

New York Lawyers' Practical Skills Series

Criminal Law and Practice

Jay Shapiro, Esq.
Lawrence N. Gray, Esq.*

2018–2019

* Lawrence N. Gray was the update author from 2004 until his death in 2017. The Hon. Leslie Crocker Snyder and Hon. Alex M. Calabrese wrote the original monograph.

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION  NYSBA

Sponsored by the General Practice Section

New York State Bar Association publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2018
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 978-1-57969-532-3
Product Number: 4064919

CONTENTS

I.	Introduction	1
II.	Attorney Entry	1
III.	Arraignment/Bail.....	2
	A. Complaint or Information.....	2
	B. Accused’s Criminal Record.....	4
	C. Criminal Justice Agency Sheet.....	4
	D. Bail	5
	E. Plea Negotiations at Arraignment	6
	F. Notices.....	6
IV.	Preliminary Proceedings.....	8
	A. Misdemeanors.....	8
	B. Felonies.....	8
	1. Preliminary Hearing	8
	2. Grand Jury Proceedings.....	9
V.	Pleas and Plea Bargaining	12
	A. Generally	12
	B. Plea Bargaining Considerations	12
	1. Misdemeanors.....	13
	2. Felonies.....	14
	3. Plea Allocutions.....	15
	C. Alford Plea/Mental Disease or Defect/ACD	17
	D. Motion to Withdraw the Plea	18
VI.	Pretrial Motions and Discovery	18
	A. Misdemeanors.....	18
	B. Felonies.....	20
	C. Motion to Dismiss in Furtherance of Justice.....	20
	D. Discovery Demands and Motions	22
	1. Defense Demand to Produce	22
	2. Bill of Particulars.....	23
	3. Prosecution Discovery	23
	E. Discovery Required by Statute Following Pretrial Hearing and Opening Statements.....	24
	F. Discovery Required by Case Law	24
	1. Rosario Material	24
	2. Brady Material	25
	G. Motion for a Separate Trial or Joinder of Accuseds.....	26
	H. Consolidation of Indictments/Informations.....	27
	I. Speedy Trial.....	27
	1. Constitutional Right.....	27
	2. Statutory Right.....	28
	3. Filing the Motion	29
	4. Excludable Periods	29
	5. Conversion.....	30
	6. Pre-Indictment Delay.....	30
	7. Post-Indictment Delay	30

VII.	Motion to Suppress Statements	31
	A. Involuntary Statements.....	32
	B. Constitutional Violations.....	32
	C. Pre-Arrest Silence.....	32
	1. Fifth Amendment Rights	32
	a. Custody	33
	b. Interrogation.....	33
	2. Illegal Detention	35
	3. Right to Counsel	35
	a. Initiation of Proceedings.....	36
	b. Request for Counsel.....	36
	c. Representation by Counsel on an Unrelated Pending Charge	37
	d. Notification by Counsel	37
	D. Use of Suppressed Statements.....	38
	E. Exceptions	38
	1. Spontaneous Declaration Exception	38
	2. Emergency Exception.....	38
VIII.	Motion to Suppress Evidence of an Identification	39
	A. Notice	39
	B. The Hearing	40
	C. Identification Procedures.....	41
	1. Lineups	41
	2. Show-ups	41
	3. Photo Identifications	42
	4. Confirmatory Identification Procedures	43
	D. Bolstering	43
	E. Right to Counsel.....	44
IX.	Motion to Suppress Physical Evidence	44
	A. Motion	44
	B. Standing.....	45
	C. Search and Seizure	46
	D. Street Encounters.....	47
	1. Approach to Request Information	47
	2. Common Law Right to Inquire.....	47
	3. Stop.....	47
	4. The Frisk.....	48
	5. Arrest	48
	E. Exceptions to the Warrant Requirement.....	49
	1. Abandonment.....	49
	2. Automobile Exception	50
	3. Search Incident to Arrest	51
	4. Consent Searches	51
	5. Exigent Circumstances	52
	6. Plain View	53
	7. Securing Premises.....	53
	8. Administrative Searches	53

	F.	Search Warrants.....	53
		1. Property Subject to Seizure	54
		2. Premises to Be Searched.....	54
		3. Persons to Be Searched.....	54
		4. Statutory Requirements	55
	F.	Mapp Hearing.....	56
		1. “Fruit of the Poisonous Tree” Doctrine	57
		2. Independent Source and Inevitable Discovery	58
		3. Challenging a Search Warrant.....	58
X.		Pretrial Issues.....	58
	A.	Accused’s Presence	58
	B.	Competence of Accused.....	60
	C.	Sandoval Hearing	60
	D.	Uncharged Crimes	63
XI.		Trial	64
	A.	Order of Trial.....	64
	B.	Jury Selection	65
		1. Challenges for Cause	66
		2. Peremptory Challenges.....	67
		3. Batson	67
	C.	Nonjury Trial.....	68
	D.	Preliminary Instructions	68
	E.	Opening Statement	68
	F.	Presentation of Evidence	68
	G.	Motion to Dismiss	68
	H.	Summation.....	69
	I.	Requests to Charge.....	69
	J.	Jury Deliberations.....	70
	K.	Verdict	70
XII.		Sentencing	71
	A.	General Considerations	71
	B.	Interview Procedure.....	72
	C.	Presentence Report	72
		1. Face Sheet.....	72
		2. Criminal Record	72
		a. Prior Record.....	72
		b. Instant Offense.....	72
		3. Social Circumstances.....	73
		a. General Considerations.....	73
		b. Family	73
		c. Residence	73
		d. Education	73
		e. Employment.....	74
		f. Drugs/Alcohol.....	74
		g. Other Relevant Social Data.....	74
		h. Mental Health	74

	i. Evaluation	74
	4. Department Recommendation	74
	D. Preparation of Accused’s Presentence Memorandum	75
	E. Appendices	75
	F. Submission of Presentence Memorandum	75
	G. Presentence Conference.....	75
	H. Felony Sentencing	76
	1. Predicate and Persistent Felon	76
	2. Hate Crimes	77
	3. Other Felony Sentences	78
	a. Indeterminate Sentence.....	78
	b. Determinate Sentence and Post-Release Supervision.....	78
	c. Parole Supervision	79
	d. Other Possible Sentences	79
	4. Sentencing Chart Synopsis	79
	a. Nonpredicate Felons	80
	b. Predicate Felons.....	82
	c. Persistent Violent Felons	83
	d. Nonviolent Persistent Felony Offenders.....	84
	I. Sealing of Certain Convictions.....	84
	J. Certificate of Relief From Disabilities	84
	K. Juvenile Offenders and Youthful Offenders.....	84
XIII.	Raise the Age Legislation.....	85
XIV.	Special Problems in Narcotics Cases	85
	A. Buy and Bust	85
	B. Narcotics Found on Premises	86
	1. Constructive Possession	86
	2. Room Presumption	87
	C. Conspiracy Cases.....	88
	D. Defenses	89
	1. Agency Defense.....	89
	2. Criminal Facilitation.....	90
	3. Entrapment.....	91
	E. Other Issues in Narcotics Cases	92
	1. Closing the Courtroom	92
	2. Disclosure of the Confidential Informant’s Identity.....	93
	3. Disclosure of Search Warrant Affidavit	94
XV.	The Sex Offender Registration Act	95
	A. Statute	95
	1. Definition.....	95
	2. Incarcerated Offenders.....	96
	3. Nonincarcerated Offenders.....	96
	4. The Right to Counsel	97
	5. Registration and Dissemination.....	97

B. Case Law	98
1. Federal	98
2. State	98
Criminal Law Forms Index	101
Table of Authorities	151
About the Authors	171

LAWRENCE N. GRAY, ESQ.

Lawrence Gray served as a former Special Assistant Attorney General in the appellate section of the Attorney General's Medicaid Fraud Control Unit. He was previously a Special Assistant Attorney General in the Office of the Special State Prosecutor for the Investigation of the New York City Criminal Justice System; prior to that he was an Assistant Attorney General in the Bureau of Real Estate, Securities Fraud and Theatrical Syndications. He began his career as an Assistant District Attorney in Bronx County. Mr. Gray is a 1969 graduate of St. John's University School of Law, where he was an associate editor of the *St. John's Law Review*. His other publications include *Criminal and Civil Contempt*, Second Edition (NYSBA, 2012); *Evidentiary Privileges—Grand Jury, Criminal and Civil Trials*, Fifth Edition (NYSBA, 2012); *Contempt and the Courtroom* (NYSBA, 1996); *Criminal Discovery: A Statutory and Appellate Court Analysis* (NYSBA 2012); *A Practice Commentary to Judiciary Law Article 19*, 1 *Cardozo Public Law, Policy & Ethics Journal* 61 (2003); *Criminal and Civil Contempt: Some Sense of a Hodgepodge*, 72 *St. John's Law Review* 337 (1998); and *Judiciary and Penal Law Contempt in New York: A Critical Analysis*, *Brooklyn Law School Journal of Law and Policy*, Vol. III, No. 1 (1994). He was Editor-in-Chief of NYSBA's *New York Criminal Practice, Fourth Edition*, and its Supplements.

JAY SHAPIRO, ESQ.

Jay Shapiro is a partner in the Commercial Litigation Department in the New York office of White and Williams LLP, where he co-chairs the firm's Cyber Law and Data Protection Practice Group. He has almost 40 years' experience as a litigator. A prosecutor for two decades who focused on white collar crimes, he now represents clients in complex civil litigation and investigations, including corporate internal investigations and criminal and regulatory enforcement. He also represents insurance companies in their affirmative efforts to combat insurance fraud. He has represented broker-dealers and financial professionals in FINRA arbitrations and has represented financial services businesses in connection with government inquiries.

Mr. Shapiro began his legal career in the Bronx County District Attorney's Office as a prosecutor for eight years and later spent 12 years with the King's County District Attorney's Office, becoming the Deputy District Attorney in charge of the Rackets Division, before going into private practice. As a prosecutor, Mr. Shapiro was one of the first participants in the federal Electronic Crimes Task Force, which launched some of the earliest investigations into cybercrimes. He now advises clients on the investigation of data breaches, computer trespass and best policies concerning employee utilization of personal electronic devices for business purposes.

Mr. Shapiro has tried more than 35 cases in state and federal courts in New York and has also appeared before courts in California, Florida, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, and Washington. He has represented clients in relation to investigations conducted by federal and state authorities, including the Department of Justice, the Securities and Exchange Commission, the Internal Revenue Service, state prosecutors, and numerous city and state regulatory agencies.

Mr. Shapiro is a member of the Executive Committee of the Criminal Justice Section of the New York State Bar Association and the editor of the Section's newsletter. He has been recognized for his work with the New York City Police and Fire Departments.