New York Lawyers' Practical Skills Series

Zoning and Land Use

Michael E. Cusack, Esq.
John P. Stockli, Jr., Esq.
Herbert A. Kline, Esq.

2012–2013

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION NYSBA

New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2012
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 1-57969-373-3
Product Number: 423912

CONTENTS

I. Introduction 1
II. What Is Zoning? 1
III. Other Land Use Mechanisms 2
  A. Site Plan Review 2
  B. Subdivision Control 2
IV. Practical Implications of Land Use and Zoning 3
V. New York Zoning and Land Use Jurisdiction 3
VI. Zoning and Land Use Enabling Legislation 4
  A. Town Law 4
  B. General City Law 8
  C. Village Law 10
  D. General Municipal Law 12
  E. Municipal Home Rule Law 13
  F. Statute of Local Governments 14
VII. Adoption and Amendment of Zoning Legislation 14
  A. Town Law 14
  B. Village Law 16
  C. General City Law 17
  D. Municipal Home Rule Law 18
  E. Comprehensive Plan 18
  F. Moratoria 19
VIII. Zoning Board of Appeals 20
  A. Nature and Types of Variances 21
  B. Genesis of Variances 21
  C. Jurisdiction 23
  D. Interpretations 24
  E. Perfecting the Appeal 25
  F. The Appeal 25
  G. Limitations on ZBA Authority 28
    1. General Limitations 28
    2. ZBA Precedent 29
    3. Rehearing; *Res Judicata* 30
IX. Area Variances 31
  A. Nature of Area Variance 31
  B. Standard of Review 32
    1. Neighborhood Character 33
    2. Alternatives to Variance 35
    3. Physical/Environmental Conditions 36
    4. Whether Variance Is Substantial 37
    5. Self-Created Hardship 38
    6. Economic Considerations; Personal Benefit/Convenience 40
    7. Court Review 41
X. Use Variances 41
  A. Nature of Use Variance 41

B. Standard of Review 42
1. Lack of Reasonable Return 43
2. Unique Hardship 44
3. Essential Character of the Neighborhood 45
4. Self-Created Hardship 46
XI. Varying the Variance Criteria 47
XII. Planning Boards 49
XIII. Site Plan Review 49
A. Nature of Site Plan Review 49
B. Jurisdiction 50
C. Standard of Review 51
1. Scope of Review Authority 51
2. Limitations on Review Authority 53
D. Site Plan Review Application Process 54
E. Authority to Impose Conditions 55
1. Recreational Land and Substitutes 56
2. Public Infrastructure and Improvements 56
F. Waiver of Requirements 57
XIV. Special Use Permits 57
A. Nature of the Special Use Permit 57
B. Jurisdiction 58
C. Standard of Review 58
1. Scope of Review Authority 59
2. Power Reserved to Governing Municipal Board 60
D. Special Use Permit Application Process 61
E. Waiver of Requirements 61
XV. Subdivision Review 62
A. Nature of Subdivision Review 62
B. Jurisdiction 63
C. Standard of Review 64
D. Subdivision Review Process 65
1. Substantive Review Criteria 65
2. Posting of Bond or Other Suitable Security 66
3. Waiver of Requirements or Improvements 68
4. Integration of SEQRA Process; Default Approval 68
5. Filing Requirements; Other Matters 69
a. Certification of Plat 69
b. Filing of Decision 70
c. Filing of Final Plat; Expiration of Approval 70
6. Abandonment 70
XVI. State-Mandated Overlays 71
A. State Environmental Quality Review Act 71
B. Adirondack Park Agency Regulations 72
C. Agriculture and Markets Law art. 25-AA 72
D. General Municipal Law 73

XVII. Limitations on Zoning Power 75
A. Takings 75
B. Authority to Impose Conditions 76
1. Constitutional Requirements 76
2. Variance Conditions 78
3. Special Use Permit and Site Plan Conditions 80
a. Site Plan Review Conditions 81
b. Special Use Permit Conditions 82
XVIII. Open Meetings Law 82
A. Meetings 83
B. Public Notice 84
C. Minutes 87
D. Enforcement 87
XIX. Freedom of Information Law 88
A. Full Disclosure; Exemptions 89
B. FOIL Procedure 91
C. FOIL Appeals 92

Zoning and Land Use Forms Index 97

Table of Authorities 209
About the Authors 223

MICHAEL E. CUSACK, ESQ.

Michael Cusack is of counsel with the Albany, N.Y., law firm of Young, Sommer, Ward, Ritzenberg, Baker & Moore, LLC. Previously, Mr. Cusack served as Vice President, General Counsel and Secretary of Independent Wireless One Corporation, a Sprint PCS Network member. He holds a Bachelor's degree in computer science from Siena College and earned his J.D. at Albany Law School of Union University. A member of the American, New York State and Federal Communications Bar Associations, Mr. Cusack focuses his practice on municipal, land use, real estate and telecommunications law.

HERBERT A. KLINE, ESQ.

Herbert A. Kline was with the Binghamton, New York, firm of Pearis, Kline & Barber, LLP continuously from 1957 until 2007 when he became of Counsel to Coughlin & Gerhart, LLP. Mr. Kline received his bachelor of arts degree from Syracuse University and his law degree from Harvard Law School. From 1957 through 1968, he was Assistant District Attorney of Broome County. Mr. Kline has been active in municipal law for over 50 years, serving as Town Attorney of the Town of Kirkwood since 1958. From 1979 to 2008 he served as either the Town Attorney or the Deputy Town Attorney of the Town of Colesville, and has served as the Village Attorney of the Village of Port Dickinson since 1992 and Attorney for the Town of Sanford since 2005. From 1994 to 2008 he served as either the Town Attorney or the Deputy Town Attorney of the Town of Triangle. He was elected Chairman of the Municipal Law Section of the New York State Bar Association in 1970 and President of the Association of Towns of the State of New York in 1971. He is a member of the Broome County, New York State, and American Bar Associations.

Mr. Kline is the author of *New York Municipal Formbook*, 3rd edition (NYSBA 2010). He is also the author of *Forms and Outlines of Criminal Procedure for Town Justices and Police,* published by the Association of Towns in 1962, 1965, 1971 and 1978, and the 1977 through 2009 editions of *Small Claims Guide for Town and Village Courts*.

JOHN P. STOCKLI, JR., ESQ.

John P. Stockli is a partner in the Albany firm of Stockli Slevin & Peters, LLP. He has extensive experience in land use, zoning, and real estate law related to the development of commercial and utility matters. Mr. Stockli has represented several clients on the sale and leasing of multi-asset real estate portfolios and issues associated with the acquisition of multiple contiguous properties and rights of way for utility projects. He has counseled numerous clients on compliance strategies in the development context and has successfully litigated several land-use cases.

For more than 10 years, Mr. Stockli has been co-author of the New York State Bar Association's chapter on Land Use and Zoning for the *New York Lawyer's Deskbook*. He is also the author of over a dozen online practice commentaries for LEXIS—providing practical insight into various New York land-use statutes. Mr. Stockli has also lectured at numerous professional seminars on environmental and land-use issues.

Mr. Stockli served as a Trustee for the New York State Interest on Lawyers Account Fund from 2002 through 2004. He is a graduate of Albany Law School, where he served as Managing Editor for the *Albany Law Review*. Mr. Stockli is admitted to practice before the Courts of the State of New York and the United States District Court of the Northern District of New York. He is a member of the New York State Bar Association.