Competition and Consumer Protection Advocacy 228
[6.9] B. Enforcement Guidelines 229

About the Contributors 231
Table of Authorities 233

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

PAUL BRAUNSDORF, ESQ.

Paul Braunsdorf is a partner in the Rochester law firm of Harris Beach PLLC, where his primary areas of practice are antitrust law (both litigation and counseling) and commercial litigation. A graduate of the University of Virginia Law School, he is a member of the American Bar Association's Antitrust Section and Litigation Section. He is also a member of the New York State Bar Association's Antitrust Law Section and Trial Lawyers Section. (He has been a member of the Antitrust Law Section's Executive Committee for several years.) He was a contributing author for the *Antitrust Health Care Handbook II* (ABA 1993) as well as a contributing author for both *Antitrust Law in New York State* (1993) and *Antitrust Law in New York State* (Second Edition, 2002). He has lectured on various antitrust and litigation topics for the New York State and Monroe County Bar Associations.

LAWRENCE I. FOX, ESQ.

Lawrence I. Fox is the partner principally responsible for McDermott Will & Emery's Distribution Law & Strategies Group and is also the head of the Antitrust and Competition practice of the firm's New York office. He has represented clients in handling investigations, litigations and trials commenced by private plaintiffs as well as federal and state antitrust authorities. His distribution practice includes advising clients regarding their domestic and international activities.

ELAI KATZ, ESQ.

Elai Katz is a partner at Cahill Gordon & Reindel LLP, where his practice focuses on a wide range of antitrust law matters, including mergers and acquisitions, counseling, litigation and government investigations. He is a member of the Executive Committee of the New York State Bar Association's Antitrust Law Section. Elai writes a monthly column on antitrust law in the *New York Law Journal* and is recognized among the top antitrust lawyers in New York by *Chambers USA*. Elai earned his B.A. at Yale University and studied law at Columbia Law School.

GREGORY J. MCDONALD, ESQ.

Gregory J. McDonald, a partner in the Rochester, New York office of Bond, Schoeneck & King, PLLC, concentrates on business and commercial litigation. He received his J.D. from Pace University School of Law, magna cum laude, and his undergraduate degree from Tulane University.

EMILY MYERS, ESQ.

Emily Myers is Antitrust Counsel at the National Association of Attorneys General. Before joining NAAG in 1993, she was an associate in the Washington office of Squire, Sanders & Dempsey. She received her law degree in 1987 from the University of Pennsylvania, where she was an Arthur C. Littleton Legal Writing Instructor, and her undergraduate degree in History from Brown University in 1982. She is the author of the "State Enforcement" chapter of the ABA publication *Antitrust Law Developments V*, as well as several annual updates to the treatise. Emily also works on Attorney General powers and duties cases and is the editor of *State Attorneys General Powers and Responsibilities*, a treatise on state Attorneys General, published in 2007.

JENNIFER B. PATTERSON, ESQ.

Jennifer B. Patterson is a partner at Kaye Scholer LLP, where her practice focuses on antitrust law (including litigation, mergers, and counseling) and commercial litigation. She is a co-author of a chapter on U.S. antitrust law in *the Frankfurter Kommentar: Kartellrecht*, a German antitrust law treatise, and has lectured on various antitrust topics in both Germany and the U.S. Jennifer received her law degree from the Georgetown University Law Center and her undergraduate degree from Vanderbilt University.

APRIL TABOR, ESQ.

April Tabor is a Senior Attorney at the Federal Trade Commission and Vice President at Silver Starr Art Studios LLC. She was a partner at McDermott Will & Emery LLP. She graduated from Columbia University and Georgetown University Law Center.