

Evidentiary Privileges

Fifth Edition

**(Grand Jury,
Criminal and Civil Trials)**

New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright: 2012
by
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 1-57969-354-7
Product Number: 409912

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| CHAPTER 1 | THE POWER OF THE GRAND JURY TO COMPEL TESTIMONY AND THE LAW'S RIGHT TO EVERY PERSON'S EVIDENCE GENERALLY..... | 1 |
| CHAPTER 2 | THE ROLE OF COUNSEL AT THE GRAND JURY—NOTICE OF RIGHTS | 7 |
| CHAPTER 3 | THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE | 13 |
| CHAPTER 4 | THE SPOUSAL PRIVILEGE | 65 |
| CHAPTER 5 | THE PHYSICIAN-PATIENT PRIVILEGE..... | 75 |
| CHAPTER 6 | THE CLERGY-PENITENT PRIVILEGE..... | 95 |
| CHAPTER 7 | THE PSYCHOLOGIST-PATIENT PRIVILEGE (THE FEDERAL PSYCHOTHERAPIST-CLIENT PRIVILEGE)..... | 103 |
| CHAPTER 8 | THE SOCIAL WORKER-CLIENT PRIVILEGE. | 115 |
| CHAPTER 9 | THE RAPE CRISIS COUNSELOR-CLIENT PRIVILEGE..... | 121 |
| CHAPTER 10 | THE PRIVILEGE AGAINST SELF-INCRIMINATION..... | 127 |
| CHAPTER 11 | THE NEWSPAPERMAN'S PRIVILEGE | 185 |
| CHAPTER 12 | SOME PURPORTED "PRIVILEGES" | 201 |
| CHAPTER 13 | RELEVANCY/MATERIALITY/LEGAL AND PROPER QUESTIONS | 221 |
| CHAPTER 14 | ILLEGAL WIRETAPPING..... | 229 |
| CHAPTER 15 | THE FOURTH AMENDMENT AS APPLIED TO GRAND JURIES | 235 |
| CHAPTER 16 | WAIVERS OF IMMUNITY | 247 |
| CHAPTER 17 | THE MOTION TO QUASH..... | 273 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| CHAPTER 18 A TOPOGRAPHICAL PRIMER ON THE INSTITUTION OF THE GRAND JURY AND THAT OF ITS LEGAL ADVISOR—SOME BROAD PRINCIPLES | 279 |
| CHAPTER 19 CONTEMPT AND THE GRAND JURY | 303 |
| CHAPTER 20 A FAIR-DEALING PROSECUTOR— A WITNESS WHO OBEYS HIS OATH— THE PERJURY AND CONTEMPT TRAP DOCTRINES | 311 |
| CHAPTER 21 A TRANSCRIPT OF A MOCK GRAND JURY SESSION | 319 |
| CHAPTER 22 CONCLUSION..... | 363 |
| APPENDIX | 367 |

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|------|
| Foreword | xiii |
| Preface to the Fifth Edition | xv |
| Introduction | xvii |
| About the Author..... | xxi |
| Chapter 1 The Power of the Grand Jury to Compel Testimony and the Law's Right to Every Person's Evidence Generally | |
| [1.0] I. Power to Compel Testimony | 3 |
| Chapter 2 The Role of Counsel at the Grand Jury—Notice of Rights | |
| [2.0] I. The Role of Counsel | 9 |
| Chapter 3 The Attorney-Client Privilege | |
| [3.0] I. The Attorney-Client Privilege | 15 |
| [3.1] II. Roots of the Privilege | 19 |
| [3.2] III. Client Identity, Retention and Fees | 23 |
| [3.3] IV. Third-Party Benefactors..... | 25 |
| [3.4] V. The Client's Address | 30 |
| [3.5] VI. Business and Personal Advice, Lobbyists | 31 |
| [3.6] VII. The Crime-Fraud Exception | 32 |
| [3.7] VIII. Attorney-Criminals, the Attorney-Client Privilege and the Sixth Amendment..... | 35 |
| [3.8] IX. The Attorney as Transferee of Client Documents ... | 37 |
| [3.9] X. Communications to an Attorney's Ancillary Staff | 38 |
| [3.10] XI. Burden of Establishing the Privilege | 40 |
| [3.11] XII. Multiple Representation at the Grand Jury..... | 41 |
| [3.12] XIII. The Joint Defense Privilege..... | 42 |
| [3.13] XIV. The Privilege and Corporations | 43 |
| [3.14] XV. Death of the Client..... | 48 |
| [3.15] XVI. Implied Waiver | 52 |
| [3.16] XVII. Express Waiver..... | 54 |
| [3.17] XVIII. Government Lawyers and the Privilege | 54 |
| [3.18] XIX. What Attorneys May Not Advise | 58 |
| [3.19] XX. The Lawyer with a Ph.D. in Something Else..... | 58 |
| [3.20] XXI. The Fiduciary Exception..... | 58 |

| | | |
|------------------|--|-----|
| [3.21] | XXII. No Selective Waivers, Even for Superman | 61 |
| [3.22] | XXIII. The “Last Link”and This Attorney-Client Privilege..... | 62 |
| Chapter 4 | The Spousal Privilege | |
| [4.0] | I. Roots of the Privilege | 67 |
| [4.1] | II. Business, Routine and Aberrant Communications..... | 67 |
| [4.2] | III. Disclosive Acts as Confidential Communications..... | 68 |
| [4.3] | IV. The Joint Criminal Participants Exception..... | 70 |
| [4.4] | V. Burdens and Presumptions | 72 |
| [4.5] | VI. Child Molestation and the Spousal Privilege..... | 73 |
| Chapter 5 | The Physician-Patient Privilege | |
| [5.0] | I. The Physician-Patient Privilege..... | 77 |
| [5.1] | II. Roots of the Privilege | 78 |
| [5.2] | III. Nature and Scope of the Privilege | 78 |
| [5.3] | IV. Assertion and Waiver and Limitations | 80 |
| [5.4] | V. Institutional Providers of Medical Care and the Privilege..... | 82 |
| [5.5] | VI. Private Institutional Providers and the Privilege | 83 |
| [5.6] | VII. Correctional Institutional Providers and the Privilege..... | 83 |
| [5.7] | VIII. The Privilege and Medicaid Providers | 84 |
| [5.8] | IX. Some Federal Perspectives | 91 |
| [5.9] | X. The Privilege and One’s Own Medical Records | 94 |
| Chapter 6 | The Clergy-Penitent Privilege | |
| [6.0] | I. The Clergy-Penitent Privilege | 97 |
| [6.1] | II. The Federal Perspective on the Clergy-Penitent Privilege..... | 102 |
| Chapter 7 | The Psychologist-Patient Privilege (The Federal Psychotherapist-Client Privilege) | |
| [7.0] | I. The Psychologist-Patient Privilege..... | 105 |
| [7.1] | II. New York’s Perspective | 106 |
| [7.2] | III. The Federal Psychotherapist-Client Privilege | 107 |
| [7.3] | IV. A Crime-Fraud Exception to the Psychotherapist- Patient Privilege..... | 113 |
| [7.4] | V. Waiver of the Privilege..... | 114 |

| | | |
|-------------------|---|-----|
| Chapter 8 | The Social Worker-Client Privilege | |
| [8.0] | I. Social Worker-Client Privilege..... | 117 |
| Chapter 9 | The Rape Crisis Counselor-Client Privilege | |
| [9.0] | I. Rape Counselor-Client Privilege | 123 |
| Chapter 10 | The Privilege Against Self-Incrimination | |
| [10.0] | I. Historical Perspective | 129 |
| [10.1] | II. The Fifth Amendment and Immunity— Generally..... | 131 |
| [10.2] | III. New York’s Immunity (Amnesty) Statute..... | 138 |
| [10.3] | IV. What the Privilege Never Protects..... | 141 |
| [10.4] | V. Corporations Have No Fifth Amendment Privilege..... | 142 |
| [10.5] | VI. Partnerships and Their Partners Have No Fifth Amendment Protection | 146 |
| [10.6] | VII. The Fifth Amendment Does Not Protect “Required Records” | 148 |
| [10.7] | VIII. Act-of-Production Authentication and the Fifth Amendment..... | 150 |
| [10.8] | A. The First Circuit..... | 150 |
| [10.9] | B. The Second Circuit..... | 154 |
| [10.10] | C. Private Papers in the Second Circuit..... | 156 |
| [10.11] | D. The Third Circuit..... | 157 |
| [10.12] | E. The Fourth Circuit..... | 160 |
| [10.13] | F. The Fifth Circuit..... | 160 |
| [10.14] | G. The Sixth Circuit..... | 161 |
| [10.15] | H. The Seventh Circuit..... | 162 |
| [10.16] | I. The Eighth Circuit..... | 163 |
| [10.17] | J. The Ninth Circuit | 165 |
| [10.18] | K. The Tenth Circuit | 167 |
| [10.19] | L. The Eleventh Circuit | 168 |
| [10.20] | M. The District of Columbia Circuit | 170 |
| [10.21] | IX. The New York Courts..... | 172 |
| [10.22] | X. Oral Direct Authentication—The Supreme Court and the Second Circuit; New York’s Immunity Statute | 174 |
| [10.23] | XI. Advising a Client to Assert the Fifth Amendment Privilege Must Be in Good Faith | 182 |
| Chapter 11 | The Newspaperman’s Privilege | |
| [11.0] | I. Newspaperman’s Privilege | 187 |

| | | | |
|--|------|---|-----|
| [11.1] | II. | The Privilege: How It Was—How It Is Now | 189 |
| [11.2] | III. | The Privilege and Misconduct of Public Officials | 190 |
| [11.3] | IV. | The Privilege, the Courts, the Grand Jury— The First and Sixth Amendments | 192 |
| [11.4] | V. | The Federal Perspective Through the Eyes of the Second Circuit Court of Appeals..... | 197 |
| Chapter 12 Some Purported “Privileges”..... | | | |
| [12.0] | I. | Parent-Child (Family): New York’s Experience | 203 |
| [12.1] | II. | Parent-Child (Family): The Federal Experience..... | 205 |
| [12.2] | III. | Accountant-Client..... | 214 |
| [12.3] | IV. | Pharmacist-Patient | 216 |
| [12.4] | V. | Scholar’s Privilege..... | 216 |
| Chapter 13 Relevancy/Materiality/Legal and Proper Questions | | | |
| [13.0] | I. | Grand Jury Versus Criminal and Civil Trials | 223 |
| [13.1] | II. | Relevancy and All Subpoenas | 226 |
| [13.2] | III. | Legal and Proper Questions..... | 227 |
| Chapter 14 Illegal Wiretapping | | | |
| [14.0] | I. | The Witness | 231 |
| [14.1] | II. | New Technology, the Courts, the Legislatures..... | 232 |
| Chapter 15 The Fourth Amendment as Applied to Grand Juries | | | |
| [15.0] | I. | The Exclusionary Rule Is Inapplicable..... | 237 |
| [15.1] | II. | Subpoenas and the Fourth Amendment..... | 238 |
| [15.2] | III. | Overbreadth | 240 |
| [15.3] | IV. | Bank Records and the Depositor | 243 |
| [15.4] | V. | Jurisdiction..... | 243 |
| [15.5] | VI. | Subpoenas Issued After Indictment..... | 244 |
| [15.6] | VII. | Forthwith Subpoenas <i>Duces Tecum</i> | 246 |
| Chapter 16 Waivers of Immunity | | | |
| [16.0] | I. | The Criminal Procedure Law..... | 249 |
| [16.1] | II. | Case Law Regarding Waivers of Immunity | 255 |
| [16.2] | III. | Notice of When a Defendant May Testify..... | 261 |
| [16.3] | IV. | Defendant’s Grand Jury Witnesses..... | 263 |
| [16.4] | V. | Rights of a Witness While Testifying Under a Waiver..... | 265 |

| | | | |
|--------|------|--|-----|
| [16.5] | VI. | Presence of Counsel in the Grand Jury Room | 267 |
| [16.6] | VII. | Debriefing Agreement | 269 |
| | | Sample Waiver of Immunity..... | 271 |

Chapter 17 The Motion to Quash

| | | | |
|--------|-----|--|-----|
| [17.0] | I. | Subpoenas <i>Ad Testificandum</i> Versus Subpoenas <i>Duces Tecum</i> | 275 |
| [17.1] | II. | Motions to Quash—Timeliness—Mootness..... | 276 |

**Chapter 18 A Topographical Primer on the Institution of the
Grand Jury and That of Its Legal Advisor—
Some Broad Principles**

| | | | |
|--------|-----|--|-----|
| [18.0] | I. | General Principles..... | 281 |
| [18.1] | II. | The Separation of Powers and the Grand Jury | 293 |
| [18.2] | | A. “Orders” of the Prosecutor | 294 |
| [18.3] | | B. “Presentment” | 294 |
| [18.4] | | C. Place Where the Grand Jury Meets | 294 |
| [18.5] | | D. Court, Grand Jury and Prosecutor Independence..... | 294 |

Chapter 19 Contempt and the Grand Jury

| | | | |
|--------|------|---|-----|
| [19.0] | I. | Procedures for Prosecutor and Witness | 305 |
| [19.1] | II. | Admonishing the Evasively Contemptuous Grand Jury Witness..... | 307 |
| [19.2] | III. | The <i>Mens Rea</i> of Testimonial Contempt | 308 |

**Chapter 20 A Fair-Dealing Prosecutor—A Witness Who Obeys His
Oath—The Perjury and Contempt Trap Doctrines**

| | | | |
|--------|-----|--|-----|
| [20.0] | I. | New York’s Experience..... | 313 |
| [20.1] | II. | The Second Circuit Court of Appeals..... | 316 |

Chapter 21 A Transcript of a Mock Grand Jury Session

| | | | |
|--------|------|--|-----|
| [21.0] | I. | Admonishing and Advising as to Immunity, Rights, Duties, Perjury and Contempt | 321 |
| [21.1] | II. | No Right to Waive Immunity | 323 |
| [21.2] | III. | Relevancy (Advice of Counsel)—Statute of Limitations..... | 324 |
| [21.3] | IV. | Religious Beliefs..... | 328 |
| [21.4] | V. | Relevancy | 328 |
| [21.5] | VI. | Attorney-Client Privilege..... | 332 |
| [21.6] | VII. | Mileage Fees, “Target Objections”..... | 333 |

| | | | | |
|------------------------------|--------|--|-----|-----|
| [21.7] | VIII. | Criminal Immunity Need Not Shield One From Administrative Discipline..... | 333 | |
| [21.8] | IX. | Free Speech/Association..... | 336 | |
| [21.9] | X. | The Spousal Privilege | 340 | |
| [21.10] | XI. | Parent-Child-Family Privilege..... | 346 | |
| [21.11] | XII. | Attorney-Client Privilege..... | 347 | |
| [21.12] | XIII. | Materiality/Relevancy..... | 348 | |
| [21.13] | XIV. | Clergy-Penitent Privilege..... | 351 | |
| [21.14] | XV. | Waiver of Immunity | 351 | |
| [21.15] | XVI. | Physician-Patient Privilege..... | 357 | |
| [21.16] | XVII. | Grand Jury Secrecy Objection..... | 358 | |
| [21.17] | XVIII. | Selective Revocation of Waiver | 360 | |
| [21.18] | XIX. | Relevancy | 360 | |
| [21.19] | XX. | Revocation of Waiver..... | 361 | |
| Chapter 22 Conclusion | | | | |
| [22.0] | I. | Conclusion | 365 | |
| Appendix | | | | 367 |
| Table of Authorities | | | | 375 |
| Index..... | | | | 403 |

LAWRENCE N. GRAY, ESQ.

Lawrence N. Gray is a former Special Assistant Attorney General in the appellate section of the Attorney General's Medicaid Fraud Control Unit. He was previously a Special Assistant Attorney General in the Office of the Special State Prosecutor for the Investigation of the New York City Criminal Justice System; prior to that he was an Assistant Attorney General in the Bureau of Real Estate, Securities Fraud and Theatrical Syndications. He began his career as an Assistant District Attorney in Bronx County. Mr. Gray is a 1969 graduate of St. John's University School of Law, where he was an associate editor of the *St. John's Law Review*. His other publications include *Criminal and Civil Contempt: Some Sense of a Hodgepodge*, 72 St. John's Law Review 337 (1998); *Judiciary and Penal Law Contempt in New York: A Critical Analysis*, Brooklyn Law School Journal of Law and Policy, Vol. III, No. 1 (1994); *The Criminal Contempt Handbook*, New York State Criminal Justice Services (2000); *Criminal Contempt Under New York's Penal and Judiciary Laws* (1992); *Direct Examination* (1983); *The Role of Counsel at the Grand Jury* (NYSBA, 1987); *Extradition* (1991); and he is Editor-in-Chief of NYSBA's *New York Criminal Practice Handbook Supplements*.