

**PUBLIC SECTOR  
LABOR AND  
EMPLOYMENT LAW**

---

**THIRD EDITION, REVISED 2013**

**VOLUME ONE**

**EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**

**Jerome Lefkowitz, Esq.**

**CO-EDITORS**

**John M. Crotty, Esq.**

**Jean Doerr, Esq.**

**Richard K. Zuckerman, Esq.**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**  
**VOLUME I**

Chapter 1	History of Legal Protection and Benefits of Public Employees in New York State.....	1
Chapter 2	The Regulatory Network.....	121
Chapter 3	Employee Rights Under the Taylor Law .....	289
Chapter 4	Union Rights Under the Taylor Law.....	381
Chapter 5	Employer Rights Under the Taylor Law.....	443
Chapter 6	The Representation Process .....	487
Chapter 7	Duty to Negotiate .....	633

**VOLUME II**

Chapter 8	Improper Practices .....	885
Chapter 9	Strikes.....	989
Chapter 10	New York City Collective Bargaining Law.....	1029
Chapter 11	Mini-PERBS .....	1081
Chapter 12	Arbitration and Contract Enforcement.....	1103
Chapter 13	Employee Discipline .....	1229
Chapter 14	Administration of the Civil Service Law .....	1293
Chapter 15	Retirement Systems in New York State.....	1319

## DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction to the First Edition .....	vii
Author Biographies .....	xxxix

### **Chapter 1 History of Legal Protection and Benefits of Public Employees in New York State**

[1.0]	I.	Introduction .....	3
[1.1]	II.	Development of Civil Service Law .....	3
[1.2]	A.	Federal Sector .....	3
[1.3]	B.	New York State .....	5
[1.4]	III.	Common Law and Constitutional Bases for Public Sector Collective Bargaining .....	8
[1.5]	A.	Common Law and Collective Bargaining in the Public Sector .....	8
[1.6]	1.	Private Sector Sources .....	8
[1.7]	2.	Early Public Sector Developments .....	9
[1.8]	3.	Common Law Prohibitions .....	10
[1.9]	a.	Doctrine of Illegal Delegation of Power .....	10
[1.10]	b.	Doctrine of Sovereign Immunity .....	11
[1.11]	c.	Doctrine of Illegality Because of Strike Potential .....	12
[1.12]	B.	Constitutional Law and Collective Bargaining in the Public Sector .....	12
[1.13]	C.	Prohibitions on the Right to Strike .....	14
[1.14]	D.	Other Constitutional Issues .....	15
[1.15]	IV.	PRE-Taylor Law Labor Relations: The Condon-Wadlin Act .....	16
[1.16]	A.	Enactment .....	16
[1.17]	B.	Provisions .....	18
[1.18]	C.	Application .....	18
[1.19]	D.	Attempts to Amend Condon-Wadlin .....	19
[1.20]	E.	The “Temporary” 1963 Substitute Amendment ...	19
[1.21]	F.	Restoration of Condon-Wadlin as Originally Enacted .....	20
[1.22]	1.	Attempts to Enforce It .....	20
[1.23]	2.	Attempts to Repeal It .....	21

[1.24]	V.	Pre-Taylor Law Labor Relations in New York City.....	24
[1.25]	A.	The Opening Stage: Transit Employees .....	24
[1.26]	B.	The Interim Stage: Municipal Employees .....	26
[1.27]	C.	The Final Stage: “The Little Wagner Act” .....	28
[1.28]	1.	Employee Representation and Collective Bargaining Under Executive Order No. 49....	28
[1.29]	2.	Transition From Executive Order No. 49 to the New York City Collective Bargaining Law .....	32
[1.30]	VI.	Enactment of the Taylor Law.....	33
[1.31]	VII.	Statutory Protection and Benefits of Public Employees.....	35
[1.32]	A.	Civil Service Employees.....	36
[1.33]	1.	Veterans Preference .....	37
[1.34]	2.	Seniority .....	38
[1.35]	3.	Protection Against Unjust Dismissal .....	38
[1.36]	4.	Grievances.....	40
[1.37]	5.	Fringe Benefits.....	40
[1.38]	B.	The Uniformed Services .....	41
[1.39]	1.	Overview.....	41
[1.40]	2.	Paid Leave Time .....	42
[1.41]	a.	Hours .....	42
[1.42]	b.	Holidays .....	43
[1.43]	c.	Vacation .....	43
[1.44]	3.	Political Activity .....	44
[1.45]	4.	Disability Protection .....	45
[1.46]	5.	Soft Body Armor.....	45
[1.47]	6.	Personal Privacy.....	46
[1.48]	7.	Transfers and Promotion.....	46
[1.49]	8.	Miscellaneous Benefits .....	46
[1.50]	C.	Teachers .....	47
[1.51]	1.	Salaries .....	47
[1.52]	2.	Working Time .....	47
[1.53]	a.	Hours .....	47
[1.54]	b.	Leaves.....	47
[1.55]	3.	Job Security.....	48
[1.56]	4.	Certification .....	49

[1.57]	5. Liability Indemnification .....	49
[1.58]	VIII. New York State Public Integrity ACT .....	50
	APPENDIX: Taylor Committee Report .....	59

**Chapter 2 The Regulatory Network**

[2.0]	I. Introduction .....	123
[2.1]	II. Public Employment Relations Board .....	123
[2.2]	A. Functions .....	123
[2.3]	B. Structure .....	124
[2.4]	1. Composition of Board .....	124
[2.5]	2. PERB Staff .....	125
[2.6]	a. Office of Counsel .....	125
[2.7]	b. Hearing Unit .....	125
[2.8]	c. Conciliation Unit .....	127
[2.9]	C. Jurisdiction .....	128
[2.10]	1. Public Employers .....	128
[2.11]	2. Public Employees .....	135
[2.12]	3. Employee Organizations .....	140
[2.13]	D. New York State Employment Relations Board ....	142
[2.14]	III. Local Public Employment Relations Boards .....	142
[2.15]	A. New York City Office of Collective Bargaining .....	143
[2.16]	1. Functions .....	143
[2.17]	2. Structure .....	144
[2.18]	a. Board of Collective Bargaining .....	144
[2.19]	b. Board of Certification .....	145
[2.20]	c. Director of OCB .....	145
[2.21]	3. Jurisdiction .....	145
[2.22]	B. Other Local Boards (Mini-PERBs) .....	146
[2.23]	1. Functions and Jurisdiction .....	146
[2.24]	2. Structure .....	146
[2.25]	IV. Bi-State Agencies .....	147
[2.26]	A. Port Authority Employment Relations Panel .....	147
[2.27]	1. Structure .....	148
[2.28]	2. Function .....	148
[2.29]	3. Substantive Provisions .....	149
[2.30]	a. Rights of Employees .....	149
[2.31]	b. Rights of Employee Organizations .....	149
[2.32]	c. Rights of the Port Authority .....	151

[2.33]	d. Improper Practices.....	151
[2.34]	e. Unique Features of PA Instruction.....	152
[2.35]	f. Judicial Review .....	152
[2.36]	B. Waterfront Commission Employment Relations Panel.....	152
[2.37]	1. Structure .....	153
[2.38]	2. Function .....	153
[2.39]	3. Substantive Provisions .....	153
[2.40]	4. Judicial Review .....	154
[2.41]	V. State and Local Civil Service Commissions .....	154
[2.42]	A. Jurisdiction .....	154
[2.43]	B. Structure.....	156
[2.44]	C. Function .....	157
[2.45]	1. Examination Appeals .....	158
[2.46]	2. Classification Appeals .....	158
[2.47]	3. Discipline Appeals .....	159
[2.48]	4. Disqualification Appeals.....	159
[2.49]	5. Appeal Procedures .....	160
[2.50]	VI. Commissioner of Education.....	161
[2.51]	A. Jurisdiction.....	162
[2.52]	1. Parties.....	162
[2.53]	2. Subject Matter .....	162
[2.54]	a. Appellate Jurisdiction.....	163
[2.55]	b. Tenure Areas .....	164
[2.56]	(1) Seniority Issues.....	165
[2.57]	(2) Attainment of Tenure.....	166
[2.58]	(3) Discipline.....	167
[2.59]	c. Collective Bargaining Agreements .....	167
[2.60]	3. Excluded Matters .....	168
[2.61]	B. Procedure Before the Commissioner of Education .....	170
[2.62]	C. Judicial Review of Commissioner's Decisions.....	175
[2.63]	VII. Retirement Systems.....	176
[2.64]	A. Jurisdiction and Structure .....	176
[2.65]	1. Statewide Systems .....	176
[2.66]	a. New York State Employees' Retirement System .....	176

[2.67]	b. New York State Police and Fire Retirement System .....	176
[2.68]	c. New York State Teachers' Retirement System .....	177
[2.69]	2. New York City Systems.....	177
[2.70]	B. Functions.....	177
[2.71]	VIII. Department of Labor .....	178
[2.72]	A. Structure .....	178
[2.73]	B. Jurisdiction .....	179
[2.74]	C. Functions.....	179
[2.75]	1. Safety, Health and Toxic Substances .....	179
[2.76]	2. Hours of Work .....	183
[2.77]	3. Prevailing Wage Rate .....	184
[2.78]	4. Unemployment Insurance .....	185
[2.79]	5. Workers' Compensation .....	186
[2.80]	IX. Equal Employment Opportunity Issues .....	186
[2.81]	A. Federal Law .....	187
[2.82]	1. Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964.....	187
[2.83]	2. 42 U.S.C. § 1983.....	196
[2.84]	3. 42 U.S.C. § 1985(3) .....	198
[2.85]	4. 42 U.S.C. § 1981: Equal Rights Under the Law.....	199
[2.86]	5. Equal Pay Act of 1963 .....	200
[2.87]	6. Age Discrimination in Employment Act .....	203
[2.88]	7. Rehabilitation Act of 1973; Americans With Disabilities Act.....	209
[2.89]	8. Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964.....	216
[2.90]	9. Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 .....	217
[2.91]	10. Revenue Sharing Act .....	218
[2.92]	11. Omnibus Crime Control and Safe Streets Act.....	219
[2.93]	12. Family and Medical Leave Act.....	220
[2.94]	B. New York Law.....	221
[2.95]	1. New York State Human Rights Law .....	221
[2.96]	2. New York Equal Pay Act.....	226
[2.97]	3. New York City Human Rights Law.....	226
[2.98]	4. Lawful Activities Law .....	226

[2.99]	C. Laws Against Political Discrimination .....	228
[2.100]	1. Federal Law .....	228
[2.101]	2. New York Law .....	229
[2.102]	a. Taylor Law .....	229
[2.103]	b. Lawful Activities Law .....	230
[2.104]	c. Civil Service Law § 75 .....	232
[2.105]	d. Civil Service Law § 107(1) .....	233
[2.106]	e. Civil Service Law § 80 .....	233
[2.107]	3. The Hatch Act .....	234
[2.108]	4. Constitutional Protections Against Discrimination for Political Activity or Affiliation .....	234
[2.109]	5. Constitutional Protections for Public Employee Speech, Conduct and Association .....	239
[2.110]	a. The Pickering Balancing Test .....	239
[2.111]	b. Employee Versus Citizen .....	240
[2.112]	(1) Does the Speech Touch Upon a Matter of Public Concern? .....	243
[2.113]	(2) Application of the Pickering Balancing Test .....	247
[2.114]	(3) Application of Pickering to Hybrid and Freedom of Association Claims .....	251
[2.115]	(4) Evidentiary Standards for Establishing Speech as a Motivating Factor .....	252
[2.116]	c. Prior Restraint of Employee Speech .....	254
[2.117]	d. Freedom of Association .....	256
[2.118]	e. The Right to Petition .....	258
[2.119]	f. The Defense of Qualified Immunity .....	258
[2.120]	g. The Defense of Legislative Immunity .....	260
[2.121]	D. Legal Protections for Whistle-Blowers .....	260
[2.122]	1. Taylor Law .....	260
[2.123]	2. Public Employment Safety and Health Act ...	260
[2.124]	3. Civil Service Law § 75-b .....	260
[2.125]	E. Scope of Activities Protected .....	261
[2.126]	F. Mandatory Prerequisite: Predisclosure Notification .....	262
[2.127]	G. Prohibition Against Retaliatory Adverse Personnel Actions .....	264



[2.128]	H. Burden of Proof in Civil Service Law § 75-b Claims .....	265
[2.129]	I. Forums and Procedures for Civil Service Law § 75-b Claims .....	266
[2.130]	1. Administrative and Arbitral Forums .....	266
[2.131]	2. Judicial Forums .....	267
[2.132]	a. Court Actions or Proceedings .....	267
[2.133]	b. Jury Trials .....	268
[2.134]	c. Claims Against the State of New York ....	269
[2.135]	d. Claims Against Political Subdivisions ....	269
[2.136]	e. Notice of Claim Requirement Regarding Some Political Subdivisions .....	269
[2.137]	f. Waiver of Other State Law and Contractual Claims .....	270
[2.138]	g. Remedies in Judicial Forums .....	270
[2.139]	J. Collateral and Judicial Estoppel Issues .....	271
[2.140]	1. Municipal Protections for Whistle-Blowers ..	271
[2.141]	2. Labor Law § 741: Protections for Health Care Workers Relating to Quality of Patient Care .....	272
[2.142]	3. Taylor Law .....	273
[2.143]	4. Public Employment Safety and Health Act ...	274
[2.144]	5. Constitutional Protections for Whistle-Blowing .....	275
[2.145]	6. Workplace Computers and Electronic Communications .....	275
[2.146]	X. Federal Jurisdiction Over Issues Other Than Equal Employment Opportunity .....	279
[2.147]	A. Fair Labor Standards Act—Wages and Hours.....	279
[2.148]	1. History .....	279
[2.149]	2. Jurisdiction .....	280
[2.150]	3. Substantive Provisions .....	281
[2.151]	4. Administration .....	282
[2.152]	B. Mass Transit .....	282
[2.153]	1. Public Transportation and the Railway Labor Act .....	282
[2.154]	a. National Mediation Board Responsibilities .....	283

[2.155]	b. National Railroad Adjustment Board Responsibilities.....	285
[2.156]	2. Public Transportation and the Urban Mass Transportation Act.....	285

**Chapter 3 Employee Rights Under the Taylor Law**

[3.0]	I. Introduction.....	291
[3.1]	II. Statutory Rights of Employees Under the Taylor Law.....	291
[3.2]	III. Public and Private Sector Distinctions.....	293
[3.3]	IV. Prohibited Employer Actions.....	299
[3.4]	A. Interference With Right to Organize.....	299
[3.5]	1. Right to Choose an Employee Organization.....	301
[3.6]	2. Right to Change Employee Organizations.....	306
[3.7]	3. Right to Free Elections.....	307
[3.8]	4. Communications During the Campaign.....	308
[3.9]	a. Access to Unit Members .....	309
[3.10]	b. Captive Audience Speeches .....	310
[3.11]	5. Bargaining After Filing a Petition.....	311
[3.12]	6. Provision of Wage Increases and Other Benefits to Influence Voters .....	313
[3.13]	7. Threats of Reprisal.....	314
[3.14]	8. Proving Interference or Discrimination .....	315
[3.15]	9. Remedies.....	316
[3.16]	B. Interference or Discrimination on Basis of Participation in Employee Organization.....	317
[3.17]	1. Denial of Benefits, Promotions and Other Rights .....	328
[3.18]	2. Disciplinary Action for Exercising Employee Rights .....	329
[3.19]	3. Negotiation and Implementation of Collective Bargaining Agreements .....	332
[3.20]	4. Denial of Access .....	334
[3.21]	5. Proving Employer Misconduct .....	335
[3.22]	6. Remedies.....	341
[3.23]	V. Prohibited Union Actions.....	343
[3.24]	A. Interference, Restraint or Coercion.....	343
[3.25]	1. Historical Overview .....	343

[3.26]	2.	Nature and Elements of a Violation.....	344
[3.27]	a.	Employer Standing to Assert Union Violation.....	345
[3.28]	b.	Scope of Prohibition on Union Misconduct .....	347
[3.29]	B.	Union Control of Membership Policies .....	348
[3.30]	C.	Union Interference With an Election .....	353
[3.31]	1.	Incumbent Bargaining and the Election Process .....	353
[3.32]	2.	Improper Conduct .....	354
[3.33]	VI.	Duty of Fair Representation.....	356
[3.34]	A.	Source of the Duty .....	356
[3.35]	B.	Exhaustion of Contractual Remedies.....	358
[3.36]	C.	Parties.....	358
[3.37]	D.	PERB's Role in Adjudicating DFR Breaches.....	360
[3.38]	1.	Improper Practice Charges.....	360
[3.39]	2.	Grievances.....	361
[3.40]	3.	Settlements.....	369
[3.41]	E.	Duty to Nonmembers of the Union.....	370
[3.42]	F.	Duty in Collective Bargaining .....	371
[3.43]	G.	Nonbargaining Situations.....	373
[3.44]	H.	Remedies.....	374
[3.45]	1.	Remedies Obtainable Through PERB .....	374
[3.46]	2.	Damages Obtainable in Court.....	375
[3.47]	3.	Injunctions and Other Equitable Remedies....	376
[3.48]	I.	Statutes of Limitations .....	377
[3.49]	J.	Agency Shop Fee Payers .....	380
<b>Chapter 4 Union Rights Under the Taylor Law</b>			
[4.0]	I.	Introduction.....	383
[4.1]	II.	Right of Unions to Be Free From Employer Domination or Interference .....	383
[4.2]	A.	Domination .....	385
[4.3]	B.	Interference .....	386
[4.4]	III.	Right to Negotiate a Contract.....	391
[4.5]	IV.	Continuing Obligation to Bargain.....	394
[4.6]	A.	Obligation to Bargain During the Life of a Contract .....	394
[4.7]	1.	Past Practices .....	395

[4.8]	2. Waiver.....	399
[4.9]	B. Nonmandatory Subjects of Negotiation— Impact Negotiations .....	407
[4.10]	C. Negotiations Over Terms of a Contract .....	408
[4.11]	D. Effect of Impasse on Continuing Obligation to Bargain.....	408
[4.12]	V. Right to Maintenance of the Status Quo After Expiration of an Agreement.....	409
[4.13]	A. Triborough Doctrine .....	409
[4.14]	B. Exceptions to the Triborough Doctrine.....	410
[4.15]	C. Triborough Law .....	411
[4.16]	D. Sunset Clauses and Continuation-of-Benefits Clauses .....	418
[4.17]	VI. Administration of Contracts.....	419
[4.18]	A. Statutory Rights .....	419
[4.19]	B. Control of Procedures .....	420
[4.20]	C. Right of Access and Information .....	421
[4.21]	D. Rights of Successor.....	426
[4.22]	VII. Dues Checkoff.....	426
[4.23]	A. Exclusivity .....	427
[4.24]	B. Suspension .....	427
[4.25]	VIII. Unchallenged Representation Status.....	428
[4.26]	IX. Agency Shop Fees.....	428
[4.27]	A. Enabling Legislation .....	428
[4.28]	B. Constitutional Limitations .....	431
[4.29]	C. New York State Issues .....	434
[4.30]	1. PERB’s Jurisdiction Over Agency Shop Questions.....	434
[4.31]	2. Determinations by PERB.....	434
[4.32]	a. Procedural Matters .....	434
[4.33]	b. Substantive Determinations.....	439
[4.34]	D. Remedies.....	440
 <b>Chapter 5 Employer Rights Under the Taylor Law</b>		
[5.0]	I. Introduction.....	445
[5.1]	II. Right to Recognize a Union .....	445
[5.2]	A. Introduction.....	445
[5.3]	B. Procedure for Recognition .....	450
[5.4]	C. Access .....	454

[5.5]	III.	Right to Negotiate Under the Taylor Law .....	456
[5.6]	A.	Duty to Negotiate in Good Faith.....	456
[5.7]	1.	Scope of the Duty.....	456
[5.8]	2.	Bypass of Bargaining Agent Prohibited .....	460
[5.9]	3.	Continuation of Duty When a Tentative Agreement Is Reached .....	461
[5.10]	B.	Extent of Duty Relative to Contract Provisions....	463
[5.11]	C.	Right to Resist Demands for Nonmandatory Subjects of Negotiation.....	468
[5.12]	D.	Prohibited Subjects of Negotiation .....	473
[5.13]	E.	Protection of Employee Statements and Actions .....	474
[5.14]	IV.	Strike Prohibition .....	475
[5.15]	A.	Introduction.....	475
[5.16]	B.	Taylor Law Provisions .....	476
[5.17]	1.	Determination of a Strike.....	476
[5.18]	2.	Penalties .....	479
[5.19]	3.	Enforcement: Injunctions and Contempt Proceedings .....	481
[5.20]	C.	Picketing .....	483
[5.21]	V.	Right to Notice .....	483

**Chapter 6 The Representation Process**

[6.0]	I.	Introduction.....	489
[6.1]	II.	PERB Representation Procedures .....	489
[6.2]	A.	Recognition .....	489
[6.3]	B.	Petition .....	492
[6.4]	1.	Who May File .....	492
[6.5]	2.	Timing for Filing.....	493
[6.6]	3.	Contract Bar .....	498
[6.7]	4.	Showing of Interest .....	501
[6.8]	5.	Intervention .....	506
[6.9]	6.	Managerial or Confidential Application .....	508
[6.10]	7.	Hearing Procedures .....	509
[6.11]	8.	Certification Without an Election .....	510
[6.12]	9.	Appeal .....	511
[6.13]	10.	Unit Clarification and Unit Placement Petitions.....	512

[6.14]	III. General Standards for Establishing Negotiating Units .....	517
[6.15]	A. Statutory Criteria.....	518
[6.16]	1. Community of Interest .....	520
[6.17]	2. Ability of Employer to Negotiate Effectively .....	531
[6.18]	3. Service of the Public Interest .....	534
[6.19]	B. Policy Considerations .....	536
[6.20]	1. Community of Interest .....	538
[6.21]	2. Ability of Employer to Negotiate Effectively .....	539
[6.22]	3. Service of the Public Interest .....	541
[6.23]	IV. Issues in Representation Proceedings .....	541
[6.24]	A. Teachers .....	541
[6.25]	1. Supervisory Units.....	542
[6.26]	2. Managerial Employees.....	543
[6.27]	3. Related Professionals .....	546
[6.28]	4. Part-Time Teachers and Substitutes.....	548
[6.29]	5. Full-Time Teachers Serving in Limited Capacities .....	550
[6.30]	B. Uniformed Services .....	551
[6.31]	1. Police Units .....	552
[6.32]	2. Firefighting and Other Occupations With Significant Safety Concerns.....	554
[6.33]	3. Supervisors.....	555
[6.34]	4. Part-Time and Seasonal Employees.....	559
[6.35]	5. Deputy Sheriffs .....	560
[6.36]	6. Peace Officers .....	564
[6.37]	C. Supervisors.....	564
[6.38]	D. Part-Time and Seasonal Employees.....	571
[6.39]	1. Part-Time Employees.....	571
[6.40]	2. Seasonal Employees.....	572
[6.41]	3. One-Person Units .....	575
[6.42]	4. Vacant Positions.....	576
[6.43]	E. Modification of Existing Units .....	576
[6.44]	1. Fragmentation .....	578
[6.45]	2. Supplementation/Accretion/Consolidation ....	585
[6.46]	V. Managerial/Confidential Employees.....	587

[6.47]	A. Statutory Provisions .....	587
[6.48]	1. Scope of Statute .....	587
[6.49]	2. How Designations Are Made .....	589
[6.50]	3. Effects of Designation.....	594
[6.51]	B. Managerial Status.....	595
[6.52]	1. Role in Development of Policy .....	595
[6.53]	2. Participation in Collective Negotiations .....	597
[6.54]	C. Confidential Status .....	599
[6.55]	D. Application Procedure .....	604
[6.56]	1. Time for Filing .....	604
[6.57]	2. Stipulations .....	604
[6.58]	3. Parties.....	605
[6.59]	VI. Elections.....	605
[6.60]	A. PERB Procedures.....	605
[6.61]	1. Arranging for the PERB Election .....	605
[6.62]	2. Certification Without an Election .....	607
[6.63]	3. Counting the Ballots .....	609
[6.64]	a. Challenging Ballots .....	610
[6.65]	b. Tallying Ballots .....	611
[6.66]	4. Runoff Elections .....	611
[6.67]	B. Election Objections .....	612
[6.68]	1. Standard of Review.....	612
[6.69]	2. Timing of Objectionable Conduct .....	613
[6.70]	3. General Grounds for Objections .....	613
[6.71]	a. Campaign Misrepresentations .....	613
[6.72]	b. Electioneering at the Polls.....	615
[6.73]	c. Employee Eligibility .....	616
[6.74]	d. Other Grounds .....	616
[6.75]	4. Objections to Union Conduct.....	617
[6.76]	a. Waiver of Initiation Fees.....	617
[6.77]	b. Fraudulent Showing of Interest .....	618
[6.78]	c. Promise or Grant of Benefits.....	620
[6.79]	5. Objections to Employer Conduct.....	620
[6.80]	a. Discrimination .....	620
[6.81]	b. Promise of Grant of Benefits.....	621
[6.82]	c. Denial or Threatened Loss of Benefits.....	621
[6.83]	d. Other Employer Conduct .....	622
[6.84]	6. Procedures for Objecting .....	623

[6.85]	7. Remedies.....	624
[6.86]	VII. Judicial Review .....	625
[6.87]	A. When Reviewable .....	625
[6.88]	1. Statutory Preclusion of Review of Preliminary Orders Until Review of Final Order .....	625
[6.89]	2. Statutory Time Bar.....	628
[6.90]	B. Scope of Review .....	629
[6.91]	C. Review of Questions Concerning Showing of Interest .....	631

**Chapter 7 Duty to Negotiate**

[7.0]	I. Introduction.....	635
[7.1]	II. Scope of Negotiations .....	635
[7.2]	A. Mandatory Subjects .....	637
[7.3]	1. Salaries and Wages .....	641
[7.4]	a. Salary Schedules .....	642
[7.5]	b. Shift Differences/Premium Pay/ Supplemental Pay .....	643
[7.6]	c. Staffing, Equipment and Safety .....	645
[7.7]	d. Insurance .....	648
[7.8]	e. Employee Services and Benefits .....	649
[7.9]	f. Holidays, Vacations, Leaves .....	651
[7.10]	g. General Municipal Law §§ 207-a and 207-c .....	652
[7.11]	2. Hours .....	653
[7.12]	3. Other Terms and Conditions of Employment.....	656
[7.13]	a. Subcontracting.....	657
[7.14]	b. Agency Shop Fee .....	662
[7.15]	c. Qualifications, Promotions and Evaluations .....	662
[7.16]	d. Discharge and Discipline .....	664
[7.17]	e. Union Business.....	666
[7.18]	f. Residency Requirements .....	667
[7.19]	g. Impact Bargaining .....	668
[7.20]	h. Smoking Restrictions .....	668
[7.21]	i. Drug Testing and Other Regulatory Requirements.....	669



[7.22]	j.	Matters Covered by Statute; Waiver of Statutory Rights or Protections .....	671
[7.23]	k.	Miscellaneous.....	673
[7.24]	B.	Nonmandatory Subjects of Bargaining .....	673
[7.25]	1.	Early Cases.....	673
[7.26]	2.	General Rules .....	675
[7.27]	3.	Catalog of Nonmandatory Subjects of Bargaining.....	679
[7.28]	a.	Retirement Benefits, Termination, Severance Pay .....	679
[7.29]	b.	Employer's Mission .....	682
[7.30]	(1)	Budget Cuts .....	682
[7.31]	(2)	Reductions in Workforce; Filling of Vacancies.....	683
[7.32]	(3)	Class Size and Other Educational Policy Issues.....	684
[7.33]	c.	Deployment of Staff, Job Assignments and Manpower Issues.....	685
[7.34]	(1)	Job Assignments .....	685
[7.35]	(2)	Employer's Organizational Structure; Rank of Supervisors .....	686
[7.36]	(3)	Manpower.....	687
[7.37]	(4)	Shift Assignment .....	687
[7.38]	(5)	Call-In; Use of Non-Unit Members; Composition of Negotiating Unit .....	688
[7.39]	(6)	Implementation of New Programs or Services to the Public.....	688
[7.40]	4.	Miscellaneous Topics.....	689
[7.41]	a.	Departmental Rules .....	689
[7.42]	b.	Matters Covered by Statute .....	690
[7.43]	c.	Polygraph, Breathalyzer, Chemical Tests .....	690
[7.44]	d.	Sick Leave Abuse.....	691
[7.45]	e.	Qualifications for Appointment and Promotion; Classification; Job Descriptions.....	691
[7.46]	f.	Parity .....	692
[7.47]	C.	Prohibited Subjects .....	693

[7.48]	D. PERB Procedures .....	694
[7.49]	1. Filing of Improper Practice Charge .....	694
[7.50]	2. Declaratory Rulings .....	698
[7.51]	3. Remedies .....	699
[7.52]	III. Duty to Negotiate in Good Faith .....	699
[7.53]	A. Obligations and Conduct of Parties .....	699
[7.54]	1. Generally .....	699
[7.55]	2. Representation; Appointment and Authority of Negotiators .....	706
[7.56]	3. Impasse Provisions .....	708
[7.57]	4. Duty to Sign Contract .....	709
[7.58]	5. Ratification and Legislative Approval .....	711
[7.59]	B. Unilateral Action .....	713
[7.60]	1. Duty to Negotiate Impact .....	713
[7.61]	2. Continuing Duty to Negotiate .....	715
[7.62]	3. Strikes and Strike Threats .....	718
[7.63]	a. Strikes .....	718
[7.64]	b. Strike Threats .....	720
[7.65]	IV. Impasse Procedures .....	722
[7.66]	A. PERB Procedures .....	722
[7.67]	1. Statutory Provisions .....	722
[7.68]	2. Rules of Procedure .....	725
[7.69]	3. Interest Arbitration .....	726
[7.70]	B. Mediation .....	727
[7.71]	C. Fact-Finding .....	729
[7.72]	1. Procedures in Fact-Finding .....	729
[7.73]	2. Relationship of Fact-Finding to Negotiations Process .....	732
[7.74]	D. Superconciliation .....	735
[7.75]	E. Legislative Determinations .....	736
[7.76]	1. Policy and Purpose .....	736
[7.77]	2. Overview .....	737
[7.78]	3. History .....	740
[7.79]	4. Availability .....	741
[7.80]	5. Procedure .....	743
[7.81]	F. Interest Arbitration .....	748
[7.82]	1. Voluntary .....	748
[7.83]	2. Mandatory .....	749

[7.84]	a. Availability .....	749
[7.85]	b. Procedures for Interest Arbitration-Eligible Bargaining Units .....	752
[7.86]	(1) Petition for Arbitration .....	753
[7.87]	(2) Selection of Arbitration Panel .....	753
[7.88]	(3) Conduct of Arbitration Hearing.....	754
[7.89]	(4) Arbitrable Issues and Objections.....	755
[7.90]	(5) Decision of the Panel .....	760
[7.91]	c. Procedures for Transit Authority Employees .....	762
[7.92]	d. Judicial Review .....	764
[7.93]	V. Successorship .....	766
[7.94]	A. Successor Employers .....	766
[7.95]	B. Successor Unions .....	770
[7.96]	1. Affiliation/Merger.....	770
[7.97]	2. Representation Elections.....	771
[7.98]	3. Schisms and Defunct Unions .....	771
	APPENDIX .....	773

**Chapter 8 Improper Practices**

[8.0]	I. Jurisdiction, Elements and Deferral .....	887
[8.1]	A. Jurisdiction.....	887
[8.2]	B. Deferral .....	893
[8.3]	1. PERB and NLRB: Different Paths to the Same Rule .....	893
[8.4]	2. When Appropriate.....	893
[8.5]	3. Jurisdictional Deferral Distinguished .....	898
[8.6]	II. PERB Procedures .....	901
[8.7]	A. Filing of Improper Practice Charge .....	901
[8.8]	1. Initial Processing.....	901
[8.9]	2. Timeliness .....	904
[8.10]	3. Standing .....	911
[8.11]	4. Sufficiency of the Contents.....	914
[8.12]	5. Amendments and Withdrawals .....	915
[8.13]	a. Amendments.....	915
[8.14]	b. Withdrawals .....	918
[8.15]	B. Answering the Charge.....	921
[8.16]	C. Motion Practice .....	923
[8.17]	1. Motion for Particularization.....	923

[8.18]	2. Motion to Intervene.....	924
[8.19]	3. Motion to Dismiss on Basis of Timeliness ....	927
[8.20]	4. Motion to Recuse ALJ .....	927
[8.21]	5. Other Motions .....	927
[8.22]	D. Conferences, Hearings and ALJ Decisions.....	928
[8.23]	1. Prehearing Conferences .....	928
[8.24]	2. Discovery .....	929
[8.25]	3. Subpoenas .....	929
[8.26]	4. Scheduling the Hearing.....	930
[8.27]	5. Conduct of the Hearing.....	931
[8.28]	a. Matters Within the ALJ’s Discretion .....	932
[8.29]	b. Duties of the ALJ .....	933
[8.30]	c. Evidence .....	934
[8.31]	d. Credibility Determinations of ALJ.....	936
[8.32]	e. Motions and Objections .....	938
[8.33]	6. Interlocutory Appeals.....	940
[8.34]	7. Special Cases .....	941
[8.35]	8. ALJ’s Decision.....	942
[8.36]	E. Exceptions to the Board.....	943
[8.37]	1. Time Period for Filing Exceptions.....	944
[8.38]	2. Extensions of Time .....	946
[8.39]	3. Content and Format of Exceptions .....	947
[8.40]	4. Conclusion .....	948
[8.41]	III. Remedies.....	948
[8.42]	A. Statutory Authority .....	948
[8.43]	1. Remedies for Failure to Negotiate in Good Faith .....	949
[8.44]	2. Alleged Violations of Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	949
[8.45]	B. Types of Improper Practice Remedies.....	951
[8.46]	1. Cease-and-Desist Orders.....	951
[8.47]	2. Affirmative Relief.....	952
[8.48]	a. Restoration of the Status Quo Ante.....	953
[8.49]	b. “Make-Whole” Remedy .....	955
[8.50]	c. Bargaining Order.....	964
[8.51]	d. Posting Remedy.....	965
[8.52]	C. Exercise of Remedial Power.....	966
[8.53]	IV. Injunctive Relief.....	970

[8.54]	V.	Judicial Review and Enforcement.....	981
[8.55]	A.	Prerequisites to Judicial Review .....	981
[8.56]	B.	Review of PERB Orders .....	982
[8.57]	1.	Transfer .....	982
[8.58]	2.	Parties.....	983
[8.59]	3.	Intervention .....	983
[8.60]	C.	Enforcement of PERB Orders.....	983
[8.61]	D.	Deference to PERB Orders .....	985

**Chapter 9 Strikes**

[9.0]	I.	The Nature and Extent of Prohibition .....	991
[9.1]	A.	Historical Development .....	991
[9.2]	B.	The Taylor Law.....	994
[9.3]	C.	Strike Determination.....	995
[9.4]	D.	The Role of the Chief Executive Officer .....	999
[9.5]	II.	Penalties .....	1001
[9.6]	A.	Loss of Wages (Two-for-One).....	1001
[9.7]	B.	Forfeiture of Dues and Agency Fee Checkoff Privileges.....	1003
[9.8]	1.	The Evolution of Forfeiture Provision .....	1006
[9.9]	2.	Constitutional Challenges .....	1007
[9.10]	3.	Factors Affecting Duration and Timing of Forfeiture .....	1008
[9.11]	4.	PERB Procedures Relating to Forfeiture .....	1015
[9.12]	a.	Rules and Procedural Rulings .....	1015
[9.13]	b.	The Role of PERB Counsel and Plea Bargaining .....	1017
[9.14]	5.	Mini-PERBs and the Loss of Checkoff Privileges.....	1018
[9.15]	C.	Discipline .....	1019
[9.16]	D.	Loss of Triborough Rights .....	1019
[9.17]	III.	Court Procedures Relating to Injunction.....	1020
[9.18]	A.	Application for Injunction.....	1020
[9.19]	B.	Contempt for Violation of Injunction .....	1024
[9.20]	C.	Civil Action for Damages .....	1027

**Chapter 10 New York City Collective Bargaining Law**

[10.0]	I.	The Origin of New York City Collective Bargaining Law and Creation of Office of Collective Bargaining.....	1031
[10.1]	A.	Background.....	1032
[10.2]	B.	Organization.....	1033
[10.3]	1.	Office of Collective Bargaining.....	1033
[10.4]	a.	Board of Collective Bargaining.....	1033
[10.5]	b.	Board of Certification.....	1034
[10.6]	c.	Functions.....	1034
[10.7]	d.	Jurisdiction.....	1036
[10.8]	2.	Office of Labor Relations.....	1039
[10.9]	II.	Relationship of the NYCCBL to the Taylor Law.....	1039
[10.10]	III.	Issues Arising Under the NYCCBL.....	1041
[10.11]	A.	Collective Bargaining Practices.....	1041
[10.12]	1.	Negotiating Units.....	1041
[10.13]	a.	Reduction in Number of Units.....	1041
[10.14]	b.	Coalition and Pattern Bargaining.....	1043
[10.15]	2.	Special Classifications of Employees.....	1044
[10.16]	a.	Laborers, Workers and Mechanics Employed by the Government.....	1044
[10.17]	b.	Managerial, Confidential and Supervisory Employees.....	1045
[10.18]	3.	Scope of Bargaining.....	1047
[10.19]	a.	Practical Impact.....	1048
[10.20]	b.	Voluntary Subjects of Negotiation.....	1049
[10.21]	B.	Grievance Arbitration.....	1050
[10.22]	1.	Discipline.....	1054
[10.23]	2.	Assignment of Out-of-Title Work.....	1056
[10.24]	3.	Pay Questions.....	1057
[10.25]	4.	Overtime.....	1058
[10.26]	5.	Appointment and Promotion.....	1059
[10.27]	a.	Appointment.....	1059
[10.28]	b.	Promotion.....	1059
[10.29]	6.	Assignment and Transfer.....	1060
[10.30]	C.	Improper Practices.....	1061
[10.31]	1.	Injunctive Relief.....	1061
[10.32]	2.	Types of Improper Practice Charges.....	1063

[10.33]	a. Interference with Employee Rights.....	1063
[10.34]	b. Discrimination and Retaliation.....	1066
[10.35]	c. Interference with Internal Union Affairs..	1067
[10.36]	d. Unilateral Change in a Mandatory Subject of Bargaining.....	1068
[10.37]	e. Failure to Supply Information.....	1074
[10.38]	f. Breach of Duty of Fair Representation ....	1074
[10.39]	D. Impasse Resolution.....	1076
[10.40]	1. Criteria for Recommendations.....	1076
[10.41]	2. Procedure.....	1077
[10.42]	3. Experience with Impasse Panels.....	1078
[10.43]	IV. Mediation.....	1080

**Chapter 11 Mini-PERBS**

[11.0]	I. Overview.....	1083
[11.1]	A. Local Option.....	1083
[11.2]	B. Local Representation Procedures Under Taylor Law § 206.....	1083
[11.3]	1. Statutory Requirements.....	1084
[11.4]	2. PERB Review.....	1084
[11.5]	3. Impartial Agency and Scope of Review.....	1084
[11.6]	4. Section 206: Dead or Alive?.....	1086
[11.7]	C. Local Government Procedures Under Taylor Law § 212.....	1086
[11.8]	1. Jurisdiction.....	1086
[11.9]	a. Areas in Which a Mini-PERB May Not Act.....	1087
[11.10]	b. Areas in Which a Mini-PERB May Act... ..	1088
[11.11]	2. Localities.....	1088
[11.12]	II. Relationship of § 212 mini-PERBS to PERB.....	1089
[11.13]	A. Substantial Equivalency.....	1089
[11.14]	B. Approval of Local Enactment.....	1089
[11.15]	1. Application.....	1089
[11.16]	2. Amendment.....	1090
[11.17]	3. Requirements for a Determination of Substantial Equivalency.....	1090
[11.18]	a. Creation of Mini-PERB.....	1091
[11.19]	b. Representation Disputes.....	1092
[11.20]	c. Managerial/Confidential Designations.....	1092

[11.21]	d. Impasse Procedures .....	1092
[11.22]	e. Strikes.....	1093
[11.23]	4. Termination and Repeal .....	1094
[11.24]	C. Continuing Implementation .....	1094
[11.25]	1. Procedure for Review.....	1095
[11.26]	2. Nature and Scope of PERB’s Review.....	1095
[11.27]	a. Merits of Mini-PERB’s Determination ....	1096
[11.28]	b. Local Rules of Procedure .....	1098
[11.29]	c. Investigatory Conduct .....	1099
[11.30]	D. Judicial Review .....	1101

**Chapter 12 Arbitration and Contract Enforcement**

[12.0]	I. The Taylor Law.....	1105
[12.1]	II. Overview of Final and Binding Arbitration.....	1106
[12.2]	A. History.....	1106
[12.3]	B. Applicable Laws and Statutes—Public Versus Private Sector .....	1108
[12.4]	C. Procedural Requisites.....	1110
[12.5]	D. Alternatives to Binding Arbitration .....	1111
[12.6]	1. Advisory Arbitration.....	1111
[12.7]	2. Litigation.....	1112
[12.8]	III. Pre-Hearing Procedures .....	1114
[12.9]	A. Application to Compel or Stay Arbitration.....	1114
[12.10]	B. Subsequent Applications.....	1117
[12.11]	C. Injunctive Relief.....	1119
[12.12]	D. Arbitrability.....	1120
[12.13]	1. The Steelworkers Trilogy—Arbitrability in the Private Sector .....	1120
[12.14]	2. Arbitrability in the Public Sector in New York.....	1126
[12.15]	a. Introduction .....	1126
[12.16]	b. Existence of Valid Agreement to Arbitrate .....	1126
[12.17]	c. <i>Huntington</i> and Its Progeny .....	1127
[12.18]	d. Noncompliance With Valid Agreement.....	1137
[12.19]	e. Statute of Limitations in Arbitration .....	1139
[12.20]	f. Other Statutory Limitations .....	1140
[12.21]	g. Waiver of the Right to Arbitrate .....	1141



[12.22]	h. Claim Preclusion .....	1144
[12.23]	IV. Arbitration Hearings .....	1145
[12.24]	A. Statutory Provisions and Requirements .....	1145
[12.25]	1. Effect of Including Arbitration Clause in Contract.....	1146
[12.26]	2. Content and Scope of Arbitration Clause .....	1147
[12.27]	B. Selection of Arbitrators.....	1150
[12.28]	C. Conduct of Hearing .....	1152
[12.29]	D. Rules of Evidence .....	1154
[12.30]	E. Conduct of Arbitrator.....	1155
[12.31]	F. Issuance of Award.....	1157
[12.32]	V. Post-Award Proceedings .....	1158
[12.33]	A. Modification of Award .....	1158
[12.34]	1. Statutory Grounds .....	1158
[12.35]	2. Time Provisions .....	1160
[12.36]	3. Form Requirements.....	1160
[12.37]	4. Arbitrator’s Authority on Motion .....	1161
[12.38]	B. Applications to Confirm or Vacate Awards.....	1161
[12.39]	1. Application to Confirm .....	1161
[12.40]	a. Venue, Time and Procedural Requirements.....	1161
[12.41]	b. Who Can Make the Application.....	1162
[12.42]	c. Grounds for Granting or Denying Application to Confirm .....	1163
[12.43]	2. Applications to Vacate .....	1163
[12.44]	a. Venue and Time Requirements .....	1163
[12.45]	b. Vacatur as Cross-Motion on Application to Confirm .....	1165
[12.46]	c. Who May Make Application to Vacate....	1165
[12.47]	3. Grounds for Vacatur.....	1166
[12.48]	a. Generally .....	1166
[12.49]	b. Effect of Participation in Arbitration .....	1168
[12.50]	c. Fraud, Corruption, Bias, Partiality .....	1170
[12.51]	d. Misconduct .....	1175
[12.52]	e. Acts in Excess of Authority .....	1183
[12.53]	(1) Introduction.....	1183
[12.54]	(2) Violation of Contract Limitations.....	1184
[12.55]	(3)“Completely Irrational” Test .....	1189

[12.56]	f. Acts in Violation of Public Policy or Statutes .....	1194
[12.57]	(1) Federal Court Cases .....	1196
[12.58]	(2) State Court Cases .....	1200
[12.59]	(3) Statutory Limitations .....	1209
[12.60]	(4) Conclusion .....	1213
[12.61]	g. Imperfect Execution .....	1214
[12.62]	VI. Judicial Enforcement of Arbitration Awards .....	1216
[12.63]	A. Overview .....	1216
[12.64]	B. Practical Considerations .....	1217
[12.65]	C. Different Means of Enforcement for Different Types of Judgments .....	1218
[12.66]	D. Obtaining an Enforceable Document .....	1219
[12.67]	E. Obtaining Judgment on Remittitur .....	1221
[12.68]	F. Enforcement Proceedings .....	1222
[12.69]	1. Money Judgment .....	1222
[12.70]	2. Contempt .....	1225
[12.71]	G. Conclusion .....	1228

### **Chapter 13 Employee Discipline**

[13.0]	I. Common Law .....	1231
[13.1]	A. Property Interests .....	1231
[13.2]	B. Liberty Interests .....	1231
[13.3]	II. Statutory Law .....	1233
[13.4]	A. N.Y. Civil Service Law .....	1233
[13.5]	1. Civil Service Law § 75 .....	1235
[13.6]	a. Applicability .....	1235
[13.7]	b. Exception .....	1241
[13.8]	c. Procedures; Employee Rights .....	1242
[13.9]	(1) Generally .....	1242
[13.10]	(2) Prehearing Interrogations .....	1246
[13.11]	(3) Hearing .....	1248
[13.12]	(4) Evidentiary Issues .....	1250
[13.13]	(5) Penalties and Acquittals .....	1252
[13.14]	2. Civil Service Law § 75-a .....	1253
[13.15]	3. Civil Service Law § 75-b .....	1255
[13.16]	4. Civil Service Law § 76—Appeals .....	1257
[13.17]	a. Generally .....	1257
[13.18]	b. Appeals to the Commission .....	1258

[13.19]	c. Appeals to the Courts .....	1260
[13.20]	B. Education Law .....	1262
[13.21]	1. “Just Cause” Standard.....	1262
[13.22]	2. Hearing Procedures.....	1263
[13.23]	3. Employer’s Noncompliance With Education Law § 3020-a .....	1272
[13.24]	4. Decisional Law Under Amended § 3020-a....	1274
[13.25]	a. Settlements .....	1274
[13.26]	b. Formation of Settlements .....	1274
[13.27]	c. Employee’s Right to Remain Silent .....	1275
[13.28]	d. Preclusive Effect of § 3020-a Proceeding .....	1276
[13.29]	e. First Amendment Defenses .....	1277
[13.30]	f. Vacatur .....	1279
[13.31]	5. Burden and Standard of Proof.....	1281
[13.32]	a. Incompetency .....	1281
[13.33]	b. Insubordination.....	1282
[13.34]	c. Misconduct .....	1285
[13.35]	d. Neglect of Duty .....	1288
[13.36]	e. Failure to Maintain Certification.....	1288
[13.37]	f. Conviction for a Crime.....	1289
[13.38]	g. Penalties and Settlements .....	1290
[13.39]	h. Evidentiary Considerations .....	1292

**Chapter 14 Administration of the Civil Service Law**

[14.0]	I. Overview .....	1295
[14.1]	II. Classification.....	1296
[14.2]	A. Jurisdictional Classification .....	1297
[14.3]	B. Position Classification and Compensation.....	1298
[14.4]	1. Position Classification .....	1298
[14.5]	2. Compensation .....	1299
[14.6]	III. Challenges to Personnel Determinations .....	1300
[14.7]	A. Determination of Employee Status .....	1300
[14.8]	B. Procedure .....	1301
[14.9]	1. State Civil Service Commission .....	1301
[14.10]	2. Local Governments .....	1303
[14.11]	IV. Appeal Procedures .....	1303
[14.12]	A. State Civil Service Commission .....	1303
[14.13]	B. Local Civil Service Commissions.....	1305

[14.14]	V.	Other Areas Subject to Civil Service Commission Jurisdiction .....	1305
[14.15]	A.	Abolition of Position.....	1305
[14.16]	B.	Rules and Regulations of Local Civil Service Commissions.....	1306
[14.17]	C.	Involuntary Leave .....	1306
[14.18]	1.	Ordinary Disability, Temporary Leave.....	1306
[14.19]	2.	Ordinary Disability, Permanent Separation ...	1309
[14.20]	3.	Occupational Injury or Illness.....	1311
[14.21]	D.	Review of Disciplinary Proceedings Pursuant to Civil Service Law § 75 .....	1313
[14.22]	E.	Classification and Compensation.....	1313
[14.23]	F.	Assignment to Unclassified Service .....	1314
[14.24]	G.	Appointment and Removal .....	1314
[14.25]	H.	Out-of-Title Work.....	1316
[14.26]	I.	Certification of Payroll .....	1316
[14.27]	J.	Crimes.....	1317
[14.28]	K.	Disqualification.....	1317
[14.29]	L.	Examination Appeals.....	1317

**Chapter 15 Retirement Systems in New York State**

[15.0]	I.	Introduction.....	1321
[15.1]	A.	Common Features .....	1321
[15.2]	B.	Statewide Retirement Systems.....	1328
[15.3]	1.	New York State and Local Government Employees' Retirement System.....	1328
[15.4]	2.	New York State Teachers' Retirement System.....	1336
[15.5]	3.	Optional Retirement Program .....	1340
[15.6]	4.	New York State and Local Police and Fire Retirement Systems .....	1342
[15.7]	C.	New York City Retirement Systems.....	1347
[15.8]	II.	Litigation Against Retirement Systems .....	1351
[15.9]	A.	Constitutional Safeguards for Retirement Benefits .....	1351
[15.10]	1.	State Constitutional Protection .....	1351
[15.11]	2.	Federal Constitutional Protection .....	1358
[15.12]	B.	Parties, Notice, Class Actions.....	1358
[15.13]	C.	Jurisdiction and Types of Action .....	1360

[15.14]	D. Frequently Litigated Issues .....	1362
[15.15]	1. Filing .....	1362
[15.16]	2. Errors in Payment .....	1363
[15.17]	3. Designation of Beneficiary .....	1366
[15.18]	4. Vesting .....	1368
[15.19]	5. Prior Service Credit.....	1368
[15.20]	6. Transfer of Membership.....	1369
[15.21]	7. Selection of Options.....	1369
[15.22]	8. Entitlements Based on Employment Status ...	1370
[15.23]	9. Employment After Retirement.....	1371
[15.24]	10. Disability Benefits .....	1372
	Table of Authorities.....	1379
	Index .....	1535

## **ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS**

### **EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**

#### **JEROME LEFKOWITZ, ESQ.**

Jerome Lefkowitz is chairman of the Public Employment Relations Board. He previously was deputy counsel for the Civil Service Employees Association of New York, deputy industrial commissioner of the NYS Labor Department and an assistant attorney general for the NYS Department of Law. He is a graduate of Columbia University and has served on its faculty.

A frequent speaker on labor and administrative procedures, Mr. Lefkowitz has lectured at the University of California at Berkeley, UCLA, Cornell University, Rutgers University, the University of Hawaii, the University of Texas and the University of Michigan. He is a member of the American Bar Association and the New York State Bar Association and has chaired the latter's Labor and Employment Law Section. He has also served on panels with the American Arbitration Association, the New York Board of Mediation, the New Jersey Public Employment Relations Commission, the New Jersey Board of Mediation and the Pennsylvania Board of Mediation. Mr. Lefkowitz has authored articles for the *Labor Law Journal*, *New York Law Journal*, *Brooklyn Law Review*, *Albany Law Review*, *Fordham Law Review* and *The CERL Review*. He also served as editor-in-chief of the first edition of *Public Sector Labor and Employment Law*.

### **CO-EDITORS**

#### **JOHN M. CROTTY, ESQ.**

John Crotty currently has a private legal and labor arbitration practice after having served for many years as the deputy chairman and counsel for the New York State Public Employment Relations Board. He focuses his practice in labor law, arbitration, administrative law and appellate advocacy. He previously served as PERB associate counsel, as a PERB administrative law judge and as assistant counsel to the State University of New York after his graduation, *cum laude*, from Cornell University School of Law in 1976. Mr. Crotty is a member of the New York State Bar Association's Labor and Employment Law Section and its Executive Committee, and has contributed many articles

to the section's journal. Other publications which he has contributed to, or authored, include *Annotated Rules of PERB* (1994 with supplements), *Taylor Law Remedies* (1995 with supplements), *New York State Administrative Procedure and Practice* (2nd ed. West Publishing Co., 1998) and *Union Representation Proceedings Under New York's Taylor Law* (LexisNexis Publishing). An adjunct professor of public sector labor law at Albany Law School, Mr. Crotty also is a frequent panelist, lecturer and instructor for government, unions, professional and educational institutions and labor relations associations.

#### **JEAN DOERR, ESQ.**

Jean Doerr is an Administrative Law Judge with the New York State Public Employment Relations Board in Buffalo. A 1981 graduate of the State University of New York at Buffalo School of Law, she was admitted to the bar in 1982 and maintained a private practice in labor and employment law for six years before joining PERB. Ms. Doerr is a member of the New York State Bar Association and its Labor and Employment Law Section and the Erie County Bar Association. She has participated in several public sector law programs sponsored by PERB, the NYSBA, and the Cornell University School of Industrial and Labor Relations.

#### **RICHARD K. ZUCKERMAN, ESQ.**

Richard K. Zuckerman is a partner in Lamb & Barnosky, LLP of Melville, where he concentrates his practice in representing management in all public and private sector labor and employment law areas. He has served as Chair of the New York State Bar Association's Labor and Employment Law Section and continues to serve on its Executive Committee, as well as that of NYSBA's Municipal Law Section. He is a Fellow of the Governors of The College of Labor and Employment Lawyers and a past president of the New York State Association of School Attorneys. He is also a Fellow of the New York Bar Foundation. Mr. Zuckerman is one of the editors-in-chief for the 2009 Supplement to the third edition of NYSBA's treatise *Public Sector Labor and Employment Law*, as well as a member of the Editorial Board for the American Bar Association's treatise *Discipline and Discharge in Arbitration* and a contributing editor to the sixth edition of the ABA's Elkouri & Elkouri, *How Arbitration Works* treatise. He has been named as a *Super Lawyer* in New York Labor and Employment Law and has also been named by *The*

*Long Island Business News* as a *Who's Who* in Labor Law. Mr. Zuckerman has lectured at numerous programs sponsored by national, New York State and local entities, published articles on topics of interest to the profession and appeared on various television and radio programs as a labor and employment law expert, as well as on behalf of clients. Mr. Zuckerman is a 1984 graduate of the Columbia School of Law.

#### **CONTRIBUTING EDITORS**

##### **BETH A. BOURASSA, ESQ.**

Beth Bourassa is a partner at Whiteman, Osterman & Hanna LLP, where she is a member of the firm's Employment Law and Education Law Practice Group. Ms. Bourassa represents management in areas of school law and public and private sector labor and employment law. She received her J.D. degree from Albany Law School, *summa cum laude*, in 1990.

##### **STEVEN A. CRAIN, ESQ.**

Steven A. Crain is a Deputy Counsel for the Civil Service Employees Association. He has been a member of the CSEA Legal Department since June, 1989. During his legal career, Mr. Crain has worked as a labor law attorney for the Village of Hempstead, New York, and County of Orange, New York. He has also served as an adjunct instructor for both Marist College Special Academic Programs and the Labor Studies Extension Program of Cornell University School of Industrial and Labor Relations.

##### **STEVEN C. DECOSTA, ESQ.**

Steven DeCosta is the Deputy Director and General Counsel of the New York City Office of Collective Bargaining (OCB). Prior to joining OCB, he worked as an attorney with the New York City Law Department and as an assistant general counsel for District Council 37, AFSCME. He has lectured on labor law issues at the Metropolitan District Office of the Cornell University School of Industrial and Labor Relations, at New York University's Graduate School of Public Administration, Institute of Labor Relations, and in CLE programs sponsored by the Association of the Bar of the City of New York, New York State Bar Association, New York University School of Law and New York Law School. He is a graduate of Hofstra University School of Law, where he was Research Editor of the *Law Review*, and he received his undergraduate degree from Queens College of the City University of New York.



**EDWARD J. GREENE, JR., ESQ.**

Edward J. Greene, Jr., a partner with the law firm of Sheehan Greene Golderman & Jacques LLP, focuses his legal practice primarily in the areas of labor and employment law, employment discrimination, administrative law, and civil litigation. Mr. Greene counsels labor unions and their members on issues related to members' terms and conditions of employment, and represents labor unions and individuals before arbitrators, mediators, administrative agencies, and in New York's state and federal courts. He is a member of the Albany County Bar Association, the New York State Bar Association, and the American Bar Association, as well as a member of the New York and American Bar Associations' Labor and Employment Sections. Mr. Greene received his B.S., *cum laude*, and his M.S. from the State University of New York and his J.D., *magna cum laude*, from Albany Law School, where he was an Associate Editor of the *Albany Law Review*.

**NANCY G. GROENWEGEN, ESQ.**

Nancy G. Groenwegen was appointed counsel to Comptroller D. Napoli on December 23, 2010. Prior to that appointment, she was President of the Civil Service Commission, commencing February 14, 2007.

Ms. Groenwegen previously served as an assistant attorney general in the New York State Department of Law, and worked at the New York State School Boards Association as counsel for policy and employee relations services. Ms. Groenwegen held a variety of positions in the administration of Governor Mario M. Cuomo. She was assistant counsel in the Governor's Office of Employee Relations, then assistant counsel to the governor himself for labor, public pension and economic development matters. She later served as deputy commissioner and chief counsel in the Departments of Civil Service and Labor. She began her career as an assistant attorney general in the Department of Law after graduation from the Boston University School of Law and the State University of New York at Albany.

**KEVIN HARREN, ESQ.**

Kevin Harren, a graduate of Georgetown University and Albany Law School, is Director of Labor Relations Services at Capital Region BOCES. Prior to accepting his current position, Mr. Harren served in NYSUT's Office

of General Counsel for 31 years, and, prior, as a staff attorney with the Albany Resident Office of the National Labor Relations Board.

**WILLIAM A. HERBERT, ESQ.**

William Herbert is Deputy Chair and Counsel to the New York State Public Employment Relations Board. In this position, he functions as the chief legal advisor to PERB's Chairman and to the Board. Prior to joining PERB, Mr. Herbert was Senior Counsel at CSEA Local 1000, AFSCME, AFL-CIO, where he practiced labor and employment law in federal and state courts, administrative agencies and in arbitration. In addition, he is a former supervising attorney with the New York City Commission on Human Rights. He is an author of numerous articles and a regular lecturer on labor and employment issues. Mr. Herbert is a graduate of the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law, Yeshiva University and the University of Buffalo.

**GARY JOHNSON, ESQ.**

Gary Johnson has been the director of the New York State Governor's Office of Employee Relations (GOER) since 2007. He has served as an assistant counsel at GOER, and as an associate counsel at the NYS Office of Court Administration and at New York State United Teachers. He also previously served as an administrative law judge and director of litigation at the New York State Public Employment Relations Board (PERB). He began his legal career as an assistant district attorney in the King's County District Attorney's office. He received his law degree from the Fordham University School of Law in 1985. He sits on the Advisory Board of the Government Law Center of Albany Law School and as a member of the Independent Judicial Election Qualification Commission, Third Department, Third Judicial District.

**CLAY J. LODOVICE, ESQ.**

Clay J. Lodovice is an Assistant Counsel for the Governor's Office of Employee Relations. Prior to joining the Governor's Office of Employee Relations in 2008, he was an attorney with an Albany based law firm representing public sector unions. As Assistant Counsel for the Governor's Office of Employee Relations, he specializes in public sector labor law. He is a graduate of Lafayette College and Albany Law School.

**PHILIP L. MAIER, ESQ.**

Philip L. Maier joined the New York State Public Employment Relations Board in 1991 as an Administrative Law Judge. He has presided over hundreds of cases involving issues such as retaliatory discharge, refusals to bargain, and representation issues. Since 1993, he has been the Director of PERB's Regional office in Brooklyn and is responsible for overseeing the labor relations which fall within the agency's jurisdiction in New York City, and Suffolk and Nassau Counties. He continues to serve as an Administrative Law Judge, and also serves as a mediator pursuant to PERB's impasse resolution procedures. He has mediated numerous collective bargaining disputes in the police, firefighter, and school district arenas. Prior to joining the agency, he served as a litigation attorney with the New York State Labor Relations Board from 1985 to 1991; he graduated with honors from Vermont Law School in 1981, where he was a member of the law review.

**DAVID P. QUINN, ESQ.**

David P. Quinn is the Associate Counsel and Director of Litigation for the New York State Public Employment Relations Board. He has been with PERB since 1984, serving 15 years as an administrative law judge and eight years as assistant counsel. He received his J.D. from Albany Law School in 1982, an M.A. from the Cooperstown Graduate Programs of the State University of New York at Oneonta in American Folk Culture, and a B.A., cum laude, from the State University at Albany. He is a member of the New York State Bar Association's Labor and Employment Law Section, and was a contributor to the first edition of this book.

**JUDITH RATNER, ESQ.**

Judith Ratner has been Deputy Commissioner and Counsel to the New York State Department of Civil Service and the Civil Service Commission since April 2007. Her areas of expertise include civil service, employment and labor, employee benefits, ethics, privacy and contracts law. Ms. Ratner previously worked for the Unified Court System for 12 years, serving in various positions in the Office of Labor Relations, including Assistant Director of Litigation. While in the Office of Labor Relations, Ms. Ratner represented court managers in a wide variety of labor/management issues. From 1981 through 1995, Ms. Ratner was employed in the Office of the Attorney General and

served as an Assistant Attorney General and ultimately as the Deputy Bureau Chief for the Albany Litigation Bureau. She represented state agencies in all aspects of litigation in state and federal courts and specialized in employment, discrimination and labor matters.

**MONICA R. SKANES, ESQ.**

Monica R. Skanes, Esq., is an associate in the Albany law firm of Whiteman, Osterman & Hanna LLP. Ms. Skanes mainly practices in the areas of labor and employment law, education law, and litigation. She regularly assists school districts and private sector employers with education and employment law issues. Ms. Skanes graduated *summa cum laude* from Albany Law School in 2011. During law school, she acted as a law clerk at New York State United Teachers' Office of General Counsel, and as a student judicial intern in the chambers of the Honorable Thomas J. McAvoy, Senior District Judge of the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of New York.

**LYNN HOMES VANCE, ESQ.**

Lynn Homes Vance is Assistant Counsel for the Governor's Office of Employee Relations. Prior to joining the Governor's Office of Employee Relations in 2004, she was a senior attorney for the New York State Crime Victims Board, an assistant district attorney for Nassau County and a deputy district attorney for Los Angeles County. As assistant counsel for the Governor's Office of Employee Relations, she specializes in public sector labor and employment law. She is a graduate of Randolph-Macon Woman's College and Southwestern Law School.

**MELANIE WLASUK, ESQ.**

Melanie Wlasuk has been an Administrative Law Judge with the Public Employment Relations Board since 2007, where she also edits the publication *Mandatory/Nonmandatory Subjects of Negotiation*. Prior to joining PERB, Ms. Wlasuk spent five-and-a-half years as General Counsel for Service Employees International Union, Local 200 United in Syracuse. She has considerable experience in both public and private sector labor and employment law, including arbitration, contract negotiation, and litigation in state and federal courts. Ms. Wlasuk received her bachelor's degree from Syracuse University's Newhouse School of Public Communications and is a graduate of Syracuse University College of Law.

## **CONTRIBUTORS**

STACEY M. BARRICK, ESQ.  
Whiteman Osterman & Hanna  
Albany

ANGELA BLASSMAN, ESQ.  
Public Employment Relations Board  
Brooklyn

JEFFREY M. BRAUDE, ESQ.  
Department of Civil Service  
Albany

CONSTANCE BROWN, ESQ.  
Civil Service Employees Association  
Albany

NANCY L. BURRITT, ESQ.  
Public Employment Relations Board  
Albany

ELENA CACAVAS, ESQ.  
Public Employment Relations Board  
Brooklyn

KENNETH S. CARLSON, ESQ.  
Public Employment Relations Board  
Albany

NATALIE CARRAWAY, ESQ.  
Sheehan Greene Carraway Golderman & Jacques LLP  
Albany

RONALD S. EHRLICH, ESQ.  
Governor's Office of Employee Relations  
Albany

KEVIN M. GROSSMAN, ESQ.  
Governor's Office of Employee Relations  
Albany

KEVIN HARREN, ESQ.  
Capital Region BOCES  
Albany

KARA HILBURGER, ESQ.  
Civil Service Employees Association  
Albany

KEITH R. JACQUES, ESQ.  
Sheehan Greene Carraway Golderman & Jacques LLP  
Albany

ADRIENNE JUOZOKAS, ESQ.  
Public Employment Relations Board  
Albany

AARON KAPLAN, ESQ.  
Civil Service Employees Association  
Albany

ELLEN MITCHELL, ESQ.  
Civil Service Employees Association  
Albany

THIEN-NGA NGUYEN-CLARK, ESQ.  
Sheehan Greene Carraway Golderman & Jacques LLP  
Albany

CARIN CARDINALE PERKINS, ESQ.  
Governor's Office of Employee Relations  
Albany

LESLIE C. PERRIN, ESQ.  
Civil Service Employees Association  
Albany

AMY M. PETRAGNANI, ESQ.  
Governor's Office of Employee Relations  
Albany

TERESA A. PRESCOTT, ESQ.  
Governor's Office of Employee Relations  
Albany

DAREN J. RYLEWICZ, ESQ.  
Civil Service Employees Association  
Albany

AMANDA VELAZQUEZ, ESQ.  
Civil Service Employees Association  
Albany

MICHAEL N. VOLFORTE, ESQ.  
Governor's Office of Employee Relations  
Albany

ERIC WILKE, ESQ.  
Civil Service Employees Association  
Albany

MARK WORDEN, ESQ.  
Department of Civil Service  
Albany