

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION

One Elk Street, Albany, New York 12207 • 518.463.3200 • www.nysba.org

TAX SECTION

2010-2011 Executive Committee

PETER H. BLESSING

Shearman & Sterling LLP 599 Lexington Avenue 11th Floor New York, NY 10022

JODI J. SCHWARTZ

First Vice-Chair 212/403-1212 ANDREW W. NEEDHAM Second Vice-Chair

DIANA L. WOLLMAN

Secretary 212/558-4055 **COMMITTEE CHAIRS: Bankruptcy and Operating Losses**

Stuart J. Goldring Russell J. Kestenbaum Compliance, Practice & Procedure

Bryan C. Skarlatos Consolidated Returns Lawrence M. Garrett Edward E. Gonzalez

Elliot Pisem

Corporations David R. Sicular Karen Gilbreath Sowell

Cross-Border Capital Markets Andrew Walker Gordon Warnke

Employee Benefits Regina Olshan Andrew L. Oringer **Estates and Trusts**

Amy Heller Jeffrev N. Schwartz Financial Instruments Michael S. Farber

William I McRae "Inbound" U.S. Activities of Foreign

Taxpayers Peter J. Connors David R. Hardy Individuals

Paul R. Comeau Sherry S. Kraus Investment Funds

David H. Schnabel Marc L. Silberberg **New York City Taxes**

Maria T. Jones Irwin M. Slomka New York State Taxes Robert E. Brown

Arthur R. Rosen "Outbound" Foreign Activities of

U.S. Taxpayers Andrew H. Braiterman Yaron Z. Reich Partnerships David W. Mayo

Joel Scharfstein Pass-Through Entities James R. Brown John Lutz

Real Property Robert Cassanos Jeffrey Hochberg

Reorganizations Deborah L. Paul

Linda Z. Swartz Securitizations and Structured Finance

Jiyeon Lee-Lim W. Kirk Wallace **Tax Exempt Entities** Elizabeth T. Kessenides Richard R. Upton

MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Robert J. Levinsohn Lisa A. Levy Vadim Mahmoudov Gary B. Mandel Douglas McFadyen

Charles M. Morgan David M. Schizer Peter F. G. Schuur Ansgar Simon Fric Sloan

Andrew P. Solomon Eric Solomon

January 31, 2011

The Honorable Thomas H. Mattox, Acting Commissioner New York State Department of Taxation and Finance W.A. Harriman Campus, Building 9 Albany, NY 12227

Re: Report on Nonresident Audit Guidelines of the State of New York

Dear Acting Commissioner Mattox:

S. Douglas Borisky

Kathleen L. Ferrell

Charles I. Kingson

Marcy G. Geller

Stephen Land

I am pleased to submit New York State Bar Association Tax Section Report No. 1233, which discusses Nonresident Audit Guidelines of the State of New York issued by the Department of Taxation and Finance on March 31, 2009. The Guidelines are intended to aid auditors and their supervisors in the audits of nonresident tax returns. While the Guidelines are not law, they can exert a powerful effect on the fairness and effectiveness of the manner in which an audit is conducted.

We believe that the Department should promote an audit process that discourages auditors from simply "building a case for residency," but rather, encourages a more dispassionate search for a correct answer to what is often a very complex and subtle set of issues. While we believe that the Guidelines go a long way in the right direction, we also believe that in certain respects they could be improved. Accordingly, our report recommends a number of specific changes to the Guidelines. The report also recommends continued training of audit staff and Field Audit Management to permit the flexibility built into the Guidelines to serve its purpose and to promote the Guidelines' spirit of fair inquiry into the facts of a case.

Edwin M. Jones

Peter L. Faber

David Sachs

John E. Morrissey, Jr.

Martin D. Ginsburg

Hon. Renato Beghe

Alfred D. Youngwood

Gordon D. Henderson

FORMER CHAIRS OF SECTION:

J. Roger Mentz Arthur A. Feder Willard B. Taylor James M. Peaslee Richard J. Hiegel John A. Corry Dale S. Collinson Peter C. Canellos Richard G. Cohen Michael I Schler Donald Schapiro Carolyn Joy Lee Herbert L. Camp Richard L. Reinhold William L. Burke Richard O. Loengard Steven C. Todrys Harold R. Handler Robert H. Scarborough Robert A. Jacobs Samuel J. Dimon Andrew N. Berg Lewis R. Steinberg David P. Hariton

Kimberly S. Blanchard Patrick C. Gallagher David S. Miller Erika W. Nijenhuis

The Honorable Thomas H. Mattox January 31, 2011 Page 2

We appreciate your consideration of our recommendations. If it would be helpful, we would be happy to discuss our recommendations in greater detail with you and your staff.

Respectfully submitted,

Peter H. Blessing

Chair

cc: Robert Plattner

Deputy Commissioner

New York State Department of Taxation and Finance

Daniel Smirlock

Deputy Commissioner and Counsel of New York State

New York State Department of Taxation and Finance

Jack Trachtenberg,

Taxpayer Rights Advocate

New York State Department of Taxation and Finance

Jamie Woodward,

Executive Deputy Commissioner

New York State Department of Taxation and Finance