Foundation Evidence, Questions and Courtroom Protocols

Fourth Edition

Hon. Edward M. Davidowitz
Robert L. Dreher, Esq.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction ix

Chapter 1 Examination of Defendants Who Want to Proceed to Trial Pro Se

[1.0] Summary of the Court's Examination 4

Chapter 2 Courtroom Closure

[2.0] I. Overview 9
[2.1] II. Civilian Witnesses 9
[2.2] III. Undercover Police Officers 11

Chapter 3 Pretrial and Suppression Hearings

[3.0] I. Overview 17
[3.1] II. Burdens of Proof 18
[3.2] III. Motions to Suppress Physical Evidence 18
[3.3] IV. Motions to Suppress Identification Testimony 20
[3.4] V. Motions to Suppress Statements 21
[3.5] VI. Motions to Suppress Evidence Based Upon an Unlawful Arrest 22
[3.6] VII. *Darden* Hearings 23
[3.7] VIII. *Ventimiglia* Hearings 25

Chapter 4 Documentary Evidence

[4.0] I. Hearsay 29
[4.1] A. Overview 29
[4.2] B. Business Records Exception 29
[4.3] II. Authentication 32
[4.4] A. Overview 32
[4.5] B. Authentication and Certification of Various Types of Records 32
[4.6] III. Best Evidence Rule 34
Question Sets and Protocols 35

Chapter 5 Alternative Procedures for Admission and Preclusion of Evidence

[5.0] I. Stipulations and Concessions 51
[5.1] II. Pretrial Applications 53
[5.2] A. Motions *in Limine* 53
[5.3] B. *Molineux* Applications and *Ventimiglia* Hearings 54
[5.4] C. Pretrial Evidentiary Rulings 54

Chapter 6 Physical and Demonstrative Evidence
[6.0] I. Physical Evidence 57
[6.1] A. Admissibility 57
[6.2] B. Audiotaped Recordings 58
[6.3] II. Demonstrative Evidence 59
[6.4] A. Overview 59
[6.5] B. Photographs 60
Question Sets and Protocols 63

Chapter 7 Lay Witness Testimony
[7.0] I. Overview 101
[7.1] II. Introduction of Confession or Admission After Police-Administered *Miranda* Warnings 102
[7.2] III. Reputation or Character Evidence 102
[7.3] IV. Refreshing a Witness's Present Recollection 104
[7.4] V. Past Recollection Recorded 104
[7.5] VI. Impeachment by Prior Inconsistent Statement 105
[7.6] VII. Adverse and Hostile Witnesses 107
[7.7] VIII. Examination of a Witness About Prior Convictions and Bad Acts 108
[7.8] IX. Cross-Examination of Alibi Witnesses 109
Question Sets and Protocols 111

Chapter 8 Expert Witness Testimony
[8.0] I. Overview 139
[8.1] II. Formal Offer of Witness as Expert 139
[8.2] III. Scope of Foundation Questions for Experts 140
[8.3] IV. Grounds for Motion to Preclude Expert Testimony 141
Question Sets and Protocols 143

Chapter 9 Summations
[9.0] I. Overview 181
[9.1] II. Insulting Characterizations of Defendants, Their Defenses and Their Attorneys 182
[9.2] III. Remarks by Prosecutors Which Shift the Burden of Proof to the Defendant and Improperly Vouch for the People's Witnesses 184
[9.3] IV. Remarks Which Encourage Jurors to Consider the Effect Their Decisions Will Have on the Community 186
[9.4] V. Misstatements of Law and Evidence 188
[9.5] VI. Issues for Which Summation Comments Are Proper 189

Chapter 10 Trial and Courtroom Protocols
[10.0] I. Attorney Conduct When a Court Session Begins 193
[10.1] II. Exhibits..... 193
[10.2] III. Attorney Conduct When the Jury Enters the Courtroom 194
[10.3] IV. Swearing in of a Witness..... 194
[10.4] V. Displaying Evidence to the Jury..... 194
[10.5] VI. Sidebar Conferences..... 194
[10.6] VII. Completing the Record..... 195
[10.7] VIII. Offers of Proof 195
[10.8] IX. More Suggestions..... 195

Chapter 11 Direct Examination
[11.0] I. Direct Examination 199
[11.1] A. Overview 199
[11.2] B. Pretrial Preparation..... 200
[11.3] II. Presenting the Evidence 204
[11.4] III. Questions and Answers 206
[11.5] IV. Redirect and Rebuttal Evidence 212
[11.6] V. Impeaching a Party's Own Witness and Hostile Witnesses..... 214

Chapter 12 Cross-Examination
[12.0] I. Cross-Examination 219
[12.1] A. Overview 219
[12.2] B. Types and Purpose of Cross-Examination 220
[12.3] II. Preparation for Cross-Examination 222
[12.4] III. Cross-Examination Techniques..... 223
[12.5] A. Ten Commandments of Cross-Examination 223
[12.6] B. Other Considerations..... 231
[12.7] IV. Prior Inconsistent Statements 235
[12.8] A. Prior Inconsistent Statements in Court Proceedings 236
[12.9] B. Prior Inconsistent Written Statements..... 237
[12.10] C. Prior Inconsistent Oral Statements..... 239
[12.11] V. Prior Convictions, Uncharged Crimes and Bad Acts 240
[12.12] VI. The Physical and Mental Condition of Witnesses 242
[12.13] VII. Expert Witnesses 243

Chapter 13 Objections
[13.0] I. Objections: Overview..... 251
[13.1] II. Preliminary Issues 251

[13.2] III. The Grounds for Objections 253
[13.3] A. Objections to Form 253
[13.4] 1. Ambiguous, Confusing, Misleading or Vague 253
[13.5] 2. Argumentative 254
[13.6] 3. Asked and Answered 254
[13.7] 4. Assumes a Fact Not in Evidence 255
[13.8] 5. Beyond the Scope of Direct or Redirect Examination 255
[13.9] 6. Question Calls for a Conclusion or a Speculative Answer 255
[13.10] 7. Questions Which Ask Witnesses to Comment on the Credibility of Other Witnesses 256
[13.11] 8. Compound Questions 256
[13.12] 9. Hearsay Evidence 256
[13.13] 10. Leading Questions 256
[13.14] 11. Question Misstates or Misquotes Evidence ... 257
[13.15] 12. Narrative Answers 257
[13.16] 13. Answer to Question Is Not Responsive 257
[13.17] 14. Relevance 257
[13.18] B. Objections to Substance 258
[13.19] 1. Lack of Authentication or Foundation 258
[13.20] 2. Best Evidence Not Offered 258
[13.21] 3. Bolstering 258
[13.22] 4. Chain of Custody 259
[13.23] 5. Completeness 259
[13.24] 6. Cumulative Testimony 259
[13.25] 7. Immaterial and Irrelevant 260
[13.26] 8. Witness Lacks Personal Knowledge of the Events 260
[13.27] 9. Improper Offer Into Evidence of a Prior Inconsistent Statement 260
[13.28] 10. Privileged Communications 260
[13.29] 11. Prejudicial Impact of the Question Outweighs the Probative Value of the Answer 260

Chapter 14 Motions to Strike
[14.0] Motions to Strike 265

Chapter 15 The Courtroom and the Court
[15.0] I. The Courtroom and the Court 269
[15.1] II. The Court..... 269

Table of Authorities..... 273
Contributor Biographies 283

HONORABLE EDWARD M. DAVIDOWITZ

Edward Davidowitz was a Justice of the Supreme Court for the criminal branch of the Bronx County Supreme Court. He is currently serving as a Judicial Hearing Officer in that court. Judge Davidowitz was admitted to the bar in 1959 after earning his J.D. from Cornell Law School. Prior to his court appointments, Judge Davidowitz was an assistant district attorney for six years, worked in private practice for eleven years and served in various capacities in the Office of the Special Prosecutor for the Investigation of the New York City Criminal Justice System. He is a member of the New York State Bar Association, The Association of the Bar of the City of New York and a former member of its Council on Judicial Administration, Council on Criminal Justice, Committee on Criminal Advocacy, Committee on Criminal Law, Committee on Criminal Justice Operations and Budget, and Committee on Criminal Courts. He is also the author of *The Practice of Criminal Law Under the CPLR and Related Civil Procedure Statutes*, Fifth Edition (NYSBA 2009; Supplement 2011).

ROBERT L. DREHER, ESQ.

Robert Dreher has been a member of the Bronx District Attorney's staff for more than 31 years. He graduated from Cornell Law School in 1973 and has served as a trial assistant, supervisor, deputy and bureau chief. Mr. Dreher presently serves as Executive Assistant District Attorney. He created, and continues to author, an in-house, online, criminal law research program for the Bronx District Attorney's Office titled "Trial Assistance." He has written for the *Empire State Prosecutor* and has also served as a lecturer for both the continuing legal education program and for the training of assistant district attorneys within the Office of the Bronx District Attorney.

The authors wish to thank Dana Levin, court attorney for Judge James Kindler, who researched, prepared and wrote some of the additions and revisions for this edition.