

NEW YORK ANTITRUST AND CONSUMER PROTECTION LAW

(THIRD EDITION)

Editors:

Barbara Hart, Esq.

Robert Hubbard, Esq.

Stephen S. Madsen, Esq.

New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2011
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 1-57969-321-0
Product Number: 40258

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------------------------------|--|-----|
| Preface | | xi |
| Chapter 1 | New York Antitrust Law—The Donnelly Act..... <i>Elai Katz, Esq.</i> | 1 |
| Chapter 2 | Unfair and Deceptive Business Practices..... <i>April Tabor, Esq.</i> | 39 |
| Chapter 3 | Government Enforcement under Executive Law § 63(12) | 57 |
| | <i>Paul R. Braunsdorf, Esq.</i> <i>Gregory J. McDonald, Esq.</i> | |
| Chapter 4 | Private Enforcement..... <i>Jennifer B. Patterson</i> | 73 |
| Chapter 5 | Settlements of Government Antitrust Cases | 93 |
| | <i>Lawrence I. Fox, Esq.</i> | |
| Chapter 6 | Multistate Enforcement of Antitrust and Consumer Protection Laws—An Overview..... | 209 |
| | <i>Emily Myers, Esq.</i> | |
| About the Contributors | | 231 |
| Table of Authorities..... | | 233 |

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------------------|--|----|
| Preface | | xi |
| | | |
| Chapter 1 | New York Antitrust Law—The Donnelly Act | |
| | <i>Elai Katz, Esq.</i> | |
| | | |
| [1.0] | I. Introduction | 3 |
| [1.1] | II. Legislative History and the Antitrust Laws..... | 3 |
| [1.2] | A. New York Statutory and Common Law Background of the Donnelly Act..... | 4 |
| [1.3] | B. Legislative History Surrounding the Passage of the Donnelly Act | 5 |
| [1.4] | III. Contemporary Interpretation of the Donnelly Act in Light of Federal Sherman Act Cases..... | 7 |
| [1.5] | IV. Donnelly Act Basics: Key Areas of Antitrust Law in the Donnelly Act | 9 |
| [1.6] | A. Overview—Statutory Language..... | 9 |
| [1.7] | B. Concerted Activity and “Arrangements”..... | 9 |
| [1.8] | C. Monopolization..... | 11 |
| [1.9] | D. Agreements among Competitors | 13 |
| [1.10] | E. Agreements Between Buyers and Sellers..... | 16 |
| [1.11] | 1. Agreements on Resale Prices | 16 |
| [1.12] | 2. Non-Price Agreements Between Buyers and Sellers | 17 |
| [1.13] | F. Refusals to Deal..... | 17 |
| [1.14] | G. Tying Arrangements..... | 18 |
| [1.15] | H. Attempts | 20 |
| [1.16] | I. Damages and Penalties | 21 |
| [1.17] | 1. Treble Damage Actions..... | 21 |
| [1.18] | 2. Criminal Penalties | 22 |
| [1.19] | 3. Civil Penalties..... | 23 |
| [1.20] | V. Price Discrimination..... | 23 |
| [1.21] | VI. Immunities, Exemptions and Defenses to Antitrust Liability | 24 |
| [1.22] | A. State and Local Government Action | 25 |
| [1.23] | B. Statutory Exemptions and Defenses..... | 25 |
| [1.24] | 1. Labor..... | 25 |
| [1.25] | 2. Agriculture..... | 27 |
| [1.26] | 3. Right to Contribution..... | 27 |
| [1.27] | C. Statutory Exemptions for Regulated Industries | 27 |
| [1.28] | 1. Insurance..... | 27 |

| | | |
|--------|---|----|
| [1.29] | 2. Utilities | 29 |
| [1.30] | 3. Farmers Cooperatives | 30 |
| [1.31] | 4. Motor Carrier Rate Bureaus | 30 |
| [1.32] | 5. Solid Waste Disposal | 30 |
| [1.33] | D. Judicially Created Exemptions and Defenses..... | 30 |
| [1.34] | 1. Licensed Professionals | 30 |
| [1.35] | 2. Nonprofit Charitable Associations | 31 |
| [1.36] | 3. Oil and Natural Gas | 31 |
| [1.37] | 4. Petitioning Activity..... | 32 |
| [1.38] | 5. Primary Jurisdiction Doctrine..... | 32 |
| [1.39] | 6. <i>In Pari Delicto</i> | 33 |
| [1.40] | 7. Unclean Hands..... | 33 |
| [1.41] | E. Witnesses' Immunities | 34 |
| [1.42] | VII. Federal Preemption..... | 34 |
| [1.43] | A. Introduction | 34 |
| [1.44] | B. Claim Preclusion..... | 37 |
| [1.45] | VIII. Statute of Limitations | 38 |

Chapter 2 Unfair and Deceptive Business Practices

April Tabor, Esq.

| | | |
|--------|--|----|
| [2.0] | I. Statutory Authority | 41 |
| [2.1] | A. Unlawful Practices under N.Y. General Business Law § 349 and § 350 (GBL) | 41 |
| [2.2] | 1. Employers | 42 |
| [2.3] | 2. Doctors..... | 43 |
| [2.4] | B. Remedies | 43 |
| [2.5] | 1. Remedies Available to the State Attorney General | 43 |
| [2.6] | 2. Remedies Available to Private Plaintiffs..... | 44 |
| [2.7] | C. Federal Consumer Protection Law | 45 |
| [2.8] | II. Cases..... | 47 |
| [2.9] | A. “Consumer-Oriented” Transaction | 48 |
| [2.10] | B. Misrepresentation in a Material Way | 52 |
| [2.11] | C. Injury to P “by Reason of” D’s Conduct | 54 |
| [2.12] | 1. “Actual Harm”/Causation..... | 54 |
| [2.13] | 2. Statute of Limitations | 56 |

Chapter 3 Government Enforcement under Executive Law § 63(12)

Paul R. Braunsdorf, Esq.

Gregory J. McDonald, Esq.

| | | | |
|--------|------|--|----|
| [3.0] | I. | Introduction | 59 |
| [3.1] | II. | The Statute..... | 59 |
| [3.2] | A. | Text of Executive Law § 63(12)..... | 59 |
| [3.3] | B. | Legislative History | 60 |
| [3.4] | C. | Broad Applicability of the Statute..... | 61 |
| [3.5] | D. | Key Terms and Their Judicial Interpretation.. | 62 |
| [3.6] | 1. | Fraud or Fraudulent | 62 |
| [3.7] | 2. | Illegality..... | 64 |
| [3.8] | 3. | Persistent or Repeated Conduct..... | 66 |
| [3.9] | III. | Investigatory Powers of the Attorney General | 66 |
| [3.10] | IV. | Proceedings under § 63(12)..... | 67 |
| [3.11] | V. | Remedies | 68 |
| [3.12] | A. | Injunctive Relief | 69 |
| [3.13] | B. | Restitution and Damages..... | 69 |
| [3.14] | C. | Cancellation of Business Certificate and Recovery of Penalties and Allowance..... | 70 |
| [3.15] | VI. | Practical Considerations | 71 |

Chapter 4 Private Enforcement

Jennifer B. Patterson

| | | | |
|--------|------|---|----|
| [4.0] | I. | Introduction | 75 |
| [4.1] | II. | Private Enforcement under the Donnelly Act— Select Issues..... | 76 |
| [4.2] | A. | Indirect Purchasers Can Sue for Damages | 76 |
| [4.3] | B. | Remoteness Challenge Upheld Despite Donnelly Act Amendment..... | 78 |
| [4.4] | C. | Class Actions in State Court Are Barred under the Donnelly Act | 78 |
| [4.5] | D. | The Donnelly Act Prohibition Against Duplicate Recovery | 81 |
| [4.6] | III. | The New York Consumer Protection Act— GBL § 349 | 82 |
| [4.7] | A. | Remoteness Bar to Standing under GBL § 349 | 83 |
| [4.8] | B. | Class Actions under GBL § 349..... | 84 |
| [4.9] | C. | Judicial Bar to Duplicate Recovery under GBL § 349 | 85 |
| [4.10] | D. | GBL § 349 Claims Require Actual Deception of Consumers | 85 |

| | | | |
|--------|-----|---|----|
| [4.11] | IV. | Unjust Enrichment..... | 88 |
| [4.12] | V. | The New York False Claims Act..... | 89 |
| [4.13] | A. | Introduction | 89 |
| [4.14] | B. | <i>Qui Tam</i> Actions for False Claims | 90 |
| [4.15] | C. | Construction of the Act..... | 91 |

Chapter 5 Settlements of Government Antitrust Cases

Lawrence I. Fox, Esq.

| | | | |
|--------|------|--|-----|
| [5.0] | I. | Introduction | 95 |
| [5.1] | II. | Considerations in Settling..... | 96 |
| [5.2] | A. | Advantages of Settling..... | 96 |
| [5.3] | B. | Disadvantages of Settling | 98 |
| [5.4] | C. | Bilateral Settlements in Multiparty Cases | 98 |
| [5.5] | D. | Effect of Judgment Sharing/Indemnification Agreements on Advisability of Settlement.... | 99 |
| [5.6] | E. | Third-Party Intervention | 100 |
| [5.7] | F. | Use of Settlement or Consent Decree as Evidence in Subsequent Litigation | 102 |
| [5.8] | G. | Collateral Estoppel Effect of Antitrust Settlement | 103 |
| [5.9] | H. | Anticompetitive Effects and Implications of Settlement Agreements..... | 105 |
| [5.10] | I. | Timing Issues: When to Settle..... | 105 |
| [5.11] | J. | Court Approval of Settlement Agreements | 106 |
| [5.12] | K. | Violation of Consent Decrees..... | 109 |
| [5.13] | 1. | Introduction | 109 |
| [5.14] | 2. | The Issue of Interpretation..... | 109 |
| [5.15] | 3. | Recent Developments | 111 |
| [5.16] | L. | Modification & Termination Decrees..... | 111 |
| [5.17] | 1. | The Early Years | 111 |
| [5.18] | 2. | Current Law | 112 |
| [5.19] | 3. | Modification and the Continuing Microsoft Saga..... | 113 |
| [5.20] | III. | Form and Contents of Settlement Agreements..... | 115 |
| [5.21] | A. | Opening Statement | 115 |
| [5.22] | 1. | Parties | 115 |
| [5.23] | 2. | Preamble | 115 |
| [5.24] | B. | Definitions of Terms..... | 117 |
| [5.25] | C. | Agreement | 118 |
| [5.26] | 1. | Scope of the Settlement | 118 |
| [5.27] | 2. | Bona Fides | 119 |
| [5.28] | 3. | Class Certification | 119 |

| | | |
|--------|---|-----|
| [5.29] | D. Injunction..... | 120 |
| [5.30] | 1. Injunctive Relief | 120 |
| [5.31] | 2. Divestiture and Dissolution | 120 |
| [5.32] | 3. Rights Retained by Company | 121 |
| [5.33] | E. Administration Account | 121 |
| [5.34] | 1. Amount of Payment..... | 121 |
| [5.35] | 2. Nonconsummation Clause..... | 122 |
| [5.36] | 3. Event of Nonparticipation by States..... | 123 |
| [5.37] | 4. Residual Funds | 123 |
| [5.38] | 5. Administration of Moneys Paid as Settlement | 124 |
| [5.39] | F. Restitution..... | 125 |
| [5.40] | 1. Nonadmission of Liability | 125 |
| [5.41] | 2. Use of Funds Paid..... | 126 |
| [5.42] | 3. <i>Cy Pres</i> revisions in Consent Decrees..... | 129 |
| [5.43] | a. <i>Cy Pres</i> Distribution in Settlements, Generally | 129 |
| [5.44] | b. <i>Cy Pres</i> Distribution in Antitrust Consent Decrees..... | 129 |
| [5.45] | 4. Event of Nonparticipation by States..... | 132 |
| [5.46] | 5. Attorney Fees for Private Plaintiffs | 132 |
| [5.47] | G. Affirmative Relief | 133 |
| [5.48] | H. Claims Procedure..... | 134 |
| [5.49] | 1. Identification of Class Members | 135 |
| [5.50] | 2. Distribution..... | 135 |
| [5.51] | 3. Additional Payments | 135 |
| [5.52] | I. Preliminary Approval and Notice..... | 135 |
| [5.53] | 1. Notice by Mail to Qualified Consumers | 136 |
| [5.54] | 2. Notice by Publication of Advertisements | 136 |
| [5.55] | 3. Right of Qualified Purchasers to Opt Out of Settlement..... | 137 |
| [5.56] | J. Enforcement | 138 |
| [5.57] | 1. Continued Jurisdiction of the Court | 138 |
| [5.58] | 2. Institution of an Action if Settlement Is Breached | 138 |
| [5.59] | 3. Inspection | 139 |
| [5.60] | 4. Compliance Procedures | 139 |
| [5.61] | K. Implementation..... | 141 |
| [5.62] | 1. Application for Court Approval | 142 |
| [5.63] | 2. Entry of Final Judgment | 143 |

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| [5.64] | 3. Dismissal of Claims | 143 |
| [5.65] | 4. Release by States | 143 |
| [5.66] | 5. Nonadmission by Defendants | 144 |
| [5.67] | 6. Event of Disapproval by the Court | 144 |
| [5.68] | 7. Bona Fides | 145 |
| [5.69] | L. Benefit and Binding Effect | 145 |
| [5.70] | M. Term..... | 145 |
| [5.71] | N. Information Disclosed During Settlement | 146 |
| [5.72] | 1. Tunney Act Section 16(b): Publication of Information | 146 |
| [5.73] | 2. Standard Provisions | 147 |
| [5.74] | O. Agreement Voidable..... | 147 |
| [5.75] | P. Bankruptcy Provisions: Language and Purpose | 148 |
| [5.76] | Q. Integration Clause..... | 149 |
| [5.77] | IV. Conclusion | 150 |
| Appendix A | Settlement Agreement (Sample 1)..... | 151 |
| Appendix B | Settlement Agreement (Sample 2)..... | 167 |
| Appendix C | Settlement Agreement (Sample 3)..... | 187 |
| Appendix D | Settlement Agreement (Sample 4)..... | 195 |

Chapter 6 Multistate Enforcement of Antitrust and Consumer Protection Laws—An Overview

Emily Myers, Esq.

| | | |
|-------|--|-----|
| [6.0] | I. Introduction | 211 |
| [6.1] | II. Legal Authority..... | 211 |
| [6.2] | A. Federal Law | 211 |
| [6.3] | B. State Law | 214 |
| [6.4] | III. Multistate Enforcement | 218 |
| [6.5] | A. Antitrust | 219 |
| [6.6] | B. Consumer Protection | 224 |
| [6.7] | IV. The National Association of Attorneys General.... | 226 |
| [6.8] | A. Competition and Consumer Protection Advocacy | 228 |
| [6.9] | B. Enforcement Guidelines | 229 |
| | About the Contributors | 231 |
| | Table of Authorities | 233 |

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

PAUL BRAUNSDORF, ESQ.

Paul Braunsdorf is a partner in the Rochester law firm of Harris Beach PLLC, where his primary areas of practice are antitrust law (both litigation and counseling) and commercial litigation. A graduate of the University of Virginia Law School, he is a member of the American Bar Association's Antitrust Section and Litigation Section. He is also a member of the New York State Bar Association's Antitrust Law Section and Trial Lawyers Section. (He has been a member of the Antitrust Law Section's Executive Committee for several years.) He was a contributing author for the *Antitrust Health Care Handbook II* (ABA 1993) as well as a contributing author for both *Antitrust Law in New York State* (1993) and *Antitrust Law in New York State* (Second Edition, 2002). He has lectured on various antitrust and litigation topics for the New York State and Monroe County Bar Associations.

LAWRENCE I. FOX, ESQ.

Lawrence I. Fox is the partner principally responsible for McDermott Will & Emery's Distribution Law & Strategies Group and is also the head of the Antitrust and Competition practice of the firm's New York office. He has represented clients in handling investigations, litigations and trials commenced by private plaintiffs as well as federal and state antitrust authorities. His distribution practice includes advising clients regarding their domestic and international activities.

ELAI KATZ, ESQ.

Elai Katz is a partner at Cahill Gordon & Reindel LLP, where his practice focuses on a wide range of antitrust law matters, including mergers and acquisitions, counseling, litigation and government investigations. He is a member of the Executive Committee of the New York State Bar Association's Antitrust Law Section. Elai writes a monthly column on antitrust law in the *New York Law Journal* and is recognized among the top antitrust lawyers in New York by *Chambers USA*. Elai earned his B.A. at Yale University and studied law at Columbia Law School.

GREGORY J. MCDONALD, ESQ.

Gregory J. McDonald, a partner in the Rochester, New York office of Bond, Schoeneck & King, PLLC, concentrates on business and commercial litigation. He received his J.D. from Pace University School of Law, magna cum laude, and his undergraduate degree from Tulane University.

EMILY MYERS, ESQ.

Emily Myers is Antitrust Counsel at the National Association of Attorneys General. Before joining NAAG in 1993, she was an associate in the Washington office of Squire, Sanders & Dempsey. She received her law degree in 1987 from the University of Pennsylvania, where she was an Arthur C. Littleton Legal Writing Instructor, and her undergraduate degree in History from Brown University in 1982. She is the author of the “State Enforcement” chapter of the ABA publication *Antitrust Law Developments V*, as well as several annual updates to the treatise. Emily also works on Attorney General powers and duties cases and is the editor of *State Attorneys General Powers and Responsibilities*, a treatise on state Attorneys General, published in 2007.

JENNIFER B. PATTERSON, ESQ.

Jennifer B. Patterson is a partner at Kaye Scholer LLP, where her practice focuses on antitrust law (including litigation, mergers, and counseling) and commercial litigation. She is a co-author of a chapter on U.S. antitrust law in *the Frankfurter Kommentar: Kartellrecht*, a German antitrust law treatise, and has lectured on various antitrust topics in both Germany and the U.S. Jennifer received her law degree from the Georgetown University Law Center and her undergraduate degree from Vanderbilt University.

APRIL TABOR, ESQ.

April Tabor is a Senior Attorney at the Federal Trade Commission and Vice President at Silver Starr Art Studios LLC. She was a partner at McDermott Will & Emery LLP. She graduated from Columbia University and Georgetown University Law Center.