NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION

NYSBA One Elk Street, Albany, New York 12207 • PH 518.463.3200 • www.nysba.org

TAX SECTION

2013-2015 Executive Committee

DAVID H. SCHNABEL

Chair Debevoise & Plimpton LLP 919 Third Avenue New York, NY 10022-3904 212/909-6336 DAVID R. SICULAR First Vice-Chair 212/373-3082 STEPHEN B. LAND Second Vice-Chair 212/692-5991 MICHAEL S. FARBER Secretary 212/450-4704 COMMITTEE CHAIRS: Bankruptcy and Operating Losses Stuart J. Goldring Linda Z. Swartz Compliance, Practice & Procedure Elliot Pisem Brvan C. Skarlatos Complexity and Administrability Edward E. Gonzalez Joel Scharfstein **Consolidated Returns** Andrew H. Braiterman Kathleen L. Ferrell Corporations Lawrence M. Garrett Vadim Mahmoudov **Cross-Border Capital Markets** S. Douglas Borisky Andrew Walker Cross-Border M&A Ansgar A. Simon Yaron Z. Reich **Employee Benefits** Eric Hilfers Andrew L. Oringer **Estates and Trusts** Alan S. Halperin Laura M. Twomey Financial Instruments William L. McRae "Inbound" U.S. Activities of Foreign Taxpayers Lee Allison Peter J. Connors Individuals Sherry S. Kraus Joseph Septimus Investment Funds Marcy G. Geller Amanda Nussbaum **New York City Taxes** Maria T. Jones Irwin M. Slomka New York State Taxes Paul R. Comeau Arthur R. Rosen "Outbound" Foreign Activities of U.S. Taxpayers Peter F.G. Schuur Philip Wagman Partnerships John T. Lutz Eric Sloan Pass-Through Entities James R. Brown Matthew Lay **Real Property** Robert Cas Elizabeth T. Kessenides Reorganizations Joshua Holmes Eric Solomon Securitizations and Structured Finance Jiyeon Lee-Lim Lisa A. Levy Spin Offs Deborah L. Paul Karen Gilbreath Sowell **Tax Exempt Entities** Stuart Rosow Richard R. Upton **Treaties and Intergovernmental** Agreements David R. Hardy

Andrew P. Solomon

MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Janet A. Andolina Robert E. Brown Steven A. Dean Charles I. Kingson Robert J. Levinsohn Jack Trachtenberg Charles M. Morgan Gordon Warnke David M. Schizer Stephen E. Shay

January 7, 2014

John Koskinen

Commissioner

Internal Revenue Service

The Honorable Mark Mazur Assistant Secretary (Tax Policy) Department of the Treasury 1500 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20220

Chief Counsel

Internal Revenue Service

Washington, DC 20224

1111 Constitution Avenue, NW

1111 Constitution Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20224 The Honorable William J. Wilkins

Re: Report on Notice 2007-55 and Possible Administrative Guidance Addressing Sections 897(h)(1) and 1445(e)(6)

Dear Messrs. Mazur, Koskinen and Wilkins:

I am pleased to submit this report providing recommendations as to how Treasury regulations could implement the positions expressed in Section 2 of Notice 2007-55 (the "Notice"), relating to how Sections 897(h)(1) and 1445(e)(6) of the Internal Revenue Code of 1986 (the "Code") apply to distributions made by a qualified investment entity (a "QIE").

By way of background, Section 897(h)(1) of the Code generally provides that any "distribution" by a QIE to a foreign person shall, to the extent attributable to gain from sales or exchanges by the QIE of United States real property interests, be treated as gain recognized by such person from the sale or exchange of a United States real property interest. The Notice provides, in relevant part, that:

John E. Morrissev, Jr. Peter L. Faber Hon. Renato Beghe Alfred D. Youngwood Gordon D. Henderson David Sachs J. Roger Mentz Willard B. Taylor

Richard J. Hiegel Dale S. Collinson Richard G. Cohen Donald Schapiro Herbert L. Camp William I Burke Arthur A. Feder James M. Peaslee

FORMER CHAIRS OF SECTION: John A. Corry

Peter C. Canellos Michael L. Schler Carolyn Joy Lee Richard L. Reinhold Richard O. Loengard Steven C. Todrvs Harold R. Handler

Robert H. Scarborough Robert A. Jacobs Samuel J. Dimon Andrew N. Berg Lewis R. Steinberg David P Hariton Kimberly S. Blanchard Patrick C. Gallagher

David S. Miller Erika W. Nijenhuis Peter H. Blessing Jodi J. Schwartz Andrew W. Needham Diana I Wollman

Mr. Mazur Mr. Koskinen Mr. Wilkins January 7, 2014

Sections 897(h)(1) and 1445(e)(6) by their terms apply to all distributions to the extent attributable to gain from sales or exchanges by the qualified investment entity of a USRPI. Accordingly, the IRS will challenge under current statutory and regulatory provisions an assertion by any foreign taxpayer that section 897(h)(1) does not apply to distributions in complete liquidation under sections 331 and 332. In addition, regulations will clarify that the application of section 897(h)(1) and withholding under section 1445(e) is not limited to distributions by qualified investment entities that are subject to section 316. The regulations will clarify that the term "distribution," as used in sections 897(h)(1) and 1445(e)(6), includes any distribution included under sections 301, 302, 331, and 332, where the distribution is attributable, in whole or in part, to gain from the sale or exchange of a USRPI by a qualified investment entity or other pass-through entity.

The Report addresses three primary questions: First, what type of corporate distributions does Section 897(h)(1) apply to? Second, how does one determine the amount of a distribution by a QIE that is "attributable to gain" from a sale or exchange of a USRPI by the QIE? Third, should Section 897(h)(1) be interpreted to impose FIRPTA tax on distributions that would not otherwise be treated as taxable income to the shareholder under general U.S. tax rules?

The Report concludes that guidance should provide that the phrase "any distribution" in Section 897(h)(1) means any distribution made to a shareholder in his capacity as such and is not limited to dividends which are, or could be, designated as capital gain dividends by a QIE.

The Report recommends a complex system for determining whether a distribution is "attributable to gain" from a sale or exchange of a USRPI by a QIE. Under that system, a QIE would be required to track (for each non-U.S. shareholder) several different types of FIRPTA gain and the extent to which the shareholder has received a distribution that is attributable to such type of gain. While the recommended system is complicated, it is designed to provide a fairer and more accurate measure of what portion of each distribution is attributable to FIRPTA gain by the QIE than the other, simpler systems which are discussed in the Report.

The Report concludes that guidance should not require that tax be paid on distributions that would not otherwise be treated as taxable income to the shareholder under general U.S. rules. Instead, guidance should require that the FIRPTA tax imposed by reason of Section 897(h)(1) be limited to the lesser of (x) the foreign shareholder's share of the gains recognized by the QIE that are attributable to sales of USRPIs or (y) the shareholder's actual economic gain from its investment in the QIE. In order to implement this limitation, the

Mr. Mazur Mr. Koskinen Mr. Wilkins January 7, 2014

Report recommends a foreign shareholder of a QIE be given the opportunity to limit the tax on distributions subject to Section 897(h)(1) to an amount of tax computed by reference to the actual income or gain recognized at the shareholder level with respect to such distribution. However, in order to apply that rule, the shareholder must agree to "catch up" and pay FIRPTA tax on any subsequent distribution or sale of the interest in the QIE to the extent the shareholder's actual gain from the investment was greater than the gain recognized on the prior distribution(s). This "FIRPTA within gain" approach would be implemented through FIRPTA withholding certificates and/or agreements filed with the foreign shareholder's tax return and would require as a prerequisite that the QIE voluntarily agree to withhold on a basis consistent with the FIRPTA within gain approach. Alternatively, the foreign shareholder could simply pay tax (and be subject to withholding on) a gross basis.

The Report thus recommends that guidance seek to balance competing interests by defining the scope of Section 897(h)(1) in an expansive manner, consistent with the Notice, but providing QIEs and their shareholders with a more accurate mechanism to match FIRPTA gain to QIE distributions and to ensure that the total amount of tax imposed by reason of Section 897(h)(1) is commensurate with the shareholder's actual gain from its investment in the QIE.

We appreciate your consideration of our comments. Please let us know if you would like to discuss them or if we can assist you in any other way.

Respectfully submitted,

David H. Schnabel Chair