

**MEDICAL  
MALPRACTICE  
IN  
NEW YORK**

**FOURTH EDITION**

**Editor-in-Chief  
Robert Devine, Esq.**

New York State Bar Association publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2017  
New York State Bar Association  
All rights reserved  
ISBN: 971-57969-500-2  
Product Number: 41302

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface .....	xxix
Foreword.....	xxxix
Chapter 1 Defending a Medical Malpractice Case .....	1
<i>Robert J. Walker, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 2 Anatomy of a Plaintiff's Malpractice Case: Intake to Note of Issue.....	19
<i>Steven E. North, Esq.</i> <i>Daniel Kramer, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 3 Preparing for Trial.....	115
<i>Steven E. North, Esq.</i> <i>Laurence M. Deutsch, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 4 Deposing the Plaintiff.....	155
<i>E. Marc Hyman, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 5 Deposing the Defendant-Physician .....	179
<i>Thomas J. Principe, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 6 Plaintiff's Jury Selection .....	199
<i>Daniel J. Woodard, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 7 Defendant's Jury Selection.....	211
<i>Jeffrey A. Marshall, Esq.</i> <i>Amy S. Weissman, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 8 The Challenges of Jury Selection for the Medical Malpractice Defense Attorney .....	217
<i>Joyce Lipton Rogak, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 9 Opening Statements: Plaintiff's Perspective .....	231
<i>D. Carl Lustig III, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 10 Opening Statements: Defense Perspective.....	251
<i>Bruce M. Brady, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 11 Developing and Employing Defense Strategies in Your Opening Statement.....	263
<i>Stuart J. Manzione, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 12 Proving Plaintiff's Case .....	269
<i>Stanley A. Landers, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 13 Medical Malpractice Statutory Law .....	283
<i>Elliott C. Winograd, Esq.</i> <i>Amy G. London, Esq.</i>	

Chapter 14	Practical Applications of the <i>Frye</i> Hearing in Medical Malpractice Actions .....	309
	<i>Robert G. Vizza, Esq.</i> <i>Robert F. Elliott, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 15	Issues in Hospital Liability .....	331
	<i>E. Marc Hyman, Esq.</i> <i>Daniel S. Ratner, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 16	Nursing Home Public Health Law Actions .....	353
	<i>David M. Freeman, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 17	Medical and Hospital Records Evidence.....	367
	<i>Martin A. Adams, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 18	Preparation of Healthcare Professionals for Trial Testimony .....	417
	<i>Clifford A. Bartlett, Jr., Esq.</i>	
Chapter 19	Cross-Examination of Plaintiff’s Medical Expert .....	423
	<i>Bruce G. Habian, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 20	Cross-Examination of Defendant’s Expert.....	429
	<i>David S. Pollack, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 21	Technology as a Tool of Persuasion in the Trial of a Medical Malpractice Case .....	469
	<i>W. Russell Corker, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 22	Plaintiff’s Summation: Bringing It All Together .....	499
	<i>Barry Washor, Esq.</i> <i>Matthew Maiorana, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 23	The Defense Summation .....	519
	<i>Shawn P. Kelly, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 24	Anticipating the Jury Instructions in the Disputed Medical Malpractice Trial .....	529
	<i>Steven E. Pegalis, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 25	Preserving Issues for Review .....	545
	<i>Barbara DeCrow Goldberg, Esq.</i> <i>Richard J. Montes, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 26	The Medical Indemnity Fund: Defense Counsel Perspective.....	567
	<i>Nicholas J. Marotta, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 27	The Physician-Patient Privilege in Medical Malpractice Litigation .....	583
	<i>Raymond W. Belair, Esq.</i>	

Chapter 28	Hospital Quality Assurance Under New York State Law .....	619
	<i>Jeffrey C. Gerson, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 29	Medication-Related Malpractice Claims.....	645
	<i>Robert P. Esgro, R.Ph., J.D.</i>	
Chapter 30	The Brain-Damaged Baby Case From a Defendant’s Perspective .....	657
	<i>Peter C. Kopff, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 31	The Wrongful Death Case From a Defendant’s Perspective—General Considerations.....	673
	<i>Peter C. Kopff, Esq.</i>	
Chapter 32	The Wrongful Death Case From a Plaintiff’s Perspective .....	679
	<i>Lauren Pennisi, Esq.</i>	
	Contributor Biographies .....	691
	Table of Authorities .....	705
	Index .....	733

## DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface .....	xxix
Foreword .....	xxxii

### **Chapter 1 Defending a Medical Malpractice Case**

*Robert J. Walker, Esq.*

[1.0]	I.	Introduction .....	3
[1.1]	II.	“Trying the Case in Reverse” .....	3
[1.2]		A. Identifying the Critical Issues .....	4
[1.3]		B. Preparation for Depositions.....	7
[1.4]		C. Jury Selection .....	9
[1.5]		D. Opening Statement .....	11
[1.6]		E. Cross-Examination During Plaintiff’s Case .....	12
[1.7]		F. Direct Examination in the Defense Case....	14
[1.8]		G. Summation .....	18

### **Chapter 2 Anatomy of a Plaintiff’s Malpractice Case: Intake to Note of Issue**

*Steven E. North, Esq.*

*Daniel Kramer, Esq.*

[2.0]	I.	Initial Contact .....	21
[2.1]	II.	Initial Interview .....	23
[2.2]	III.	The Retainer And Other Papers That Must Be Signed.....	25
[2.3]		A. Retainer Agreement.....	25
[2.4]		B. Other Forms .....	26
[2.5]	IV.	Caveats .....	28
[2.6]		A. Don’t Let Client Emotions Cloud the Issues .....	28
[2.7]		B. Make Sure Proximate Causation Exists .....	28
[2.8]		C. Considerations Relative to Attorney Substitution .....	28
[2.9]	V.	Potential Client Questions.....	30
[2.10]	VI.	Getting the Medical Records.....	33
[2.11]	VII.	Review of the Records and Expert Review.....	34
[2.12]	VIII.	Commencing Suit and the Pleadings.....	35
[2.13]		A. Identification of the Parties .....	35
[2.14]		B. Decision Not to Take the Case.....	36
[2.15]		C. Submission of Retainer Statement .....	36

[2.16]	D. Communications with Referring Attorneys .....	36
[2.17]	E. Preparation of Complaint .....	37
[2.18]	F. Addressing the Answer .....	38
[2.19]	G. Service of Bill of Particulars .....	39
[2.20]	H. Preparation for Preliminary Conference.....	40
[2.21]	I. Discovery .....	41
[2.22]	IX. Exchange of Medical Information.....	41
[2.23]	X. Plaintiff's Deposition .....	43
[2.24]	XI. Defense Deposition Considerations .....	45
[2.25]	XII. Expert Disclosure .....	46
[2.26]	XIII. Filing the Note of Issue .....	46
[2.27]	XIV. Diary, Diary, Diary.....	47
[2.28]	XV. Conclusion.....	47
Appendix A:	Rejection Letters for Medical or Nonmedical Malpractice Actions .....	51
Appendix B:	Medical Malpractice Intake Form .....	55
Appendix C:	Thank-You Letter to New Client .....	59
Appendix D:	Retainer Agreement.....	61
Appendix E:	Power of Attorney to Sign Authorization .....	65
Appendix F-1:	Motion for Leave to File a Late Notice of Claim .....	67
Appendix F-2:	Affirmation and Affidavit in Support of Motion to File Late Notice of Claim.....	69
Appendix G:	Substitution of Attorney Letter .....	77
Appendix H:	Substitution of Attorney Form .....	79
Appendix I-1:	Letter for Recalcitrant Medical Records .....	81
Appendix I-2:	Letter to Joint Commission on Accreditation of Health Care Organizations re: Recalcitrant Medical Records.....	83
Appendix J:	Certificate of Merit.....	85
Appendix K:	Client Does Not Want to Sue a Defendant Letter .....	87
Appendix L:	Plaintiff's Counsel Does Not Want to Sue a Particular Defendant Letter .....	89
Appendix M:	Rejection Letters .....	93
Appendix N:	<i>Nunc Pro Tunc</i> Statement for Retainer Statement.....	97
Appendix O:	OCA Retainer Statement.....	99
Appendix P:	Letter to Co-Counsel .....	101
Appendix Q:	Affirmative Defense Letter .....	103
Appendix R:	Combined Demands .....	105

### Chapter 3 Preparing for Trial

*Steven E. North, Esq.*

*Laurence M. Deutsch, Esq.*

[3.0]	I.	Overview .....	117
[3.1]	A.	Preparing for Trial: Easier Said Than Done .....	117
[3.2]	B.	Preparing Your Case, Your Client and Yourself.....	117
[3.3]	II.	Preparing Yourself for Trial.....	118
[3.4]	A.	Physically .....	118
[3.5]	B.	Preparing Psychologically.....	119
[3.6]	1.	The Psychological “Stages” of Preparation .....	119
[3.7]	2.	Amulets, Talismans and Haircuts .....	122
[3.8]	III.	Preparing The Case .....	123
[3.9]	A.	Time Line for Subpoenas and Notice of Intent to Offer Records .....	123
[3.10]	1.	Medical Record Subpoenas (60 Days Before Trial).....	124
[3.11]	a.	Overview of the Subpoena Process.....	124
[3.12]	b.	Subpoena Checklist: Put It on Your Form .....	124
[3.13]	2.	Ensuring Admissibility of Subpoenaed Imaging Studies and Diagnostic Tests .....	126
[3.14]	a.	Subpoena Not Needed if Study Is “Self-Authenticated” and “Previously Received or Examined” by the Other Side .....	127
[3.15]	b.	Subpoena Required (With “Certification” and “Notice”) for Any Other Study.....	128
[3.16]	c.	“So Ordered Subpoenas” Required for Government Agencies and Public Corporations .....	128
[3.17]	d.	“Authenticated” Does Not Mean “Admissible” .....	129
[3.18]	B.	Stipulating Records into Evidence and Page Numbering Records.....	129



[3.19]	C.	Notice of Intent to Offer Records: 30 Days Before Trial .....	130
[3.20]	D.	Non-Party Witness Subpoenas (Ad Testificandum) .....	131
[3.21]	1.	Who Do You Need? Who Do You Want? .....	131
[3.22]	2.	Getting the Nonparty Witness To Court: A Subpoena Is Only the Start.....	132
[3.23]	E.	The Master Chronology .....	135
[3.24]	F.	Tweaking Expert Disclosures and Rejecting Insufficient Disclosures; Motion in Limine May Be Needed .....	136
[3.25]	G.	Preparing Demonstrative Evidence .....	139
[3.26]	H.	Pretrial Memorandum: When Required and Even When Not Required .....	141
[3.27]	I.	Preparing Your Experts and Getting Them to Court.....	142
[3.28]	IV.	Preparing Your Client: Coming Full Circle .....	145

#### **Chapter 4 Deposing the Plaintiff**

*E. Marc Hyman, Esq.*

[4.0]	I.	Introduction .....	157
[4.1]	II.	What Can Be Accomplished .....	157
[4.2]	A.	Find Out What Happened.....	157
[4.3]	B.	Assess Plaintiff.....	158
[4.4]	C.	Develop Evidence for Trial .....	158
[4.5]	D.	Find Out What You Don't Know .....	159
[4.6]	E.	Make Sure the Story Is Final.....	161
[4.7]	III.	Preparing for the Deposition .....	162
[4.8]	A.	Pleadings and Discovery Responses .....	162
[4.9]	B.	Your Client .....	162
[4.10]	C.	Know the Medicine .....	163
[4.11]	D.	Know the Records .....	163
[4.12]	IV.	Specific Suggestions .....	166
[4.13]	A.	Use an Outline but "Follow the Testimony" .....	166
[4.14]	B.	Rapport, Rhythm and Framework .....	167
[4.15]	C.	Logical Behavior as Credibility Test .....	167
[4.16]	D.	"I Don't Recall" .....	168
[4.17]	E.	Challenging Testimony vs. Setting up Impeachment at Trial .....	169

[4.18]	F.	Plaintiffs Who May Not Be Able to Offer Testimony at Trial .....	171
[4.19]	G.	Other Witnesses.....	171
[4.20]	H.	Lack of Informed Consent Claims .....	172
[4.21]	I.	Documents Signed by Witness.....	173
[4.22]	J.	Wrongful Death Damages.....	173
[4.23]	K.	Pain and Suffering.....	174
[4.24]	L.	Special Damages .....	175
[4.25]	M.	Attorney Conduct at Depositions .....	175
[4.26]	N.	Handling Disputes During Depositions .....	177

## **Chapter 5 Deposing the Defendant-Physician**

*Thomas J. Principe, Esq.*

[5.0]	I.	Introduction .....	181
[5.1]	II.	Deposition Preparation.....	182
[5.2]	III.	Deposition Demeanor.....	184
[5.3]	IV.	Deposition Tactics.....	184
[5.4]	A.	Scope of Deposition .....	185
[5.5]	B.	Lines of Questioning and Tactics.....	187
[5.6]	1.	Employment Status .....	187
[5.7]	2.	Profit Motive .....	188
[5.8]	3.	Opinion Questions.....	189
[5.9]	4.	Establish Importance of Medical Records.....	189
[5.10]	5.	Clarify Physician-Patient Relationship	189
[5.11]	6.	Have Defendant-Physician Read and Interpret Notes Into Record.....	190
[5.12]	7.	Noncompliant Patient Notes .....	190
[5.13]	8.	Conversations with Patient or Family Members.....	191
[5.14]	9.	Consent Form.....	191
[5.15]	10.	Then-and-Now Comparisons .....	192
[5.16]	11.	Departure from Standard of Care .....	192
[5.17]	V.	Conduct During a Deposition.....	193
[5.18]	A.	Disclosure Guidelines .....	193
[5.19]	B.	Dealing with Obstruction .....	195
[5.20]	VI.	Conclusion.....	197

**Chapter 6 Plaintiff’s Jury Selection**

*Daniel J. Woodard, Esq.*

[6.0]	I.	Overview .....	201
[6.1]	II.	Challenges to Seating an Impartial Jury .....	201
[6.2]	III.	Voir Dire Strategies and Tactics .....	203
[6.3]	A.	Expose Juror Attitudes .....	204
[6.4]	B.	Educating the Jury .....	205
[6.5]	1.	On the Medicine .....	205
[6.6]	2.	On the Standard of Care .....	206
[6.7]	C.	Open Jurors’ Minds to Merits of Case Through Your Theme.....	207
[6.8]	IV.	Practice Tips .....	209
[6.9]	A.	The Interplay of Local Rules and the CPLR When Designating Alternates.....	209
[6.10]	V.	Conclusion.....	210

**Chapter 7 Defendant’s Jury Selection**

*Jeffrey A. Marshall, Esq.*

*Amy S. Weissman, Esq.*

[7.0]	Introduction .....	213
[7.1]	Peremptory Challenges.....	214

**Chapter 8 The Challenges of Jury Selection for the Medical  
Malpractice Defense Attorney**

*Joyce Lipton Rogak, Esq.*

[8.0]	I.	Introduction .....	219
[8.1]	II.	Peremptory Challenges .....	219
[8.2]	III.	To Select or Not to Select?.....	223
[8.3]	IV.	Challenges For Cause.....	225
[8.4]	V.	Other Instances to Consider Challenging a Juror for Cause .....	227
[8.5]	VI.	When to See the Judge Over a Challenge for Cause .....	227
[8.6]	VII.	Challenges to Those Physically Challenged .....	228
[8.7]	VIII.	Ethical Challenges.....	228
[8.8]	IX.	More Words of Advice.....	228

**Chapter 9 Opening Statements: Plaintiff’s Perspective**

*D. Carl Lustig III, Esq.*

[9.0]	I.	Introduction: General Considerations .....	233
[9.1]	II.	Legal Considerations.....	233
[9.2]	III.	Initial Preparation .....	235

[9.3]	IV.	Objective of Opening Statement .....	235
[9.4]	V.	Primacy Versus Recency.....	236
[9.5]	VI.	Advocacy in the Opening.....	236
[9.6]	A.	Constructing the Opening Statement: The Theme.....	237
[9.7]	B.	Developing the Opening Statement.....	238
[9.8]	C.	Use of Analogies .....	240
[9.9]	D.	Understatement Versus Overstatement .....	241
[9.10]	E.	Dealing with Weaknesses.....	242
[9.11]	F.	Tracking the Charge to the Jury .....	244
[9.12]	G.	Use of Exhibits in an Opening Statement .....	245
[9.13]	H.	The Presentation.....	246
[9.14]	I.	Humor in the Opening.....	248
[9.15]	J.	Presentation of Damages.....	248
[9.16]	VII.	Conclusion.....	250

#### **Chapter 10 Opening Statements: Defendant’s Perspective**

*Bruce M. Brady, Esq.*

[10.0]	I.	Introduction .....	253
[10.1]	II.	Goals of the Opening Statement .....	254
[10.2]	III.	The Do’s and Don’ts of Opening .....	255
[10.3]	A.	Defense Strategy in Opening.....	258
[10.4]	B.	Discussion of Medical Issues .....	259
[10.5]	C.	Use of Demonstrative Evidence.....	259
[10.6]	D.	Limitations of Law .....	260
[10.7]	1.	Model Rules of Professional Conduct .....	260
[10.8]	2.	New York State Rules of Professional Conduct (22 N.Y.C.R.R. §1200.0).....	260
[10.9]	E.	Conclusion.....	262

#### **Chapter 11 Developing and Employing Defense Strategies in Your Opening Statement**

*Stuart J. Manzione, Esq.*

[11.0]	I.	Introduction .....	265
[11.1]	II.	Develop a Theme .....	265
[11.2]	III.	Know Your Case .....	266
[11.3]	IV.	Structure and Body of Opening.....	266
[11.4]	V.	Conclusion .....	267

## Chapter 12 Proving Plaintiff's Case

*Stanley A. Landers, Esq.*

[12.0]	I.	Defendant-Physician as Plaintiff's Witness .....	271
[12.1]		A. Why Call the Defendant First? .....	271
[12.2]		B. Inform the Court of Your Plan .....	271
[12.3]		C. Even a Defense Expert May Be Useful.....	271
[12.4]	II.	Strategies and Tactics for Questioning the Witness .....	273
[12.5]		A. Leading Questions: The Lawyer as Witness .....	273
[12.6]		B. Using Scholarly Texts and Articles.....	274
[12.7]		C. Keeping Control .....	276
[12.8]		D. Sample Questioning .....	276
[12.9]	III.	Is <i>Carvalho</i> Dead? .....	278
[12.10]	IV.	<i>Res Ipsa Loquitur</i> .....	279
[12.11]		A. When Applicable.....	279
[12.12]		B. What Must and What Need Not Be Proved.....	279
[12.13]	V.	Conclusion.....	281

## Chapter 13 Medical Malpractice Statutory Law

*Elliott C. Winograd, Esq.*

*Amy G. London*

[13.0]	I.	Introduction .....	285
[13.1]	II.	The Statutes and Their Purposes .....	285
[13.2]		A. Judiciary Law § 474-a .....	285
[13.3]		B. Public Health Law § 2805-d.....	287
[13.4]		C. CPLR.....	288
[13.5]		1. Statute of Limitations .....	288
[13.6]		a. CPLR 208 .....	288
[13.7]		b. CPLR 214 .....	290
[13.8]		c. CPLR 214-a .....	290
[13.9]		2. Jurisdiction, Service and Venue .....	291
[13.10]		a. CPLR 305 .....	291
[13.11]		b. CPLR 316 .....	291
[13.12]		3. Remedies and Pleadings.....	292
[13.13]		a. CPLR 3012-a .....	292
[13.14]		b. CPLR 3017 .....	294
[13.15]		4. After Issue Joined.....	295
[13.16]		a. CPLR 3406 .....	295
[13.17]		b. CPLR 3045 .....	297
[13.18]		5. Discovery—CPLR 3101 .....	298

[13.19]	6. Calendar Practice: Trial Preferences— CPLR 3403.....	299
[13.20]	7. Trial by Jury .....	300
[13.21]	a. CPLR 4545 .....	300
[13.22]	b. CPLR 4546 .....	301
[13.23]	c. CPLR 4401-a.....	302
[13.24]	d. CPLR 4213 .....	303
[13.25]	e. CPLR 4111 .....	304
[13.26]	8. Post-Judgment—CPLR art. 50-A .....	305
[13.27]	9. Other Significant Statutes .....	306
[13.28]	a. Insurance Law § 2343 .....	306
[13.29]	b. Public Health Law § 2805-j.....	307
[13.30]	c. N.Y. Education Law § 6509.....	307
[13.31]	III. Conclusion.....	307

**Chapter 14 Practical Applications of the *Frye* Hearing in  
Medical Malpractice Actions**

*Robert G. Vizza, Esq.*

*Robert F. Elliott, Esq.*

[14.0]	I. Trial Judge as Gatekeeper: <i>Frye v. United States</i> and Its Progeny .....	311
[14.1]	II. Related Challenges to Expert Opinion Testimony ....	313
[14.2]	III. When and How to Bring on a <i>Frye</i> Hearing.....	317
[14.3]	IV. Has the <i>Frye</i> Standard Been Relaxed in Medical Malpractice Actions?.....	321
[14.4]	V. What’s Next: Will the Courts Catch Up With Science in Recognizing “Evidence-Based Medicine”? .....	326

**Chapter 15 Issues in Hospital Liability**

*E. Marc Hyman, Esq.*

*Daniel S. Ratner, Esq.*

[15.0]	I. Introduction .....	333
[15.1]	II. Theories of Hospital Liability .....	333
[15.2]	A. Vicarious Liability .....	333
[15.3]	1. For Negligence of Private Attending Physician .....	333
[15.4]	a. Apparent Agency.....	334
[15.5]	b. For Acts Directed by Private Attending Physicians .....	339
[15.6]	B. Direct Liability .....	340
[15.7]	1. For Negligence of Hospital Staff .....	340
[15.8]	2. Patient Security .....	341

[15.9]	3. Patient Falls .....	342
[15.10]	4. Other Claims Not Involving an Analysis of the Specific Medical Treatment Provided to the Plaintiff.....	345
[15.11]	5. Negligent Hiring or Credentialing .....	347
[15.12]	C. Discovery Issues.....	350
[15.13]	1. Demands for Rules, Regulations and Protocols.....	350
[15.14]	2. Quality Assurance Materials .....	351
[15.15]	3. Interviews of Non-Defendant Care Providers .....	351

## **Chapter 16 Nursing Home Public Health Law Actions**

*David M. Freeman, Esq.*

[16.0]	I. Introduction .....	355
[16.1]	II. Fall Prevention .....	356
[16.2]	III. Pressure Ulcers .....	357
[16.3]	IV. Dehydration.....	358
[16.4]	V. Resident Mobility and Treatment.....	359
[16.5]	VI. Infections.....	359
[16.6]	VII. Nutrition .....	360
[16.7]	VIII. Choking .....	360
[16.8]	IX. Respiratory Therapy .....	360
[16.9]	X. Sexual Assault .....	361
[16.10]	XI. Doctor Liability Under the Public Health Law .....	361
[16.11]	XII. Accuracy of Records .....	362
[16.12]	XIII. Discovery .....	362
[16.13]	XIV. Burden of Proof .....	364
[16.14]	XV. Damages .....	364
[16.15]	XVI. Conclusion.....	365

## **Chapter 17 Medical and Hospital Records Evidence**

*Martin A. Adams, Esq.*

[17.0]	I. Admissibility Under the Business Records Rule .....	369
[17.1]	A. Hospital Records .....	371
[17.2]	B. Medical Office Records.....	373
[17.3]	C. Inadmissible Records .....	378
[17.4]	D. Electronic Records .....	379
[17.5]	E. Medical Records in Criminal Proceedings .....	380

[17.6]	II.	Laying a Foundation .....	383
[17.7]	A.	Who Can Authenticate Medical Records? .....	383
[17.8]	B.	Certification.....	384
[17.9]	1.	Hospital Records .....	384
[17.10]	2.	Physician’s Office Records .....	385
[17.11]	3.	Records Produced Pursuant to Subpoena Duces Tecum.....	386
[17.12]	a.	Contents of Certification .....	386
[17.13]	b.	Notice of and Objection to Authentication by Certification .....	387
[17.14]	c.	Certification of Out-of-State Office Records .....	388
[17.15]	III.	Admissibility of Specific Entries in Hospital and Medical Records and Related Testimony .....	388
[17.16]	A.	Alcohol and Drug Abuse Entries .....	388
[17.17]	B.	Entries Regarding Manner or Cause of Accident .....	391
[17.18]	C.	Health Care Provider Testimony About Patient’s Medical History .....	397
[17.19]	D.	Prior Inconsistent Statements .....	398
[17.20]	E.	Prior Consistent Statements .....	400
[17.21]	F.	Party Admissions .....	400
[17.22]	G.	Statements Relevant to Material Element of Claim .....	405
[17.23]	H.	Opinions Expressed in Medical Records ...	405
[17.24]	I.	Reports, Letters and Other Documents in Medical Record .....	407
[17.25]	1.	Medical Reports .....	407
[17.26]	2.	Letters.....	410
[17.27]	J.	Records and Reports Prepared for Litigation .....	411
[17.28]	K.	Radiogram Evidence .....	411
[17.29]	1.	X-rays and the Best Evidence Rule.....	413
[17.30]	2.	Authentication of X-rays.....	413
[17.31]	L.	Incident and Accident Reports .....	415

**Chapter 18 Preparation of Healthcare Professionals for Trial  
Testimony**

*Clifford A. Bartlett, Jr., Esq.*

[18.0]	I.	Introduction .....	419
[18.1]	II.	Preparation of a Witness as to Their Prior Writings.....	419



[18.2]	III.	Use of a Witness's Former Testimony .....	420
[18.3]	IV.	Dangers of Collateral Examination .....	421

### **Chapter 19 Cross-Examination of Plaintiff's Medical Expert**

*Bruce G. Habian, Esq.*

[19.0]	I.	Introduction .....	425
[19.1]	II.	Preparation .....	425
[19.2]	A.	The Attorney's Knowledge .....	425
[19.3]	B.	Who is the Expert? .....	426
[19.4]	III.	Cross-Examination Methods .....	426
[19.5]	A.	Preliminary Comments.....	426
[19.6]	B.	Recognized Methods .....	427
[19.7]	IV.	Conclusion.....	428

### **Chapter 20 Cross-Examination of Defendant's Expert**

*David S. Pollack, Esq.*

[20.0]	I.	Introduction .....	431
[20.1]	II.	Cross-Examination of a Medical Expert .....	432
[20.2]	III.	Preparation .....	465

### **Chapter 21 Technology as a Tool of Persuasion in the Trial of a Medical Malpractice Case**

*W. Russell Corker, Esq.*

[21.0]	I.	Introduction .....	471
[21.1]	II.	Equipment .....	472
[21.2]	III.	Courtroom Setup .....	473
[21.3]	IV.	Organize Your Evidence .....	474
[21.4]	A.	Circus Ponies Notebook .....	475
[21.5]	B.	Basic PowerPoint for Trial Lawyers .....	476
[21.6]	C.	Bullet-Point Presentations .....	478
[21.7]	D.	Inserting Photos and Graphics.....	479
[21.8]	E.	Linking Documents, Photos and Internet Websites .....	479
[21.9]	F.	Smart Art .....	480
[21.10]	G.	Emphasis Tools: Get In Focus .....	480
[21.11]	H.	Exhibit Numbers .....	481
[21.12]	I.	Titles.....	481
[21.13]	J.	Litigation Software.....	482
[21.14]	K.	iPad Litigation Software.....	483
[21.15]	L.	Wireless.....	485
[21.16]	M.	Deposition Transcript Software .....	485
[21.17]	N.	Videotaped Deposition.....	486

[21.18]	O.	Anatomy Software for iPad.....	487
[21.19]	P.	Medical Illustrations.....	487
[21.20]	Q.	Video .....	488
[21.21]	R.	Imaging Studies.....	488
[21.22]	S.	Trial Graphics.....	489
[21.23]	T.	Timelines.....	490
[21.24]	U.	Chronological Lists .....	492
[21.25]	V.	Flowcharts .....	492
[21.26]	W.	Checklists .....	493
[21.27]	V.	Opening Statements .....	493
[21.28]	VI.	Examination of Witnesses.....	495
[21.29]	VII.	Summation .....	497
[21.30]	VIII.	Conclusion.....	498

**Chapter 22 Plaintiff’s Summation: Bringing it All Together**

*Barry Washor, Esq.*

*Matthew Maiorana, Esq.*

[22.0]	I.	Bringing it All Together.....	501
[22.1]	A.	Style.....	502
[22.2]	B.	Preparation .....	502
[22.3]	C.	Be Confident .....	504
[22.4]	D.	Use of Notes or Outlines .....	505
[22.5]	E.	Pay Close Attention to the Opposing Counsel Summations.....	505
[22.6]	F.	Adversary or Colleague.....	506
[22.7]	G.	Objections .....	506
[22.8]	H.	Know Your Jurors .....	507
[22.9]	I.	Use of Evidence .....	508
[22.10]	J.	Use of Inconsistent Testimony.....	508
[22.11]	K.	Be Creative .....	509
[22.12]	L.	Reference the Law of the Case.....	509
[22.13]	II.	The Summation .....	510
[22.14]	A.	Introduction .....	510
[22.15]	B.	Our Case.....	511
[22.16]	C.	The Defense.....	512
[22.17]	D.	Reinforcement of Our Case.....	514
[22.18]	E.	The Verdict Sheet.....	514
[22.19]	F.	Transition to Damages .....	515
[22.20]	G.	Damages .....	515
[22.21]	H.	Final Remarks .....	517

**Chapter 23 The Defense Summation**

*Shawn P. Kelly, Esq.*

[23.0]	I.	Introduction .....	521
[23.1]	II.	Unit of Time .....	523
[23.2]	III.	Insurance and Financial Status .....	523
[23.3]	IV.	Fair Comment or Over the Line? .....	524
[23.4]	V.	Two Similar/Dissimilar Scenarios .....	526
[23.5]	VI.	Can Counsel Inquire of the Malpractice History of Experts in Malpractice Cases? .....	527
[23.6]	VII.	Conclusion .....	527

**Chapter 24 Anticipating the Jury Instructions in the Disputed  
Medical Malpractice Trial**

*Steven E. Pegalis, Esq.*

[24.0]	I.	Introduction .....	531
[24.1]	II.	Establishing the Basic Facts .....	531
[24.2]	III.	Burden of Proof .....	533
[24.3]	IV.	Quality Medical Care .....	534
[24.4]	V.	Judgment .....	535
[24.5]	VI.	Hindsight .....	537
[24.6]	VII.	Cause and Effect.....	538
[24.7]	VIII.	Fair Comment.....	540
[24.8]	IX.	Conclusion.....	542

**Chapter 25 Preserving Issues for Review**

*Barbara DeCrow Goldberg, Esq.*

*Richard J. Montes, Esq.*

[25.0]	I.	Introduction .....	547
[25.1]	II.	Importance of Preservation .....	547
[25.2]	III.	Offer of Proof .....	548
[25.3]	IV.	Objecting to Preserve the Issues.....	551
[25.4]	A.	Improper Questions and Trial Court Rulings .....	551
[25.5]	B.	Loss of Parental Guidance.....	551
[25.6]	C.	Errors in the Charge .....	552
[25.7]	D.	Inconsistency in Jury Verdict .....	553
[25.8]	E.	Conduct of Court and Opposing Counsel.....	556
[25.9]	V.	Strategy Issues.....	559
[25.10]	VI.	Post-Verdict Issues .....	562
[25.11]	A.	Collateral Source Hearing .....	562

[25.12]	B.	Effect of Tax Obligations on Amount of Award .....	564
[25.13]	C.	Preservation of Issues Concerning Weight and Sufficiency of Evidence .....	565
[25.14]	D.	Preservation of Issues Concerning Adequacy of Award.....	566
[25.15]	VII.	Conclusion.....	566

**Chapter 26 The Medical Indemnity Fund: Defense Counsel Perspective**

*Nicholas J. Marotta, Esq.*

[26.0]	I.	The Medical Indemnity Fund.....	569
[26.1]	A.	Who Is a “Qualified Plaintiff”? .....	572
[26.2]	B.	What Constitutes a Birth-Related “Neurological Injury”? .....	573
[26.3]	C.	The Allocation Issue.....	576
[26.4]	D.	The Calculation of the Defendants’ Cost Cash Settlement Obligation Factoring in Attorney Fees .....	577
[26.5]	E.	Settlement Document Considerations .....	580

**Chapter 27 The Physician-Patient Privilege in Medical Malpractice Litigation**

*Raymond W. Belair, Esq.*

[27.0]	I.	Introduction .....	585
[27.1]	II.	Scope of Waiver of Physician-Patient Privilege	587
[27.2]	A.	Reports of Nontestifying Physicians .....	587
[27.3]	B.	Records Pertaining to Unrelated Condition.....	589
[27.4]	C.	Exchange of Medical Records.....	591
[27.5]	D.	Waiver by Persons Serving in Representative Capacity.....	591
[27.6]	1.	Birth-Injury Cases .....	591
[27.7]	2.	Wrongful-Death Actions.....	593
[27.8]	III.	Private Interviews With Treating Physicians During Discovery .....	594
[27.9]	A.	The <i>Anker</i> Doctrine .....	594
[27.10]	B.	Ex Parte Interviews after HIPAA.....	596
[27.11]	1.	HIPAA’s Purpose and Perceived Problems.....	597
[27.12]	2.	Case Law .....	598

[27.13]	a.	Testimony Precluded on Basis of Ex Parte Interviews.....	598
[27.14]	b.	Decisions Not to Issue Orders for Ex Parte Interviews.....	598
[27.15]	c.	Orders Issued for Ex Parte Interviews .....	599
[27.16]	d.	Resolution: <i>Arons v. Jutkowitz</i> .....	600
[27.17]	C.	Related Issues .....	604
[27.18]	1.	Professional Duty to Keep Confidential Medical Information.....	604
[27.19]	2.	HIV Exception .....	605
[27.20]	IV.	Treating Physician as Expert Witness .....	605
[27.21]	V.	Standing of Records Custodian to Resist Disclosure of Patient's Records .....	610
[27.22]	VI.	Defendant's Physical Condition.....	612
[27.23]	VII.	Actions for Alleged Wrongful Disclosure .....	614
[27.24]	VIII.	Miscellaneous Problems.....	616
[27.25]	IX.	Conclusion.....	617

**Chapter 28 Hospital Quality Assurance Under New York State Law**

*Jeffrey C. Gerson, Esq.*

[28.0]	I.	Governing Statutes .....	621
[28.1]	II.	Quality Assurance and Peer Review Records Exempt From Disclosure.....	621
[28.2]	A.	Correspondence and Letters .....	622
[28.3]	B.	Materials Related to Periodic Review of Physicians' Credentials and Competence.....	623
[28.4]	C.	Protected Parties .....	623
[28.5]	1.	Nonparty Physician or Employee.....	623
[28.6]	2.	Defendant .....	625
[28.7]	3.	Chiropractors.....	625
[28.8]	D.	Protective Orders .....	626
[28.9]	III.	Discoverable Records.....	626
[28.10]	A.	Defendant-Doctor's Medical Records.....	627
[28.11]	B.	Perinatal Database Information .....	627
[28.12]	C.	Documents Not Alleged to Have Been Used for Quality Review Purposes.....	628
[28.13]	D.	Conversations Outside the Scope of Quality Review.....	628

[28.14]	E.	Documents Related to Medical Equipment and Facilities Maintenance.....	628
[28.15]	F.	Documents Obtainable but Not Obtained During Review Proceeding .....	629
[28.16]	G.	Defendant’s Statements During Peer Review and Quality Assurance Proceedings.....	629
[28.17]	H.	Patient Test Results .....	630
[28.18]	I.	Relevant Documents Not Prepared for Peer Review or Quality Assurance Purposes .....	631
[28.19]	J.	Inapplicability of Statute .....	632
[28.20]	IV.	Incident Reports .....	633
[28.21]	A.	Discoverability .....	633
[28.22]	B.	Discoverability of Department of Health Documents.....	635
[28.23]	C.	Limited Protection for Reports Concerning Outpatients .....	637
[28.24]	D.	Disclosure of Documents Made in Regular Course of Business .....	637
[28.25]	V.	In Camera Review.....	638
[28.26]	VI.	Protection of Documents Used by Nursing Homes .....	639
[28.27]	A.	Incident and Other Reports .....	639
[28.28]	B.	Quality Assurance Documents.....	640
[28.29]	VII.	Applicability of N.Y. Education Law in Federal Courts .....	641
[28.30]	VIII.	Summary .....	643

## **Chapter 29 Medication-Related Malpractice Claims**

*Robert P. Esgro, R.Ph., J.D.*

[29.0]	I.	Overview .....	647
[29.1]	II.	Types of Medication Errors .....	649
[29.2]	A.	Wrong Dose.....	649
[29.3]	B.	Wrong Drug.....	649
[29.4]	C.	Wrong Directions .....	650
[29.5]	D.	Drug Interactions.....	650
[29.6]	E.	Excessive Duration.....	650
[29.7]	F.	Poor Penmanship.....	651
[29.8]	G.	High-Risk Drugs .....	651
[29.9]	H.	Drug Utilization Review .....	651
[29.10]	I.	Patient Interaction .....	652
[29.11]	III.	Ways to Reduce Medication Errors .....	652
[29.12]	A.	Electronic Prescription .....	652

[29.13]	B.	Hospital Medication Reconciliation.....	654
[29.14]	IV.	Potential Defenses to Medication Malpractice Claims.....	654
[29.15]	A.	Contributory and Comparative Negligence	654
[29.16]	B.	Informed Consent .....	655
[29.17]	C.	Assumption of the Risk.....	656
[29.18]	V.	Conclusion.....	656

### **Chapter 30 The Brain-Damaged Baby Case From a Defendant’s Perspective**

*Peter C. Kopff, Esq.*

30.0]	I.	General Considerations in Preparing for Trial ..	659
[30.1]	A.	Jury Selection .....	659
[30.2]	B.	Defendant’s Expert Witness Disclosure.....	659
[30.3]	C.	Theme.....	660
[30.4]	D.	Visual Aids .....	660
[30.5]	1.	Reasons for Using Them.....	660
[30.6]	2.	Enlargements.....	661
[30.7]	E.	Presence During Trial.....	661
[30.8]	F.	Practice/Rehearse .....	661
[30.9]	II.	Specific Preparation for the Trial in a Brain-Damaged Baby Case .....	662
[30.10]	A.	Chronology.....	662
[30.11]	B.	Review of Pertinent Medical Texts.....	662
[30.12]	C.	American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists Standards .....	663
[30.13]	D.	Literature and Publications.....	663
[30.14]	III.	Identifying and Discrediting Plaintiff’s Expert .....	664
[30.15]	A.	Publications .....	664
[30.16]	B.	Website.....	665
[30.17]	C.	Prior Testimony .....	665
[30.18]	IV.	Attacking the Parent of the Brain-Damaged Infant .....	665
[30.19]	A.	Mother as Fact Witness .....	665
[30.20]	B.	Mother with Expertise .....	666
[30.21]	C.	Mother Not Trustworthy .....	666
[30.22]	D.	Disputed Cause of Placenta Previa.....	667
[30.23]	E.	Jury Selection .....	667
[30.24]	V.	Attacking Plaintiff’s Theory of Causation at Trial .....	667
[30.25]	VI.	The Defense.....	668

[30.26]	A. Obstetrician Expert Witness.....	668
[30.27]	B. Neonatologist .....	668
[30.28]	C. Pediatric Neurologist.....	669
[30.29]	D. Pediatric Neuroradiologist.....	669
[30.30]	E. Placental Pathology .....	669
[30.31]	F. Economist.....	670
[30.32]	VII. Conclusion.....	670

**Chapter 31 The Wrongful Death Case From a Defendant’s Perspective—General Considerations**

*Peter C. Kopff, Esq.*

[31.0]	I. General Considerations in a Wrongful Death Lawsuit.....	675
[31.1]	A. Preparing to Properly Defend a Wrongful Death Case Presents Challenges and Opportunities for Defense Counsel.....	675
[31.2]	B. Damages in a Wrongful Death Action Should Be Defined in the Pleadings: The Complaint and Verified Bill of Particulars .....	676
[31.3]	C. Damages in a Wrongful Death Action .....	677
[31.4]	D. Self-Consumption .....	677

**Chapter 32 The Wrongful Death Case From a Plaintiff’s Perspective**

*Lauren Pennisi, Esq.*

[32.0]	I. Introduction .....	681
[32.1]	II. Who May Bring the Action .....	681
[32.2]	III. Damages Recoverable in Wrongful Death Actions .....	682
[32.3]	A. The Survival Action .....	682
[32.4]	B. Medical and Funeral Expenses.....	683
[32.5]	C. Loss of Income.....	684
[32.6]	D. Loss of Inheritance .....	685
[32.7]	E. Loss of Parental Guidance.....	685
[32.8]	F. Other Considerations.....	687
[32.9]	1. Actions for Wrongful Death on Behalf of Infants .....	687
[32.10]	2. Stillborn Babies.....	688
[32.11]	3. Videotaped Examinations Before Trial .....	688
[32.12]	IV. Conclusion.....	689



Contributor Biographies .....	691
Table of Authorities .....	705
Index .....	733

## PREFACE

In 1993, the New York State Bar Association published *Medical Malpractice in New York*. The book was designed to provide attorneys trying these cases with practical tips and fundamental principles in one volume.

This edition is not an update. It is intended to present a more advanced insight into various aspects of the trial of a medical malpractice case, with many observations that apply to the trial of any case. We are fortunate to have recognized leaders in our field contribute their knowledge and wisdom to give us the benefit of their experiences. It is certainly a better substitute for our own trial-and-error approach, which usually has a heavy emphasis on the error aspect. “Seasoning” as a trial lawyer is hard to come by. These authors give such guidance to all of us.

A special thanks must go to Daniel McMahon and his staff at the New York State Bar Association. Their cite checking, fact checking and organizing have contributed greatly to the high-quality publication that our readers deserve.

Robert Devine  
Editor-in-Chief

## ABOUT THE EDITOR

### ROBERT DEVINE, ESQ.

Robert Devine is a partner of the firm Bartlett, McDonough & Morahan, LLP in Mineola, New York. He received his law degree from Georgetown in 1964. His primary area of practice is the defense of medical malpractice and negligence cases. Mr. Devine is a member of the Executive Committee of the Trial Lawyers Section of the New York State Bar Association and a former chair of that section. He also served as that section's chair of continuing legal education for nine years. Additionally, Mr. Devine is a member of the American Board of Trial Advocates and the Medical Malpractice Defense Lawyers' Association.

## ABOUT THE AUTHORS

### MARTIN B. ADAMS, ESQ.

A graduate of Case Western Reserve University School of Law, Martin Adams is a partner in the New York City law firm of Dopf, P.C. His primary area of practice is professional liability defense with extensive experience in research, analysis, and the application of scientific-legal issues and preparation of motions and briefs at the trial and appellate level.

### CLIFFORD A. BARTLETT, JR., ESQ.

Clifford A. Bartlett, Jr. is a partner in the firm of Bartlett, McDonough & Monaghan, LLP, with offices in Mineola, White Plains and Manhattan. Mr. Bartlett received his law degree from St. John's University School of Law, and since his admission to the bar in New York State, he has focused his practice on the defense of physicians and hospitals relative to medical malpractice claims. Mr. Bartlett has taken more than 500 cases to verdict and has lectured widely on topics involving the trial of medical cases.

### RAYMOND W. BELAIR, ESQ.

Raymond W. Belair is a senior partner in the New York City law firm of Belair & Evans LLP, where his primary areas of practice include trials, professional liability and personal injury. Mr. Belair graduated from Fordham University School of Law and engaged in post-graduate work at New York University Law School. He holds a master's degree from the Institute of Religious Studies and is a doctoral candidate at the Graduate Theological Foundation. A member of the American Association for Justice, he is certified by both the National Board of Trial Advocacy, for whom he has

served as an examiner, and the American Board of Professional Liability Attorneys.

**BRUCE M. BRADY, ESQ.**

Bruce M. Brady is a partner in the firm of Koster, Brady & Nagler LLP. He received his law degree from Boston University School of Law after graduating from Columbia College. Mr. Brady began his legal career as a prosecutor in the Kings County District Attorney's Office. For more than 25 years his primary specialty has been the defense of medical malpractice claims. Mr. Brady is a charter member of the New York State Medical Defense Bar Association, a member of the American Bar Association, the Association of Trial Lawyers of America, the New York State Trial Lawyers Association, the New York County Lawyers Association and the Bergen County Bar Association.

Mr. Brady has taught and lectured extensively on the topic of trial techniques and the defense of medical malpractice cases for the New York State Trial Lawyers Institute and Law Journal Seminars. He is admitted to practice before the courts of the states of New York, New Jersey and Massachusetts, as well as the U.S. District Courts for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York and the Supreme Court of the United States.

**W. RUSSELL CORKER, ESQ.**

W. Russell Corker, of the Law Office of W. Russell Corker, P.C. in Huntington, New York, is a medical malpractice attorney. He received his law degree from Boston University in 1974. His primary area of practice is representing plaintiffs in medical malpractice and negligence cases. Mr. Corker has been teaching trial techniques for more than 28 years. He is a recognized authority in the use of technology as a tool of persuasion in the courtroom.

**LAURENCE M. DEUTSCH, ESQ.**

Laurence M. Deutsch is a partner at North & Deutsch LLP, which specializes in medical malpractice and negligence cases. With more than 25 years in the field, he has achieved some of the leading verdicts in counties throughout New York State. He has been recognized for attaining one of the Top 20 Verdicts in New York by Topverdict.com and included in the Verdicts and Settlements Hall of Fame by the *New York Law Journal*. Mr. Deutsch also received the highest rating from the Avvo rating service and was awarded the Distinguished Attorney rating in national peer attorney reviews.

## CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES

---

### **ROBERT P. ESGRO, R.PH., J.D.**

Robert P. Esgro is a practicing pharmacist and attorney. Mr. Esgro began his career in the pharmaceutical industry at Merck & Co. Assignments included industrial manufacturing pharmacist, pharmaceutical sales and pharmaceutical product promotion manager. Presently, Mr. Esgro is pharmacy manager at a national retail pharmacy chain. In addition, he consults in retail pharmacy malpractice cases throughout the country. His legal practice concentrates on professional licensure defense claims. He also is an adjunct professor of pharmacy law and ethics at the University of the Sciences in Philadelphia. He is a regular speaker on pharmacy law topics for pharmacist continuing education seminars.

### **ROBERT F. ELLIOTT, ESQ.**

Robert F. Elliott is a partner at Bartlett, McDonough & Monaghan, LLP. Over the last 20 plus years Mr. Elliott has had more than 50 defense verdicts in complex litigation trials ranging from medical malpractice to municipal and premises liability and construction accidents in a wide variety of jurisdictions. Most of these were multi-million dollar matters ranging from eye injuries, orthopedic injuries including amputations, to neurologically impaired children and adults. He regularly represents licensees before Professional Discipline Boards. He has handled numerous billing and compliance matters for Hospitals, Long Term Care Facilities and Residential Care Providers. He has a specific specialty in Mental Health Law and Litigation.

Mr. Elliott regularly teaches attorneys through continuing legal education and also teaches health care providers at continuing medical education seminars. His presentations range from healthcare ethics to medical liability.

Mr. Elliott is a graduate of Downstate Medical Center where he received a Bachelor of Science in Nursing. He worked as a registered professional nurse, hospital risk manager and safety officer from 1981 through 1989 when he graduated from Brooklyn Law School with his J.D. degree.

### **DAVID M. FREEMAN, ESQ.**

David Freeman is a senior litigation attorney at the law firm of Philip J. Rizzuto, P.C., where he is the director of the Nursing Home Litigation Unit. He graduated from Brooklyn Law School in 1992 and worked as a trial litigation law clerk while attending law school. He had previously

earned a master's degree in community and organizational psychology and worked at the New Jersey Department of Human Services Bureau of Research and Evaluation. There, he led a research project addressing the social support received by patients deinstitutionalized from New Jersey mental health facilities following the reported abuses to residents of the Willowbrook State School. While his legal career has focused primarily on being an advocate for plaintiffs, he has tried cases on behalf of both plaintiffs and defendants.

**JEFFREY C. GERSON, ESQ.**

Jeffrey C. Gerson is a partner in the Garden City, New York office of Kaufman Borgeest & Ryan LLP. He received his law degree from Franklin Pierce Law Center in 1991. His primary area of practice is the defense of physicians, hospitals, nursing homes, podiatrists, dentists and other health-care providers. Mr. Gerson has lectured extensively in New York and other states on various topics in malpractice litigation and risk management. He is licensed to practice in New York and Connecticut.

**BARBARA DECROW GOLDBERG, ESQ.**

Barbara DeCrow Goldberg is a partner at Martin, Clearwater & Bell, and the head of its appellate department. With more than 20 years of experience in appellate litigation, Ms. Goldberg has handled a wide variety of appeals and is noted for several important decisions in the areas of medical malpractice, negligence, workers' compensation and products liability law. Ms. Goldberg is a *magna cum laude* graduate of Radcliffe College and obtained her law degree from Boston University School of Law, where she graduated *cum laude*. She is the author of several articles on products liability, medical malpractice, and evidentiary issues, and has frequently lectured at continuing education programs. In addition, Ms. Goldberg is a member of the OCA's Advisory Committee on Civil Practice.

**BRUCE G. HABIAN, ESQ.**

Bruce G. Habian is a senior partner in the New York City law firm of Martin Clearwater & Bell. His primary areas of practice include medical malpractice defense, hospital liability and attorney malpractice defense. Mr. Habian has specialized in these areas for more than 30 years. Mr. Habian has served as a faculty member for the Practising Law Institute and the Law Journal Seminars-Press (he regularly presents programs on breast cancer and neurologically impaired infant cases). Mr. Habian has been published by Matthew Bender Corporation and The Williams-Wilkins Publishing Corporation. He has served as a faculty member of the National

## **CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES**

---

Institute of Trial Advocacy, is continually listed in Best Lawyers in America in his specialty and is a fellow of the American College of Trial Lawyers.

### **E. MARC HYMAN, ESQ.**

E. Marc Hyman is a partner in the law firm Heidell, Pittoni, Murphy & Bach, LLP. He obtained his J.D. degree from the Boston University School of Law in 1984. He has practiced medical malpractice law in New York for 20 years. He has lectured on related topics for CLE programs by the New York State Bar Association, the Practising Law Institute and the New York County Bar Association, as well as in other forums. He is a member of the New York State Medical Defense Bar Association.

### **SHAWN P. KELLY, ESQ.**

Shawn P. Kelly is the senior partner of Kelly, Rode & Kelly, LLP. He handles a broad range of civil litigation matters with a particular interest in the defense of medical and hospital malpractice matters as well as general liability matters. He was admitted to the NYS Bar in January of 1978 and has earned a rating of AV by his peers in Martindale-Hubbell.

He received his undergraduate degree from the University of Notre Dame in South Bend, Indiana and graduated in 1974. He then earned his JD degree from St. John's Law School in Queens in 1977 and was admitted to the Bar in January of 1978. In 1978 he successfully completed the NITA program, an intensive trial advocacy program, at Cornell University in Ithaca, New York and later was asked to become an instructor of the program. He is an adjunct faculty member of Hofstra University School of Law and has also lectured at St. John's School of Law.

He is admitted to practice before all state courts in New York, the Eastern and Southern Districts of the Federal District court in New York, the United States Supreme Court and the United States Court of Appeals for the Armed Forces. He is also a member of the New York State Bar Association where he is a member of the Torts, Insurance and Compensation Law (TICL) Section as well as the Trial Lawyers Section. He has lectured widely on matters of trial practice to the New York State Bar Association, the Practising Law Institute (PLI), the Nassau Academy of Law, and the Law Department for the City of New York.

### **PETER C. KOPFF, ESQ.**

Peter Kopff, of Peter C. Kopff, LLC in Garden City, New York, defends physicians and hospitals in medical malpractice lawsuits. He received his A.B. from Princeton University in 1970 and his J.D. from Albany Law

School in 1975. Mr. Kopff is a past president and founding board member of the New York State Medical Defense Bar Association. He is also a member of the Executive Committee of the New York State Bar Association's Trial Lawyers Section and has served as the program chair or co-chair of that section's 2004–2008 summer meetings.

**DANIEL KRAMER, ESQ.**

Daniel Kramer has co-authored books on medical malpractice and evidence in negligence cases for the Practising Law Institute. He co-wrote a column titled "Medical Malpractice" for the *New York Law Journal* from 1977 until 1989. He is an adjunct professor of law at St. John's Law School, where he teaches legal medicine. He has lectured numerous times for the New York State Trial Lawyers Association and the New York State Bar Association on medical malpractice. He chaired the medical malpractice subcommittee of the New York State Trial Lawyers Association. Presently, Mr. Kramer is retired and spending his winters in Scottsdale, Arizona.

**STANLEY A. LANDERS, ESQ.**

Stanley A. Landers is senior partner in the law firm of Landers & Cernigliaro, P.C. in Carle Place, Nassau County. The firm concentrates on plaintiffs' medical malpractice. A graduate of St. John's University School of Law, Mr. Landers is a member of the American Association for Justice, the New York State Trial Lawyers Association, the New York State Bar Association, the Nassau County Bar Association and the Queens County Bar Association.

**AMY G. LONDON, ESQ.**

Amy G. London is a senior counsel in the Tort Division of the New York City Law Department. She graduated from Brown University in 1980 and received her law degree from the University of Pennsylvania in 1983. Her primary areas of practice are municipal liability and medical malpractice. She is author of an article titled "Mediation Offers Promise but No Cure for System's Ills," published in the *New York Law Journal*. She has also served as a continuing legal education instructor on the subject of defending EMS cases.

**D. CARL LUSTIG, III, ESQ.**

D. Carl Lustig, III is a partner at the Manhattan law firm of Arye, Lustig & Sassower, P.C., and handles the trials and appeals of major personal injury cases on behalf of plaintiffs. His primary area of concentra-



## **CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES**

---

tion is construction accident litigation under the New York State Labor Law.

Mr. Lustig has written law review articles that have appeared in the New York State Trial Lawyers Institute publication, *The Trial Lawyers Quarterly*, and other legal periodicals. He has lectured extensively for various entities including the New York State Trial Lawyers Institute, The Practicing Law Institute, the New York State Bar Association and Yale University and has served as co-chairperson of a number of lecture series for continuing legal education in the area of personal injury trial practice. He has also lectured for the National Institute of Trial Advocacy program at Hofstra University School of Law on Trial Techniques, and at St. John's University School of Law on Alternate Dispute Resolution/Mediation in personal injury cases. Mr. Lustig also has been an invited speaker at the New York State Judicial Conference and has lectured at the New York City Bar Association in their continuing legal education seminar on trials of civil cases.

### **MATTHEW MAIORANA, ESQ.**

Matthew Maiorana is a partner at Queller, Fisher, Washor, Fuchs & Kool, L.L.P. He began his legal career defending cases brought by injured persons against the City of New York. His litigation skills and talents were recognized immediately and he was entrusted with defending the City of New York in the most serious and complex matters in the Special Litigation Unit. His efforts earned him a Municipal Affairs Award from the Association of the Bar of the City of New York, as well as numerous awards directly from the City of New York.

After spending years in practice defending the City of New York, Mr. Maiorana decided to represent private individuals injured through the negligence of others. Today, his practice focuses on the litigation and trial of medical malpractice, serious injury and wrongful death claims. From 2013 until the present, he has been included in Super Lawyers every year. He practices in both state and federal courts throughout New York. He is also a member of various bar associations in New York, including the New York State Bar Association and the New York State Trial Lawyers Association.

### **STUART MANZIONE, ESQ.**

Stuart Manzione is a partner at Furey, Furey, Leverage, Manzione, Williams & Darlington, P.C. He focuses his practice on the defense and trial of medical malpractice and professional negligence cases involving phy-

---

**MEDICAL MALPRACTICE IN N.Y., 4TH ED.**

---

sicians, dentists, hospitals and nursing homes. He also handles matters involving the trial of premises liability, products liability, automobile liability and general negligence matters involving serious and/or catastrophic injury and death.

Mr. Manzione is admitted to practice in the State of New York and is also admitted in the United States District Court, Eastern and Southern Districts of New York. He is also admitted to the Federal Court of Appeals and is admitted to argue before the Supreme Court of the United States. He is also a member of the Nassau County Bar Association and the Trial Lawyers Association of Nassau and Suffolk Counties. He has lectured to physicians and hospital staff regarding risk reduction strategies in several areas of patient care. He has also lectured on various topics of interest to the insurance defense community at seminars sponsored by Furey & Furey and teaches paralegal studies at C.W. Post College.

Mr. Manzione earned his Juris Doctor degree in 1987 from St. John's University School of Law. He graduated *summa cum laude* and salutatorian from Long Island University, C.W. Post in 1984.

**NICHOLAS J. MAROTTA, ESQ.**

Nicholas J. Marotta was graduated from St. John's University School of Law in 1985. Following graduation, he was an assistant corporation counsel of the city of New York, ultimately becoming a senior trial attorney in the medical malpractice unit. Since 1990, Mr. Marotta has continued to concentrate his practice in the defense of medical malpractice claims, successfully representing physicians at trial in significant and complex matters. Mr. Marotta was selected by his peers for inclusion in *The Best Lawyers in America 2008*. He frequently has lectured on medical malpractice issues at various New York-area hospitals. He has been a partner at the firm of Aaronson Rappaport Feinstein & Deutsch, LLP since 1994 and is admitted to practice in New York, Connecticut and the U.S. District Courts for the Eastern and Southern Districts of New York.

**JEFFREY A. MARSHALL, ESQ.**

Jeffrey A. Marshall is a partner at Marshall Conway & Bradley P.C. His areas of practice include arbitration, mediation, construction accidents (involving violations of N.Y. State Labor Law), dram shop, insurance law, liquor liability law, motor vehicle, premises liability, products liability law, and property & casualty. He received a B.A. at the State University of New York at Stony Brook and a J.D. at the New England School of Law.

## CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES

---

### **HENRY G. MILLER, ESQ.**

Henry G. Miller, a graduate of St. John's College (1952) and St. John's Law School (1959), is past president of both the Westchester County Bar Association and the New York State Bar Association. He is a past regent of the American College of Trial Lawyers, a past director of the International Academy of Trial Lawyers, a fellow of both the American and New York Bar Foundations and a past director of the New York State Trial Lawyers Association. Mr. Miller is presently the senior member of the White Plains, New York law firm of Clark, Gagliardi & Miller, P.C. His trial work has usually been for plaintiffs in civil cases. He has frequently appeared on television and radio. He is the author of the *Settlements in the Art of Advocacy* series, as well as editor of *New York Practice Guide on Negligence*, both published by Matthew Bender, and most recently, *On Trial: Lessons from a Lifetime in the Courtroom*, published by ALM Publishing.

### **RICHARD J. MONTES, ESQ.**

Richard J. Montes is a partner in the law firm of Mauro Lilling Naparty LLP in Woodbury, New York, which focuses its practice on appellate advocacy and litigation. He is a former law clerk for the justices of the Massachusetts Superior Court, a judge of the Massachusetts Appeals Court and Justice Anthony Marano, Nassau County. He graduated *cum laude* from Georgetown University and *cum laude* from Boston University School of Law. He is also the current chairperson of the Suffolk County Bar Association's Appellate Committee and is president of the Long Island Hispanic Bar Association.

### **STEVEN E. NORTH, ESQ.**

Steven E. North is a partner at North & Deutsch LLP. Mr. North has been listed as having achieved some of the highest verdicts in the state of New York. He has been included in *Best Lawyers in America* for more than the past ten years and has been named in the *New York Times*, Super Lawyers Section—Top New York Lawyers, *New York Magazine's* New York Area's Best Lawyers and Law Dragon's Leading Plaintiff Lawyers in America. Mr. North is a legal commentator on television, a lecturer at law schools, a contributing author to the *New York Law Journal* and author of more than 20 legal publications, including a text on deposition tactics and strategy. He has also been a guest lecturer at medical schools and teaching hospitals in the New York metropolitan area. He serves as a referee for the New York State Commission on Judicial Conduct.

**STEVEN E. PEGALIS, ESQ.**

Steven E. Pegalis is the founding partner of Pegalis & Erickson in Lake Success, New York. He has spent his legal career representing plaintiffs in personal injury and medical malpractice cases. He earned his B.A. from Queens College of the City of New York and his J.D. from New York Law School. Mr. Pegalis has been in his own firm since 1972. He authored *American Law of Medical Malpractice*, Volumes I, II, and III, to help other trial attorneys understand the medical aspects of particular malpractice cases. He has lectured for the New York State Bar Association, the New York State Trial Lawyers Association, the New York Law Journal-Seminars Press Series and the Practising Law Institute on medical malpractice litigation and trial practice. Mr. Pegalis is a member of the board of trustees of New York Law School and the National CLE Program Advisory Committee of the American Bar Association on "The Experts Analyze Brain-Damaged Baby Cases." He also is an adjunct professor of medical malpractice at New York Law School.

**LAUREN PENNISI, ESQ.**

Lauren Pennisi is an associate at Sullivan Papain Block McGrath & Cannavo P.C. in New York City, where she focuses on medical malpractice. She received a B.A. from Binghamton University and a J.D. from St. John's University School of Law.

**DAVID S. POLLACK, ESQ.**

David Pollack maintains a law office in Port Washington, New York. He received his law degree from New York Law School in 1980. His practice is focused on the representation of plaintiffs in medical malpractice and personal injury cases and as trial counsel to the profession. Mr. Pollack has been an attorney adviser to the local high school mock trial team for 15 years and served as a director of the New York State Trial Lawyers Association for 9 years. He has been recognized with an A-V rating by Martindale-Hubbell, a listing in the *Bar Register of Preeminent Lawyers* and *The Best Lawyers in America*. He is also a member of the Million Dollar Advocates Forum.

**THOMAS J. PRINCIPE, ESQ.**

Thomas J. Principe is a partner in the New York City law firm of Kramer, Dillof, Livingston & Moore, where his practice focuses on civil litigation, including medical malpractice, products liability and general negligence. He is a 1973 graduate of St. John's University School of Law. A brigadier

## **CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES**

---

general in New York's Army National Guard, Mr. Principe was staff judge advocate for the 53rd Troop Command. He retired in July 2006 with the Legion of Merit medal given by the U.S. Army. He is a member of the New York State, Florida, District of Columbia, Queens County and the New York County Bar Associations and the New York State Trial Lawyers Association. Mr. Principe has also authored "The Law of Vehicular Homicide in New York" (Queens County Bar Bulletin, July 1986) and "No Need for Plaintiff's Bar to Panic: Contingent Fee Rulings May be Dicta" (N.Y.L.J., Feb. 14, 1995). Mr. Principe makes frequent CLE presentations regarding medical malpractice for St. John's University and the New York State Trial Lawyers Institute.

### **DANIEL RATNER, ESQ.**

Daniel Ratner is a senior partner at Levy Ratner, P.C. He began his career in labor with 12 years as an organizer for 1199SEIU and the UAW. His legal career has spanned over 25 years, during which time he has represented a variety of unions in the profit and not-for-profit sectors, including the SEIU, Teamsters and the UAW. He currently serves as General Counsel to 1199SEIU, representing over 300,000 healthcare workers.

Mr. Ratner has litigated labor disputes extensively before the NLRB and the federal courts. He was a member of the AFL-CIO national litigation team that established the health care bargaining unit rules through NLRB rule making and subsequent litigation up to the United States Supreme Court. He has participated in national oral arguments before the NLRB on the issues of RN supervisory status, independent contractor status, and joint employee status of agency workers. He is responsible for the legal victory that initially established the right of graduate teaching assistants to organize under the NLRA in New York University.

### **JOYCE LIPTON ROGAK, ESQ.**

Joyce Lipton Rogak is a trial attorney at Rogak & Gibbons, LLP as well as the firm's managing attorney. Prior to forming Rogak & Gibbons, LLP in 2000, she was a partner and the head of the medical malpractice department of Rivkin, Radler & Kremer. Ms. Rogak has successfully defended numerous cases in the New York State Supreme Courts. Along with her trial experience, Ms. Rogak has handled every other aspect involving medical, podiatric and dental malpractice, including preparing and arguing Appeals, as well as product liability, personal injury and liability defense. She also defends physicians before the OPMC. She is the author of several articles that have appeared in specialty medical newsletters and legal journals.

---

**MEDICAL MALPRACTICE IN N.Y., 4TH ED.**

---

Ms. Rogak was admitted to the New York State Bar and United States District Court for the Eastern and Southern Districts of New York in 1981. She is a member of the Nassau County Bar Association and the New York State Bar Association. Ms. Rogak received her Juris Doctorate degree from Hofstra University Law School in 1980 and her Bachelor of Arts degree, *magna cum laude*, from Brooklyn College, in 1976.

**ROBERT G. VIZZA ESQ.**

Robert G. Vizza is a partner at Bartlett, McDonough & Monahan LLP. He heads the firm's Appellate Practice area, dealing with legal issues arising from medical malpractice litigation as well as premises and workplace liability and civil rights cases.

In addition to depositions, trials and appeals, Mr. Vizza assists clients with financial audits, litigation cost schedules and verdict exposure estimates, privileged quality assurance investigations and Dept. of Health inquiries including matters before the Office of Professional Medical Conduct, prospective risk management and quality of care issues, and regulatory compliance issues such as HITECH.

While at Dartmouth College, Mr. Vizza was the President of the Nathan Smith Society for Pre-Health Professionals (pre-med/dental/veterinary students). He served as the Editor in Chief of *Res Gestae*, the St. John's University School of Law yearbook.

**ROBERT J. WALKER, ESQ.**

Robert J. Walker, a partner at Gallagher, Walker, Bianco & Plastaras in Mineola, New York, focuses on medical malpractice and insurance defense cases. He has many years of experience as a trial attorney responsible for the defense of medical and dental malpractice, products liability, and general liability cases from inception through trial. He received a B.A. in psychology from St. John's University and a J.D. from St. John's University School of Law.

**BARRY WASHOR, ESQ.**

Barry Washor is a senior partner at Queller, Fisher, Washor, Fuchs & Kool, L.L.P. He began his career on the defense side, working for an insurance defense law firm representing doctors and hospitals. By age 27 he was a partner at that law firm. In 1988 he left the defense side to become a plaintiff's attorney. His experience as a defense attorney gave

## **CONTRIBUTOR BIOGRAPHIES**

---

him a unique and valuable insight into how insurers defend and evaluate medical malpractice lawsuits.

Mr. Washor has been widely recognized as an expert in his field and is consistently sought after to share his knowledge and experience with other lawyers and law students. He teaches trial advocacy at Cardozo Law School and is a frequent lecturer in trial advocacy for the New York State Trial Lawyers Association (NYSTLA). Since 2002, he has served on NYSTLA's Board of Governors, and is a member of its medical malpractice committee.

### **AMY S. WEISSMAN, ESQ.**

Amy S. Weissman is a partner at Marshall, Conway & Bradley P.C. Her areas of practice include arbitration, mediation, construction accidents (involving violations of N.Y. State Labor Law), dram shop, liquor liability law, motor vehicle, premises liability, products liability law, and property & casualty. She received a B.A. at Lafayette College and a J.D. at New York Law School.

### **ELLIOTT C. WINOGRAD, ESQ.**

Elliott C. Winograd died in 2016. Over his 50-year legal career, Mr. Winograd tried more than 500 jury cases to verdict, served as the Chief Negotiator for the Civil Division of the Law Department for the City of New York, and regularly donated his time as a pro bono Special Master, mediator and arbitrator with the Supreme Court, Nassau County.

### **DANIEL WOODARD, ESQ.**

Daniel Woodard is a partner with Phillips & Paolicelli, LLP, which focuses on litigating medical malpractice, infant lead paint poisoning, toxic exposure and other complex personal injury cases in New York and New Jersey as well as other states around the country.

Mr. Woodard has a diverse background and experience in successfully litigating numerous types of complex legal actions, including representing individuals injured by chemical explosions, dangerous premises, children exposed in utero to harmful chemicals causing birth defects and those injured by defective products.

A trial lawyer at heart, Mr. Woodard has attained numerous multi-million dollar verdicts and settlements on behalf of his clients, many of whom are young children, catastrophically injured as a result of receiving

**MEDICAL MALPRACTICE IN N.Y., 4TH ED.**

---

negligent medical care or being exposed to toxic substances and chemicals. He has also successfully represented lead poisoned children, construction workers injured on the job by dangerous conditions and dangerous products and young children born with birth defects.

Mr. Woodard is licensed to practice law in New York State and New Jersey. In addition, he is licensed to appear before the Federal Courts in both New York and New Jersey. He is also a member of the New York State Bar Association, the New Jersey Bar Association, the American Bar Association, the American Association for Justice, and the New York State Trial Lawyers Association.