CONTRACT DOCTRINE AND MARITAL AGREEMENTS IN NEW YORK

SECOND EDITION

ELLIOTT SCHEINBERG, ESQ.

VOLUME ONE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME ONE

Chapter 1	Agreements in General: Principles of Contract Doctrine	1
Chapter 2	Consideration	225
Chapter 3	Failure to Read an Agreement	307
Chapter 4	Late-Date Acknowledgments	317
Chapter 5	Merger and Survival of an Agreement	367
Chapter 6	Arbitration	381
Chapter 7	Severability Clauses	421
Chapter 8	DRL § 240(1-b)(h) Opt-Out Recitals From Statutory Child Support	427
Chapter 9	Modification of Contractual Child Support	493
Chapter 10	Modification of Contractual Spousal Maintenance	533
Chapter 11	Custody, Parenting Time, Religious Upbringing, Name Changes	541
Chapter 12	Pensions and QDROs	559
Chapter 13	Death, Settlement Agreements, and Property Distribution	587
Chapter 14	Agreements to Pay Spousal Maintenance After Remarriage and Death	607
Chapter 15	Third Parties and Third-Party Beneficiaries	657
Chapter 16	Acceleration Clauses, Confidentiality Agreements, Consequential Damages, Lost Profits, and Contractual Interest Rates	687

Chapter 17 Liquidated Damage Clauses 699

Chapter 18 Modification of Agreements..... 715

Chapter 19 Options..... 735

Chapter 20 Specific Performance..... 741

Chapter 21 Reconciliation and Repudiation of Agreements.... 753

Chapter 22 Accord and Satisfaction, Substitution of Agreements 769

Chapter 23 Releases 785

Chapter 24 Unconscionability and Wrongdoing in the Execution of the Agreement 793

VOLUME TWO

Chapter 25 Fiduciary Relationships Among Spouses and Affianced Couples 831

Chapter 26 Conversion Divorces 851

Chapter 27 Ambiguous Agreements 863

Chapter 28 Rescission 955

Chapter 29 Reformation 1073

Chapter 30 Statutes of Limitations..... 1127

Chapter 31 Equitable Estoppel, Laches..... 1209

Chapter 32 General and Specific Mergers Clauses 1227

Chapter 33 Plenary Actions..... 1237

Chapter 34 Family Court..... 1269

Chapter 35 Waivers 1293

Chapter 36 Independent Counsel 1317

Chapter 37 Ratification 1347

Chapter 38 Comity and Bilateral Foreign Divorce Judgments 1375

Chapter 39 Counsel Fees..... 1387

Chapter 40 Allegations in Vacatur Proceedings 1415

Chapter 41 Prenuptial Agreements 1425

Chapter 42 Express Oral Agreements Between Cohabiting Partners 1455

Chapter 43 How Courts Have Construed Contractual Language 1491

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME ONE

Dedications lvii
Acknowledgments lxiii
Introduction..... lxv
About the Author lxvii

Chapter 1 Agreements in General: Principles of Contract Doctrine

[1.0] I. Understanding Advantages of Negotiated Agreements; Public Policy Favors Agreement Over Litigation 3
[1.1] A. Premarital Planning Helps Alleviate Disputes Throughout Marriage..... 3
[1.2] B. Postmarital Planning..... 4
[1.3] C. Documenting Counsel's File Concerning Client's Understanding of Agreement; Laws to Be Considered in the Drafting of Marital Agreements 4
[1.4] D. Allocution of the Parties 5
[1.5] II. The State's Interest in the Marital Relationship, Governed by State Law Not Federal Law..... 6
[1.6] III. Marriage as a Creature of the Legislature; Requirement for Strict Statutory Construction 11
[1.7] IV. The Purpose of a Contract, Stipulations..... 12
[1.8] V. The Essence of a Contract..... 12
[1.9] A. Meeting of the Minds, Actual Acceptance 12
[1.10] B. Course of Conduct 15
[1.11] C. Unilateral Contracts..... 15
[1.12] D. Actual Acceptance of an Agreement..... 16
[1.13] E. Retroactive Effect of an Agreement 17
[1.14] F. Parties Are Not Bound to a Contract That Was Not Delivered Fully Executed..... 18
[1.15] VI. Express Conditions Must Be Literally Performed; Substantial Performance Will Not Satisfy Precedent Conditions 18
[1.16] VII. Competency to Enter Into an Agreement..... 20

[1.17]	VIII.	Implied Covenant of Good Faith	21
[1.18]	IX.	Bad Faith	23
[1.19]	X.	Marriage as a Civil Contract That Results in a Status; Void and Voidable Marriages	24
[1.20]	XI.	Minority and Separation Agreements	30
[1.21]	XII.	No-Fault Divorce Law Grants a Divorce Without a Trial	31
[1.22]	XIII.	When Is the Marriage Contract Over? Annulment Versus Divorce	33
[1.23]	XIV.	The Validity of a Marriage Is Governed Under the Laws of the Jurisdiction Where It Is to Be Celebrated	34
[1.24]	XV.	Common-Law Marriages, Oral Declarations	35
[1.25]	XVI.	Common-Law Marriage States, New York's Marriage Equality Act, the Defense of Marriage Act (DOMA)	40
[1.26]	XVII.	Contract Doctrine and the Common Law; Stare Decisis	41
[1.27]	XVIII.	Statutes and the Common Law	44
[1.28]	XIX.	Prenuptial Agreement Signed Out of State Where Parties Always Lived in New York, but the Agreement Is Silent as to Governing Law	45
[1.29]	XX.	An Agreement Negotiated Between Two States Occurs in the State of Acceptance	47
[1.30]	XXI.	Settlement Agreements Signed in a Foreign Consulate and the Law of Unintended Consequences	48
[1.31]	XXII.	Existing Statutes Are Read Into the Contract	49
[1.32]	XXIII.	Illegal Contracts	49
[1.33]		A. *Malum in Se, Malum Prohibitum*	51
[1.34]		B. Not All Invalid Agreements Are Illegal	55
[1.35]		C. Agreements With Legal and Incidental Illegal Provisions	56
[1.36]	XXIV.	Public Policy and Agreements	56
[1.37]	XXV.	Public Policy and Void, Invalid and Illegal Agreements	66

[1.38]	XXVI.	Subject Matter Jurisdiction, Supreme Court as Court of Original Unlimited Jurisdiction	68
[1.39]	XXVII.	An Agreement That a Spouse Will Not Reside in a Specific Town or County	71
[1.40]	XXVIII.	The Role and Purpose of Equity	72
[1.41]	XXIX.	Parties May Chart the Course of Their Litigation re: Facts, Rules of Law, and Waivers of Rights	73
[1.42]		A. Charting the Facts of Their Case	75
[1.43]		B. Charting the Law of Their Case	75
[1.44]	XXX.	Waiver of Constitutional Rights	77
[1.45]	XXXI.	Parties May Stipulate to Procedure, Jurisdiction, Evidence and Other Rights	78
[1.46]	XXXII.	Parties May Not Consent to Enlarge Time to Take an Appeal	82
[1.47]	XXXIII.	Choice of Law	82
[1.48]		A. New York	82
[1.49]		B. Other States	85
[1.50]	XXXIV.	Forum Selection Clauses	88
[1.51]	XXXV.	Negotiation and Execution of an Agreement in New York Confers Jurisdiction	94
[1.52]	XXXVI.	Force Majeure or *Vis Major*	96
[1.53]	XXXVII.	Third-Party Liability and Obligations	97
[1.54]	XXXVIII.	Conversion Divorces, Invalid Provisions, and *Malum Prohibitum*	98
[1.55]	XXXIX.	Agreements to Alter or Dissolve a Marriage or to Procure a Divorce	99
[1.56]		A. *In re Fleischmann's Estate*	104
[1.57]		B. A Contractual Obligation to Obtain a Religious Divorce Does Not Violate the GOL	106
[1.58]		C. Surrogate Parenting Agreements, DRL § 122	107
[1.59]		D. Marriage Brokerage Contracts	107
[1.60]	XL.	A Stipulation Made During the Preliminary Conference Not to Challenge Grounds for Divorce Is Enforceable	108
[1.61]	XLI.	Molestation Clauses as Independent Covenants Except Where There Is Egregious Conduct; Implied Covenant of Good Faith	109

[1.62] XLII. A Breach of Non-Interference Clause May Not Be Used as a Defense in Enforcement Proceedings 112
[1.63] XLIII. N.Y. Equitable Distribution Law 112
[1.64] A. Effect of Equitable Distribution: Not Applicable to Pre-July 19, 1980, Stipulations During Trial 112
[1.65] B. Specific Waiver of Equitable Distribution Not Needed 114
[1.66] XLIV. Provisions on Child Custody and Visitation; Child Support and Spousal Maintenance 115
[1.67] XLV. DRL § 236B(3), Statutory Vigilance Over Contractual Spousal Maintenance 116
[1.68] XLVI. Origins and Purpose of a Statute of Frauds..... 116
[1.69] A. General Obligations Law § 5-701(a)(1), Performance Within One Year by Both Parties 122
[1.70] B. Requirement of Writing (Statute of Frauds) and Acknowledgment..... 123
[1.71] XLVII. Statute of Frauds: Affirmative Defenses Must Be Pleaded or Are Waived 126
[1.72] XLVIII. Acknowledgment Requirements and Procedural Formalities of DRL § 236B(3)..... 127
[1.73] A. General Requirements 127
[1.74] B. A Prenuptial Agreement May Be Acknowledged in a Foreign Country..... 129
[1.75] C. Waiver of Right of Election Must Be in Writing and Acknowledged..... 131
[1.76] XLIX. Contracts in Consideration of Marriage..... 132
[1.77] L. The Effect of Integration of Several Documents on Writing Requirement 132
[1.78] A. Counterpart Agreements..... 132
[1.79] B. Multiple Related Agreements by the Same Parties 134
[1.80] C. *Applehead Pictures LLC v. Perelman* 137
[1.81] LI. Court Treatment of Oral Agreements Dictated Into the Record in Open Court—First and Second Departments..... 138
[1.82] A. Binding "Open Court" Stipulations: "Open Court" Refers to Judicial Proceedings..... 139

[1.83] B. Stipulations of Settlement and Stipulations of Management of Litigation 145
[1.84] LII. Treatment of Unacknowledged, On-the-Record Agreements 145
[1.85] A. The Second Department 145
[1.86] B. The First Department 148
[1.87] C. The Third and Fourth Departments—Strict Compliance With Formalities Generally Is Required 150
[1.88] D. Inconsistent Applications of DRL § 236B(3) in the Third and Fourth Departments 153
[1.89] E. The Importance of *Matisoff v. Dobi* and Its Construction 154
[1.90] 1. *Matisoff* on Remand 157
[1.91] 2. Other Implications Arising From the Dicta in *Matisoff* 158
[1.92] F. Ratification of an Improperly Acknowledged Agreement 161
[1.93] G. The Departmental Rift on Validity of Oral Stipulations Continues After *Matisoff* 161
[1.94] 1. Second Department 161
[1.95] 2. The First Department Remains Allied With the Second 164
[1.96] H. Questions Raised by Pre-*Matisoff* Cases in the First Department 165
[1.97] I. The Canons of Statutory Construction Support the Third and Fourth Departments 166
[1.98] J. Mandatory, Directory Statutes 169
[1.99] LIII. Exchanged Emails Between Counsel and CPLR 2104 174
[1.100] A. Stipulations During the Preliminary Conference 175
[1.101] B. The Impact of No-Fault Divorce on *Pappas* 176
[1.102] C. No Appeal Lies From a Consent Order or Judgment, Including Consent to Grounds for Divorce 177

[1.103] LIV. Disclosure Before Entering Into Agreements 179
[1.104] LV. Oral Stipulations Requiring Subsequent Written Agreements 179
[1.105] LVI. Agreements to Agree..... 180
[1.106] LVII. Agreements to Mediate 183
[1.107] LVIII. Recitals..... 184
[1.108] LIX. Statement of Intent Is Not Binding; Non-binding Framework Agreements Dictated Into the Record Are Illusory 186
[1.109] LX. Allocution During Settlements, Defense to Action in Legal Malpractice..... 193
[1.110] LXI. Stipulations of Discontinuance and Res Judicata 196
[1.111] A. Res Judicata 196
[1.112] B. A Stipulation of Dismissal Can Have a Res Judicata Effect 198
[1.113] LXII. Contingency Fee Retainers in Matrimonial Actions Are Violative of Public Policy..... 200

Appendix A *Auten v. Auten* 203
Appendix B General Overview of the Evolution of Divorce Law in New York State..... 211
Appendix C Common-Law Marriage States 217
Appendix D States That Have Repealed Common-Law Marriage 221

Chapter 2 Consideration

[2.0] I. Consideration 227
[2.1] II. Promise and Consideration Must Each Be the Motive for the Other..... 229
[2.2] III. Prenuptial Agreements and Postnuptial Agreements Are Governed Under Ordinary Contract Law..... 232
[2.3] IV. Elements of Consideration 236
[2.4] V. The Adequacy and Value of Consideration 240
[2.5] VI. Contractual Forbearance From Commencing a Divorce Action 248
[2.6] A. Waiver and "Absolute" Rights 249
[2.7] B. Consideration..... 251
[2.8] C. Forbearance for a Reasonable Period of Time..... 251

[2.9]		D. Adequacy of Consideration	252
[2.10]		E. Dissolution of Marriage	253
[2.11]		F. N.Y. Statutes §§ 177, 240; DRL § 236B(3)	253
[2.12]		G. Unconscionability and Wrongdoing	255
[2.13]		H. *Kneettle*, *Hurley* and *Avco*	256
[2.14]		I. Conclusion	257
[2.15]		J. *Filstein v. Bromberg*	257
[2.16]	VII.	Transfer of Title to the Marital Residence During the Marriage	258
[2.17]	VIII.	Moral Obligations and Equitable Obligations as Consideration	258
[2.18]	IX.	Illegal Consideration	260
[2.19]	X.	Love and Affection Do Not Constitute Consideration	261
[2.20]	XI.	Consideration Does Not Need Any Particular Terms; It May Be Implied or Inferred	262
[2.21]	XII.	Want of Consideration; Failure of Consideration	264
[2.22]		A. Want of Consideration	264
[2.23]		B. Transfer of Custody as Valid Consideration; Failure of Consideration	266
[2.24]		C. Annulment; Failure of Consideration	267
[2.25]		D. Want of Consideration and Parol Evidence	268
[2.26]	XIII.	Past Consideration	269
[2.27]	XIV.	Discontinuance Is Valid Consideration	270
[2.28]	XV.	Resumption of Marital Relations, Termination of a Pending Divorce Action	270
[2.29]	XVI.	Modifications, Waivers and Releases	273
[2.30]	XVII.	Option Contracts Require Consideration	278
[2.31]	XVIII.	Conditional Promises as Consideration for a Return Promise	278
[2.32]	XIX.	Third Parties Do Not Have Standing to Challenge Agreements Based on Lack of Consideration	280
[2.33]	XX.	Beneficiaries of Insurance Policies	281
[2.34]	XXI.	Guarantors	281
[2.35]	XXII.	GOL § 5-701(a)(3), New York's Marriage Equality Act, the Federal Defense of Marriage Act (DOMA)	282
[2.36]	XXIII.	Debtor and Creditor Law, "Fair Consideration" Versus Common-Law Consideration	284

[2.37] A. Intrafamily Transfers 285
[2.38] B. *Federal Deposit Insurance Co. v. Malin* 286
[2.39] C. *American Surety Co. of New York v. Conner* 287
[2.40] D. *In re Manshul Construction Corp.* 288
[2.41] E. *Rampello v. Cioffi* 289
[2.42] F. Debtor and Creditor Law, Fair Consideration, and Criminally Derived Proceeds 290
[2.43] XXIV. Consideration Is Not Necessary in a Counsel Fee Application Where Security Is Sought Under 22 N.Y.C.R.R. § 1400.5 292
[2.44] XXV. Engagement Rings and the Civil Rights Law: Presumption That Gifts Are in Consideration of Marriage 293
[2.45] XXVI. Engagement Ring; Contract to Marry 298
[2.46] XXVII. Reconveyance of Title to Real Property Given as an Engagement Gift 299
[2.47] XXVIII. When Ring Is Given While One Party Remains Married to Another Spouse 301
[2.48] XXIX. Engagement Gifts Other Than a Ring 304
[2.49] XXX. Engagement Gifts From Third Parties 305

Chapter 3 Failure to Read an Agreement

[3.0] I. Failure to Read an Agreement: Imputation of Knowledge 309
[3.1] II. Illiteracy in the English Language Does Not Mandate Vacatur 315

Chapter 4 Late-Date Acknowledgments

[4.0] I. Late-Date Acknowledgments 319
[4.1] II. Parallel Scheme in the Estates, Powers & Trusts Law and Other Statutes; Mandatory, Directory Statutes 320
[4.2] III. Acknowledgment: A Two-Step Procedure 324
[4.3] A. Acknowledgment May Take Place Anywhere Within the State 325
[4.4] B. Alternate Method of Acknowledgment, by Witnesses 325

[4.5] IV. The Role and Purpose of an Acknowledgment 326
[4.6] V. *Matisoff v. Dobi*..... 330
[4.7] A. Court of Appeals Limits Ruling to the Facts Without Abridging Any Governing Law 330
[4.8] B. What Mr. Dobi Could Have Done, Even Mid-Trial, to Salvage the Agreement 13 Years After It Was Signed..... 333
[4.9] C. Court of Appeals Cites Its Own Precedent Cases, Which Upheld Late-Date Acknowledgments 334
[4.10] D. Decisions Cited in *Matisoff v. Dobi* 334
[4.11] VI. *Maul* and *Warren* 335
[4.12] A. *In re Maul's Estate* 335
[4.13] B. *In re Warren's Estate* 336
[4.14] C. *Warren* Illogically Allowed a Late-Date Acknowledgment by Subscribing Witnesses but Prohibited It Directly by a Party 337
[4.15] D. *Warren*'s Prohibition Against Involuntary Acknowledgments Cannot Persist Following the Dictum in *Matisoff* 338
[4.16] VII. The Court of Appeals Has Previously Permitted Late-Date Acknowledgments 339
[4.17] A. Other Decisions on Late-Date Acknowledgments Cited in *Matisoff v. Dobi* 340
[4.18] B. The First Department..... 340
[4.19] 1. *In re Stegman's Estate* 340
[4.20] 2. *Londin v. Londin* 341
[4.21] 3. *Arizin v. Covello*..... 342
[4.22] 4. *Anonymous v. Anonymous* 342
[4.23] 5. *Application of Saperstein*..... 343
[4.24] 6. *Schoeman, Marsh & Updike v. Dobi* —First Department Summarily Rejects Belated Acknowledgments..... 343
[4.25] 7. *Leighton v. Leighton*; *Kerner-Puritz v. Puritz* 345
[4.26] C. The Second Department 346
[4.27] 1. *Pacchiana v. Pacchiana*..... 346
[4.28] 2. *In re Will of Henken* 346

[4.29] 3. *Detmer v. Detmer* 347
[4.30] 4. *D'Elia v. D'Elia* 347
[4.31] D. The Third Department 348
[4.32] 1. *Hurley v. Johnson* 348
[4.33] 2. *In re Estate of Levinson* 349
[4.34] E. The Fourth Department 349
[4.35] 1. *Galetta v. Galetta* 349
[4.36] 2. *In re Howland's Will* 350
[4.37] VIII. Absence of Specific Time Frame in Real Property Law and Canons of Statutory Construction 353
[4.38] IX. The Laws in Effect 354
[4.39] A. CPLR 4538 354
[4.40] B. The Legislature Is Presumed to Know the Laws in Effect 355
[4.41] X. Unacknowledged Agreements Remain Enforceable Between the Parties in Other Actions 356
[4.42] XI. Acknowledgments and Agreements Under Pre-Equitable Distribution Law 358
[4.43] XII. Agreement Acknowledged Using Pre-1997 Amendment Language Held in Substantial Compliance With the Statute 360

Appendix A Real Property Law § 309-a 363
Appendix B Executive Law § 142-a 365

Chapter 5 Merger and Survival of an Agreement

[5.0] I. Merger Versus Survival 369
[5.1] A. Lack of Decisional Uniformity When an Agreement Is Nonspecific as to Merger or Survival 369
[5.2] B. Second Department 370
[5.3] C. Third Department: From Merger to Survival 371
[5.4] II. Conflicts Between Settlement Agreements and Subsequent Divorce Judgments 372
[5.5] III. Surviving Agreements and Modification of Divorce Decrees 374
[5.6] IV. Correction of a Judgment and Post-Judgment Agreements 375

[5.7] V. Retroactivity of Agreement Incorporated Into Amended Judgment of Divorce 376
[5.8] VI. Estoppel by Conduct Where the Judgment Misstates Intent of the Parties 377
[5.9] VII. Choice of Merger or Incorporation of Separation or Settlement Agreement 379

Chapter 6 Arbitration

[6.0] I. Arbitration—Desirability 383
[6.1] II. Narrow Grounds for Vacatur of an Arbitration Award 387
[6.2] III. The Ability to Arbitrate Child Support Is Subject to Public Policy 387
[6.3] IV. Agreements to Bring Disputes to Religious Tribunals Are Enforceable 388
[6.4] V. Broad Arbitration, Akin to Beth Dins, Is Permissible 389
[6.5] VI. Express and Unequivocal Language Is Required 390
[6.6] VII. Arbitration Contemplates a Broad Range of Remedies by Arbitration Panel 394
[6.7] VIII. Flexibility of Arbitration, Public Policy, Judicial Role 395
[6.8] IX. Agreements With Provisions to Arbitrate and to Litigate 399
[6.9] X. Arbitration May Not Alter the Underlying Agreement 400
[6.10] XI. Absolute Right to Counsel During Arbitration Proceeding, Waivers of Right to Counsel 403
[6.11] XII. Arbitration and Time-Barred Claims 405
[6.12] XIII. Child Custody and Visitation Issues May Not Be Arbitrated 406
[6.13] XIV. Arbitration and Personal Jurisdiction 409
[6.14] XV. Arbitration, Attorney Fees 409
[6.15] XVI. The Right to Arbitration Is Subject to Modification, Waiver, or Abandonment 410
[6.16] XVII. Standard Retention Language in Divorce Judgment Does Not Invalidate Arbitration Provisions 412

[6.17] XVIII. Stays of Arbitration Proceedings 413
[6.18] XIX. Impartiality of a Party Designated Panelist in Tripartite Panels 414
[6.19] A. The Appropriate Standard of Conferencing Among Arbitrators 418
[6.20] B. Disqualification of an Arbitrator Before an Award Is Rendered 419
[6.21] C. Waiver of Right to Object to an Arbitrator 420

Chapter 7 Severability Clauses

[7.0] I. Severability Clauses: A Valid Severability Clause Prevents Failure of Entire Agreement 423

Chapter 8 DRL § 240(1-b)(h) Opt-Out Recitals From Statutory Child Support

[8.0] I. Lack of Uniform Enforcement of the Recital Requirements in DRL § 240(1-b)(h) in Opt-Out Agreements 429
[8.1] A. Public Policy and Purpose 429
[8.2] B. Mandatory Recitals Where Support Deviates From the CSSA; Upward Modifications of Child Support Provisions—*Nichols v. Nichols* 431
[8.3] II. Canons of Statutory Construction: Legislative Intent and Statutory Directive as to Performance of an Act in a Specified Manner 434
[8.4] III. The Role of the Bright-Line Rule Is to Put Parties on Notice 435
[8.5] IV. The Absence of Uniformity in the Enforcement of DRL § 240(1-b)(h) in the Second and Third Departments 436
[8.6] A. The Second Department 437
[8.7] 1. Hearings to Determine "Awareness" of the CSSA 437
[8.8] a. *Savini v. Burgaleta* 438
[8.9] b. *Burgaleta v. Burgaleta* 440

[8.10] c. Express Waivers of Future Child Support and DRL § 240(1-b)(h) 441
[8.11] (1) *O'Connor v. Curcio* and *Williams v. Chapman* 441
[8.12] (2) *Savini v. Burgaleta* 444
[8.13] d. Child Support Provisions in the *Savini* Divorce Judgment Were Also Invalid 444
[8.14] e. *Jefferson v. Jefferson* Correctly Determined the Method of Calculating Child Support De Novo When the Agreement Violates § 240(1-b)(h) 446
[8.15] f. *Luisi v. Luisi* 446
[8.16] g. *Schaller v. Schaller* 447
[8.17] h. *McDermott v. McDermott* 448
[8.18] i. *Victorio v. McBratney* 449
[8.19] j. *Nordgren v. Nordgren* 449
[8.20] k. *Calian v. Calian* 450
[8.21] 2. DRL § 240(1-b)(h): Affirmance by Judicial Estoppel? 450
[8.22] a. *Warnecke v. Warnecke* 450
[8.23] b. *Barany v. Barany* 451
[8.24] 3. COLA Clauses and DRL § 240(1-b)(h) 452
[8.25] B. The Third Department 453
[8.26] 1. Inconsistent Enforcement of Invalid Agreements in the Third Department 453
[8.27] 2. *Young v. Young* 454
[8.28] 3. *Harbour v. Harbour* 457
[8.29] 4. *Clark v. Liska* 458
[8.30] 5. *McColl v. McColl* 460
[8.31] 6. *Du Bois v. Swisher* 461
[8.32] 7. *Fuller v. Witte* 462
[8.33] 8. *Costley v. Martin* 464
[8.34] 9. *Usenza v. Swift*, De Novo Hearing for Failure to Recite the Statutory "Catechism" 465
[8.35] C. Family Court's Implied Authority to Determine an Agreement's Validity 467

[8.36] D. Summary of the Second and Third Departments 468
[8.37] V. *Clark*'s Sua Sponte Affirmative Relief, Not Requested by Either Party, Violated Due Process and Subject Matter Jurisdiction, Rendering Any Relief Void and Unenforceable 468
[8.38] VI. In Addition to Being Jurisdictionally Defective, an Invalid Agreement Constitutes a Per Se Failed Burden of Proof..... 470
[8.39] VII. Alternate Methods of Establishing Awareness of the CSSA..... 472
[8.40] A. The Fourth Department 472
[8.41] B. The First Department..... 473
[8.42] VIII. Child Support Provisions in Compliance With CSSA Do Not Require Recitals 474
[8.43] IX. Where an Agreement Stipulates to Court-Awarded Child Support Following a Trial 475
[8.44] X. Compliance With § 240(1-b)(h) When Child Support Deviates Upward From the Guidelines 476
[8.45] XI. Preserving Arguments of Noncompliance for Appeal..... 476
[8.46] XII. Formulaic Recitation of DRL § 240(1-b)(h) Is Not Key; It Is the Substance of the Statute That Must Be Captured 477
[8.47] XIII. Actual Calculations Must Not Be Spelled Out in the Agreement 478
[8.48] XIV. A Stipulation Must Deduct Maintenance or Set Forth the Reason Therefor 478
[8.49] XV. An Inaccurate Statement Does Not Disqualify the Child Support Provision 478
[8.50] XVI. Noncomplying Child Support Provisions Do Not Vitiate the Entire Settlement Agreement 479
[8.51] XVII. Child Care and Medical Care Add-Ons Fall Under DRL § 240(1-b)(h) 481

[8.52] A. Failure to Comply With DRL § 240(1-b)(h) Does Not Automatically Vitiate the Education Provisions in an Agreement..... 483
[8.53] B. An Invalid Add-On Does Not Vitiate the Entire Child Support Provision..... 486
[8.54] XVIII. When the Reason for the Deviation No Longer Exists 486
[8.55] XIX. Continuation of Child Support Beyond Statutory Period..... 487
[8.56] A. Continuation of Support Beyond Death of Supporting Parent..... 487
[8.57] B. Continuation of Support Beyond the Age of 21 Years 487
[8.58] C. Payment of College-Related Expenses..... 488
[8.59] XX. Availability of Upward Modification of Contractual Child Support 489

Appendix More Cases Pertaining to DRL § 240(1-b)(h)..... 491

Chapter 9 Modification of Contractual Child Support

[9.0] I. Upward Modification of Contractual Child Support; Burden of Proof..... 495
[9.1] II. Upward Modification in Face of a Surviving Agreement..... 495
[9.2] A. *Boden v. Boden*..... 496
[9.3] B. Proposition in *Boden* 498
[9.4] III. *Brescia v. Fitts* 499
[9.5] A. Upward Modifications of Child Support... 499
[9.6] B. The "Unreasonable and Unanticipated Standard" Applies Only to Upward Modifications and Not to Downward Modifications..... 505
[9.7] IV. 2010 Legislation..... 511
[9.8] V. Applicable Standard Where Child Support Provision Is Set Forth in the Judgment but Not the Agreement..... 514
[9.9] VI. Burden of Proof..... 514
[9.10] VII. Parties May Stipulate to the Standards to Apply in Modification Proceedings 514

[9.11] VIII. The Factors for an Upward Modification of Child Support Derived From Order or Judgment 517
[9.12] IX. When Agreement Is Silent re: Payment for Private and College Education 518
[9.13] X. Amendments to the DRL and the FCA Confirm Unavailability of Downward Modification of Child Support in Face of Surviving Agreement Unless Otherwise Provided in Agreement 519
[9.14] A. Erroneous Argument re: Contiguity of First Two Sentences in DRL § 236B(9)(b) 519
[9.15] B. Courts May Not Amend a Statute by Inserting Words That Are Not There..... 520
[9.16] C. The Payor's Remedy 522
[9.17] XI. When Eventuality of Termination of Child Support Is Not Included in the Agreement, Early Case Law Strictly Upholds Contractual Rights 523
[9.18] XII. A Child's Right to Support Supersedes the Contractual Rights of Parent 525
[9.19] XIII. Waiver of Child Support in *Dox v. Tynon*: Express Waiver of Child Support; Implied Waiver Is Forbidden..... 529

Chapter 10 Modification of Contractual Spousal Maintenance

[10.0] I. Modification of Contractual Spousal Maintenance: Showing of Extreme Hardship if Judgment Incorporates Surviving Agreement 535
[10.1] II. Contractual Maintenance When Spouse Is in Danger of Becoming a Public Charge..... 536
[10.2] III. Public Charge, Fair and Reasonable at Time of Making of the Agreement and Not Unconscionable at Time of Entry of Final Judgment 537
[10.3] IV. Standard of Modification When Supreme Court Judgment Is Presented in Family Court..... 538

Chapter 11 Custody, Parenting Time, Religious Upbringing, Name Changes

[11.0] I. Child Custody and Parenting Time Provisions 543
[11.1] II. Standing in Custody and Visitation May Not Be Stipulated Away 544
[11.2] III. Addressing Specific Custody and Access Issues, Radius Clauses 546
[11.3] IV. Joint Custody Agreement Implies Radius Clause to Prevent Relocation 546
[11.4] V. Agreements Regarding Upbringing Are Enforceable 548
[11.5] VI. Custodial Parent Generally Decides Religious Upbringing of Children..... 550
[11.6] VII. Burden of Proof..... 552
[11.7] VIII. Custodial Agreements: Entitled to Less Weight Than Judicial Determinations..... 552
[11.8] IX. Agreements to Artificial Insemination..... 555
[11.9] X. Agreements to Dispose of "Stored Pre-Embryos" Are Specifically Enforceable 556
[11.10] XI. Name Changes, Hyphenated Names..... 558

Chapter 12 Pensions and QDROs

[12.0] I. Pension Benefits and Death Benefits Are Distinct: Federal Law Preemption 561
[12.1] II. Benefits, Election of Benefits, Per the Agreement Only 568
[12.2] III. Waivers of Annuities in Separation or Settlement Agreements Must Be Included in a QDRO 576
[12.3] IV. Pension Waivers in Prenuptial Agreements..... 577
[12.4] V. *Strong v. Dubin*: *Richards* Reversed, Waiver of Rights to Pension Versus Waiver of Rights to Joint and Survivor Benefits..... 580
[12.5] VI. *Strong*'s Reference to Out-of-State Law..... 582
[12.6] VII. Waiver of a 401(K) Savings Plan, Plan Must Be Identified 585

[12.7] VIII. Provision to Designate Irrevocable Beneficiary 586
[12.8] IX. Variable Supplement Fund (VSF) Benefits 586

Chapter 13 Death, Settlement Agreements, and Property Distribution

[13.0] I. Introduction 589
[13.1] II. *In re Estate of Violi* 590
[13.2] III. *In re Barabash* 593
[13.3] IV. *Passmore v. King* 596
[13.4] V. *In re Maguire's Estate* 598
[13.5] VI. The Third Department 599
[13.6] A. *Brower v. Brower* 599
[13.7] B. *In re Estate of Shatraw* 600
[13.8] C. *Schiller v. Schiller*, *Brower* and *Shatraw* Tacitly Abandon *Schiller* 600
[13.9] VII. The First Department: *Beudert-Richard v. Richard* 601
[13.10] VIII. Missed Opportunities to Apply Established Principles of Contract Interpretation in *Violi* and Its Progeny 603
[13.11] IX. Interspousal Transfer of Title to Marital Residence Does Not Determine Property as Separate or Marital 606
[13.12] X. Remarriage by Both Parties Following an Invalid Foreign Divorce Converts Tenancy by the Entirety into Tenancy in Common 606

Chapter 14 Agreements to Pay Spousal Maintenance After Remarriage and Death

[14.0] I. Spousal Maintenance—Determining Appropriate Type, Amount, and Duration of Maintenance 609
[14.1] II. Recent Legislation 610
[14.2] III. Clauses and Conditions 612
[14.3] A. Cohabitation Clauses 612
[14.4] B. Parties May Condition the Termination of Support Upon Any Event 612

[14.5] C. Undefined Generic Term "Cohabitation"; No "Financial Unity" Required 614
[14.6] D. Separate Residences and the Economics of Cohabitation 617
[14.7] 1. *Graev v. Graev* 619
[14.8] a. The Appellate Division 619
[14.9] b. The Dissent 621
[14.10] c. Unanswered Questions in the Majority Opinion 622
[14.11] 2. The Court of Appeals Splits on *Graev* but Holds That Cohabitation Does Not Mean Economic Unity 625
[14.12] IV. "Until the Commencement of an Action" 629
[14.13] V. Spousal Maintenance After Remarriage of the Payee; General Rule of Termination of Spousal Support on Either Party's Death or Remarriage; Agreements to Pay Maintenance After Remarriage 630
[14.14] VI. Continuation of Support After Payor's Death 635
[14.15] A. Earlier Death of Payor Where Agreement Provides Maintenance Only Until Death or Remarriage of Payee Spouse 636
[14.16] B. *Cohen v. Cronin* 636
[14.17] C. *In re Estate of Riconda* 639
[14.18] D. Payments: Support or Property Distribution 643
[14.19] E. Entry of Judgment of Divorce After Death of a Party 644
[14.20] VII. Burden of Proof Rests Upon the Claimant 644
[14.21] VIII. Mutual Releases of Maintenance 645
[14.22] IX. Estates, Powers & Trusts Law 5-1.4 646

Appendix A Cases Where Maintenance Payments Continued After Remarriage 649
Appendix B EPTL 5-1.4 653

Chapter 15 Third Parties and Third-Party Beneficiaries

[15.0] I. Spouse May Mortgage Interest in Property Held as Tenancy by the Entirety; a Nonparty Lacks Standing to Challenge an Agreement to Which He Was Not a Party and May Not Challenge the Mortgage 659

[15.1] A. Capacity to Sue, Standing..... 660

[15.2] B. Standing, Justiciability, Subject Matter Jurisdiction..... 663

[15.3] 1. Subject Matter Jurisdiction 663

[15.4] 2. Justiciability 664

[15.5] 3. The Court of Appeals Holds That Standing Goes to Justiciability..... 665

[15.6] 4. Standing and Justiciability Impact Subject Matter Jurisdiction 666

[15.7] 5. Inconsistent Rulings From the Court of Appeals That Treat Standing as Nonjurisdictional..... 666

[15.8] 6. The First Department: A House Divided..... 667

[15.9] 7. The Third Department: A House United; Standing Goes to Jurisdiction..... 668

[15.10] C. The Second Department, Standing Is Not Jurisdictional: *Wells Fargo Bank Minnesota, National Ass'n v. Mastropaolo*..... 669

[15.11] D. Federal Courts Hold That Standing Goes to Jurisdiction 671

[15.12] E. The Court of Appeals Has Held That a Party "With No Case" Should Not Prevail 672

[15.13] F. Other States, Federal Courts, Standing as Jurisdictional..... 672

[15.14] II. Enforcement of Support-Related Provisions by Third-Party Beneficiaries; Recognition of Third-Party Beneficiaries; Intended and Incidental Beneficiaries..... 674

[15.15] III. Children Generally Lack Standing to Enforce Postnuptial Support Provisions 678

[15.16] IV. Children and Former Spouses as Third-Party Beneficiaries of Life Insurance 679

[15.17] V. Children as Third-Party Beneficiaries for Education Costs 680
[15.18] VI. Third-Party Beneficiary Annuities Distribution to Former Spouse; Third-Party Beneficiary Status Does Not Impose Fiduciary Duty Upon the Third Party 683
[15.19] VII. Repayment of Debt to a Third Party Pursuant to Separation Agreement 684
[15.20] VIII. Third-Party Beneficiary, Incidental Beneficiary 685
[15.21] IX. Later Superseding Agreements 685

Chapter 16 Acceleration Clauses, Confidentiality Agreements, Consequential Damages, Lost Profits, and Contractual Interest Rates

[16.0] I. Acceleration Clauses 689
[16.1] II. Confidentiality Clauses 690
[16.2] III. Consequential Damages, Lost Profits, Unusual Extraordinary Damages 693
[16.3] IV. Statutory Interest Rates, CPLR 5001, DRL § 244 695
[16.4] V. The Phrase "Until the Principal Shall Be Paid" Locks in the Contractual Higher Interest Rate and Supersedes CPLR 5001 in the Event of a Default 697

Chapter 17 Liquidated Damage Clauses

[17.0] I. Liquidated Damages Clauses, Penalty Versus Anticipated Damages 701
[17.1] II. Liquidated Damage Clause in a Retainer Agreement, Nonrefundable Fees and Minimum Fees 708
[17.2] III. Specific Performance, Liquidated Damages Clause or Penalty for Failure to Participate in Religious Divorce; Uncertain and Unascertainable Damages 709
[17.3] IV. Date as of When Damages Are Calculated 712

Chapter 18 Modification of Agreements

[18.0] I. Generally 717
[18.1] II. Oral Modification of Written Separation or Settlement Agreements; Partial Performance 717
[18.2] A. The Doctrine of "Unequivocal Reference" 720
[18.3] B. *Rose*: Partial Performance 721
[18.4] C. Relationship Between Estoppel and Part Performance 723
[18.5] III. Recognition of Executed Oral Agreements..... 731
[18.6] IV. Oral Agreements and Lottery Winnings 733

Chapter 19 Options

[19.0] I. Option Contracts May Not Be Judicially Altered 737

Chapter 20 Specific Performance

[20.0] I. Specific Performance: Time Is of the Essence 743
[20.1] A. Specific Performance of Sale of Property Not Owned at the Time of Agreement but Later Acquired 744
[20.2] B. Specific Performance by the Decedent's Estate 745
[20.3] C. Specific Performance to Participate in a Religious Divorce Proceeding 745
[20.4] II. Enforcement of a Pension Provision Is by QDRO, Not Specific Performance 748
[20.5] III. Time Within Which to Perform—"Time-Is-of-the-Essence" Clause..... 748

Chapter 21 Reconciliation and Repudiation of Agreements

[21.0] I. Reconciliation or Repudiation of an Agreement 755
[21.1] II. Repudiation, Mutual Rescission, and Abrogation of Agreement 761
[21.2] A. Repudiation by Litigation 764

[21.3] B. Repudiation by Self-Help 765
[21.4] C. Anticipatory Breach (Anticipatory Repudiation) 765
[21.5] III. Rejection and Counteroffer 767

Chapter 22 Accord and Satisfaction, Substitution of Agreements

[22.0] I. Finality of Agreements—Subsequent Agreements 771
[22.1] II. Satisfaction of Judgment Extinguishes the Judgment, No Appeal to Vacate the Judgment May Be Had 772
[22.2] III. Accord and Satisfaction: Concept Explained 773
[22.3] IV. The Existence of a Genuine Controversy Is a Critical Component of Accord and Satisfaction 777
[22.4] A. *Chappelow v. Savastano* 778
[22.5] B. *Landau v. Ostrowe* 780
[22.6] V. Burden of Proof 780
[22.7] VI. Substituted Agreement or Novation 780
[22.8] A. Novation as Distinguished From Accord and Satisfaction 783
[22.9] B. Novation as Exception to Parol Evidence 783
[22.10] VII. Acceptance of Payment Conditions Imposed by Payor 783
[22.11] VIII. Executory Accord 784

Chapter 23 Releases

[23.0] I. Releases 787
[23.1] II. Releases and Fraud 790
[23.2] III. Releases and Mutual Mistake 790
[23.3] IV. Burden of Proof to Vacate a Release 791

Chapter 24 Unconscionability and Wrongdoing in the Execution of the Agreement

[24.0]	I.	Unconscionability: *Christian v. Christian*	795
[24.1]		A. Public Policy Favors Upholding Agreements	795
[24.2]		1. Facts in *Christian*	796
[24.3]		2. Under *Christian*, an Imbalanced Agreement, Standing Alone, Is Not Determinative of Unconscionability	799
[24.4]		B. *Hume v. United States*	802
[24.5]		C. *Mandel v. Liebman*	805
[24.6]	II.	Substantive and Procedural Unconscionability	807
[24.7]	III.	*McCoy*: Wrongdoing Remains the Key Factor in the Determination of Unconscionability	809
[24.8]	IV.	*Bloomfield v. Bloomfield*: Court of Appeals Invites the Wife to Pursue a Claim on Unconscionability	811
[24.9]	V.	Three Noteworthy Decisions: *Hardenburgh v. Hardenburgh*, *Turk v. Turk* and *Cantamessa v. Cantamessa*	812
[24.10]	VI.	Voluntary Assumption of Outlandishly Imbalanced Agreement, Public Charge, Want of Consideration, Wrongdoing, and Improvident Agreements.....	814
[24.11]	VII.	Substantive Unconscionable Agreements, One Party Receives All or Almost All.....	816
[24.12]	VIII.	DRL § 236B(3)(3), "Fair and Reasonable" Erroneously Applied	823
[24.13]	IX.	Burden of Proof.....	823
[24.14]	X.	Remittal for a Hearing to Set Aside Financial Provisions of an Agreement Does Not Mandate Reversal of the Judgment of Divorce	824
Appendix A		Cases Following *Christian v. Christian*.....	825
Appendix B		Cases Discussing Improvident Agreements....	829

VOLUME TWO

Chapter 25 Fiduciary Relationships Among Spouses and Affianced Couples

[25.0] I. Fiduciary Relationship Between Spouses—Origin of Fiduciary Duty 833
[25.1] II. Interspousal Dealings Require Utmost Good Faith 835
[25.2] III. Duties Arising From a Fiduciary Relationship: Conflict Between Instinct of the Self and Noble Conduct 842
[25.3] IV. Disclosure by the Fiduciary 845
[25.4] V. Elements of a Cause of Action for Breach of Fiduciary Duty 848
[25.5] VI. Statute of Limitations 849

Chapter 26 Conversion Divorces

[26.0] I. Conversion Divorce: Importance of Parties Living Separate and Apart 853
[26.1] II. Substantial Compliance With the Terms of the Agreement Does Not Mean Absolute Compliance, Although It Must Relate to the Essential Duties 857
[26.2] III. Does a Parenting Plan Constitute a "Written Agreement of Separation" Under DRL § 170(6)? 861

Chapter 27 Ambiguous Agreements

[27.0] I. Contract Doctrine, the Common Law, and Statutory Law 865
[27.1] II. Interpretation and Construction of an Agreement Distinguished 865
[27.2] III. Doctrine of Definiteness 866
[27.3] A. Clarity and Predictability 867
[27.4] B. Meeting of the Minds, Actual Acceptance 872
[27.5] C. Ambiguity, Reasonably Susceptible of Only One Meaning 872

[27.6]	IV.	The Best Evidence of Intention of Parties in an Unambiguous Agreement Is Derived From the Four Corners of the Agreement	874
[27.7]	V.	Threshold Determination of Ambiguity and Construction of Ambiguous Agreements Are Issues of Law for the Court	878
[27.8]	VI.	Extrinsic Evidence and Parol Evidence	880
[27.9]	VII.	The Absence or Failure of Extrinsic Evidence	890
[27.10]	VIII.	Extrinsic, Parol Evidence: Finding of Ambiguity Is Required Before Rules Governing Construction of Ambiguous Contracts May Be Applied	892
[27.11]	IX.	Parol Evidence and Conditional Delivery of an Agreement	893
[27.12]		A. Conditional Delivery; Delivery of the Contract May Be a Condition Precedent	893
[27.13]	X.	Reasonably Implied	895
[27.14]	XI.	A Statement of Intent Is Neither Ambiguous nor Binding	896
[27.15]	XII.	Fair Meaning to All Words, Phrases and Language Employed, All Provisions Must Be Considered; Apparent Meaning, Apparent Purpose	897
[27.16]	XIII.	Courts May Neither Revise nor Redesign an Agreement: Foreseeable Contingencies the Parties Did Not Include	901
[27.17]	XIV.	Reasonable Expectations, Reasonable Person, Practical Interpretations	910
[27.18]	XV.	Absurd or Unusual Results to Be Rejected	915
[27.19]	XVI.	Conflicts Between Sections of an Agreement: Every Provision Should Be Given Effect	916
[27.20]	XVII.	Latent Ambiguity	917
[27.21]	XVIII.	Vague Terms, Omission of an Essential Term, and Indeterminate Time Periods	919
[27.22]	XIX.	Silence in an Agreement	919
[27.23]		A. Silence Does Not Create Ambiguity	920
[27.24]		B. Silence Regarding Spousal Maintenance, Discovery	920

[27.25] C. Private Versus Public Secondary Education, Standard of Review Where Agreement Is Silent re: Education/College Costs 921
[27.26] D. Silence as to Pensions 921
[27.27] E. Silence as to Carrying Charges of the Marital Residence Following the Termination of Exclusive Occupancy 922
[27.28] F. Silence as to Counsel Fees 922
[27.29] XX. The Role of Recitals in Ambiguous Agreements 923
[27.30] XXI. Specific Provisions Restrict General Provisions 923
[27.31] XXII. *Noscitur a Sociis*, the Company Words Keep ... 925
[27.32] XXIII. Words and Meaning 925
[27.33] A. Dictionary Definitions 926
[27.34] B. Intent Versus Grammar 927
[27.35] C. Transposition, Rejection, and Addition of Words to Implement the Intent 928
[27.36] D. Subjective, Undisclosed Meanings 928
[27.37] E. Intent From Words Used in a Dictated Stipulation Into the Record 930
[27.38] F. Words, Circumstances, and the Nature of the Obligation 930
[27.39] G. Uniquely Defined Words and Terms 931
[27.40] H. Literal Language May Not Be Used if It Subverts the Purpose of the Agreement 931
[27.41] I. Intent, as the Essence of an Agreement, Governs Legal and Technical Terms 934
[27.42] XXIV. Omissions and Mistakes or Omitted Contingencies Do Not Constitute an Ambiguity 934
[27.43] XXV. Summary Judgment to Dismiss a Complaint to Set Aside an Agreement 935
[27.44] XXVI. The Doctrine of Practical Construction, the Parties' Course of Performance: Ambiguity Is a Prerequisite 937
[27.45] XXVII. Parol Custom and Usage of Language 939
[27.46] XXVIII. *Contra Proferentem*: Ambiguities Are Construed Against the Draftor 939
[27.47] XXIX. When "Divorce" Is Not Mentioned as an Eventuality in a Prenuptial Agreement 942
[27.48] A. *Van Kipnis*: The Court of Appeals 945

[27.49] B. *Vendome v. Vendome* 945
[27.50] C. Unstated Principles in *Van Kipnis*, Law in Effect at the Time and the Place of the Contract, and Public Policy Changes 946
[27.51] XXX. Contractual Obligations Are Construed as of the Law in Effect on the Date Made and, Barring Public Policy Concerns, Remain Unaffected by Subsequent Law 948
[27.52] XXXI. Handwritten Changes to a Printed Agreement Supersede the Printed Original..... 950
[27.53] XXXII. Uncapped Minimum Amounts in an Agreement 951
[27.54] XXXIII. Trial Court's Interpretation Is Not Conclusive Upon Appellate Court 951
[27.55] XXXIV. A Harsh Construction of an Agreement or One That Leaves One Party at the Other's Mercy Is Disfavored..... 952

Chapter 28 Rescission

[28.0] I. Equitable Relief as Sound Judicial Discretion 957
[28.1] II. Prevalence of Vacatur Proceedings..... 957
[28.2] III. Sanctions for Frivolous Suits to Vacate Agreements 958
[28.3] IV. No Grace Period to Rescind Agreement Once It Is Signed, Disavowal of an Agreement Before Order Is Signed..... 959
[28.4] V. Grounds for Setting Aside Agreements 960
[28.5] VI. Voidable Agreements: Fraud, Misrepresentation, Duress..... 963
[28.6] VII. Rescission, Equitable Relief; Elementary Duty Between Contracting Parties 963
[28.7] A. Rescission Is Not Available if There Is an Adequate Remedy at Law..... 965
[28.8] B. Right to Financial Disclosure Following an Agreement; Support Fixed by Agreement 965
[28.9] C. Rescission for Substantial or Fundamental Breaches..... 970
[28.10] D. Rescission and Executory Agreements..... 972

[28.11] E. Notice to Rescind 972
[28.12] F. Restoration of Status Quo, Executed and Executory Agreements 974
[28.13] G. Burden of Proof to Rescind an Agreement 977
[28.14] H. Burden of Proof; Motions for Summary Judgment to Vacate an Agreement..... 979
[28.15] I. Rescission Based on Fraud—Elements of Fraud..... 980
[28.16] J. Promisor's State of Mind..... 982
[28.17] K. Pleading Fraud in the Inducement in an Annulment Action: Ordinary Prudent-Person Standard 986
[28.18] L. Standard to Establish Fraud in the Inducement in an Annulment Action, Ordinary Prudent Person 988
[28.19] M. Reliance 988
[28.20] N. The Plaintiff's Reliance on the Misrepresentation Must Have Been Justifiable..... 989
[28.21] O. Parol Evidence and Fraud..... 989
[28.22] P. Specificity of Allegations Based on Fraud 989
[28.23] 1. A Party's Failure to Reduce an Agreement to an Accurate Writing 991
[28.24] 2. Measure of Compensating a Defrauded Party, Punitive Damages..... 991
[28.25] 3. Fraud in the Inducement; Burden of Proof Rests Upon the Party Alleging Fraud 992
[28.26] 4. Innocent Misrepresentations 993
[28.27] 5. No Vacatur of a Judgment on Fraud Where Knowledge of Fraud Was Known Before Entry of Judgment 994
[28.28] VIII. Breach Versus Rescission; Subsequent Conduct Cannot Render an Agreement Invalid at Its Inception 994
[28.29] IX. Constructive Fraud: Scienter Distinguishes Constructive Fraud From Actual Fraud 996
[28.30] X. Concealment as Fraud; Duty to Speak..... 997

[28.31] XI. Fraudulent Concealment Requires Additional Allegations of Duty to Disclose 1001
[28.32] XII. Special Facts Doctrine: Knowledge Peculiar to One Party; Fiduciary Relationships Among Spouses and Affianced Couples 1002
[28.33] XIII. *Kojovic v. Goldman*: Scienter and Marital Agreements 1003
[28.34] A. The Court's Reasoning 1004
[28.35] B. *Kojovic*'s Omissions 1006
[28.36] C. The Cases Cited in *Kojovic* Did Not Support Its Conclusion 1007
[28.37] XIV. *Paolino v. Paolino*: Is the Second Department Following *Kojovic*? 1009
[28.38] A. *Etzion v. Etzion* 1009
[28.39] B. *Sweeney v. Sweeney*; *Label v. Label* 1011
[28.40] XV. Remedies for the Defrauded Party 1012
[28.41] XVI. Due Diligence During Contract Negotiations 1013
[28.42] A. Reliance: Duty to Exercise Ordinary Care, Blind Reliance, Justifiable Reliance 1013
[28.43] B. Equitable Relief for Mistake or Fraud Is Not Available for Conscious Ignorance or Conscious Negligence 1015
[28.44] XVII. Misrepresentation of Law and Fraud 1018
[28.45] XVIII. Statements by Counsel Dealing With Unrepresented Parties 1022
[28.46] XIX. Duress 1023
[28.47] XX. Two-Prong Test to Prove Duress 1026
[28.48] XXI. A Prompt Challenge Is Required to Vacate an Agreement Procured Under Duress 1026
[28.49] A. Continuing Duress: Statute of Limitations, Proof of Continuing Wrongdoing Required 1028
[28.50] B. Burden of Proof to Establish Continuing Duress 1030
[28.51] XXII. Badgering, Threats to Litigate, Yelling, Pressure, Refusal to Negotiate 1030
[28.52] XXIII. Last-Minute Execution of an Agreement 1033
[28.53] XXIV. Threats of Imprisonment or Criminal Prosecution Render an Agreement Voidable 1033

[28.54] XXV. Subjective Fear Absent Any Wrongdoing by the Other Party Does Not Constitute Duress ... 1035
[28.55] A. Judicial Coercion; Effect of Judicial Pressure to Settle Cases 1036
[28.56] B. The Purpose of a Conference With the Court 1038
[28.57] C. Courts May Not Compel Stipulations 1041
[28.58] XXVI. Counsel's Encouragement and Assurances to Accept the Terms of an Agreement 1042
[28.59] XXVII. Undue Influence 1043
[28.60] XXVIII. Overreaching 1045
[28.61] XXIX. Challenges to Agreement Based on Lack of Mental Capacity or Emotional Stress During Negotiations 1046
[28.62] XXX. Disclaimers of Fraud, Duress, and Overreaching 1055
[28.63] XXXI. Economic Duress 1056
[28.64] XXXII. Husband's Coercion by Withholding Religious Divorce, Threats of Religious Ostracism 1058
[28.65] A. Religious Coercion by Withholding a Religious Divorce 1058
[28.66] B. Threats of Religious Ostracism 1059
[28.67] XXXIII. Standard of Vacatur of a Judgment Incorporating an Agreement 1060
[28.68] XXXIV. Vacatur of an Agreement Upon a Failure to Establish Grounds for Divorce—Second Department 1062
[28.69] XXXV. Rescission Is Available, Whether a Mutual or Unilateral Mistake, Only When the Mistake Goes to the Foundation of Agreement, Time of the Mistake 1063
[28.70] XXXVI. Rescission and Unilateral Mistake, Lack of Uniformity—Unilateral Mistake, Even Without Inequitable Conduct, May Result in Rescission When the Mistake Leads to Unconscionable Result or Unjust Enrichment 1065
[28.71] XXXVII. Unjust Enrichment and Unilateral Mistake..... 1066
[28.72] XXXVIII. Unconscionability or Other Equitable Consideration and Unilateral Mistake as a Basis for Relief 1067

[28.73] XXXIX. Mistake as to Misunderstanding of the Law; Unilateral Mistake by a Party's Counsel in Dictating an Agreement 1068

Appendix Cases Discussing Denial of Broad Financial Disclosure Absent Proof of Invalid Agreement 1071

Chapter 29 Reformation

[29.0] I. Nature and Purpose 1075
[29.1] II. Mistake, Unilateral and Mutual..... 1076
[29.2] III. Reformation Not Available Due to Attorney Error 1080
[29.3] IV. Reformation Versus Modification..... 1080
[29.4] V. Degree of Proof Necessary for Reformation... 1081
[29.5] A. Parol and Extrinsic Evidence..... 1081
[29.6] B. CPLR 3005 1084
[29.7] VI. Scrivener Error, Reformation; Statute of Limitations 1086
[29.8] VII. Mutual Mistake: Basis for Rescission, Reformation..... 1087
[29.9] A. *Simkin v. Blank*, Bernard Madoff 1092
[29.10] B. *Simkin*: Complaint 1092
[29.11] C. Mutual Mistake..... 1093
[29.12] D. Releases, Mutual Mistake..... 1094
[29.13] E. Equal Distribution..... 1095
[29.14] F. Illegal Transactions..... 1096
[29.15] G. CPLR 3016(b): Particularity..... 1097
[29.16] H. Indistinctive Semantics..... 1097
[29.17] I. The Dictionaries 1098
[29.18] J. *Etzion*'s Irrelevance 1098
[29.19] K. Conclusion 1099
[29.20] L. *Simkin* on Appeal..... 1099
[29.21] VIII. *Simkin*: The Court of Appeals 1101
[29.22] IX. Fraud Versus Mistake 1104
[29.23] X. Mutual Mistake Renders a Portion of an Agreement Impossible or Impracticable 1105
[29.24] XI. Contract Governing Specific Subject Matter, Quasi Contract..... 1105
[29.25] XII. Unjust Enrichment as a Quasi-Contract Claim 1106

[29.26] XIII. Failure of Counsel to Inform Client of Details Is Chargeable to the Client 1108
[29.27] XIV. Contractual Obligations and Tort..... 1108
[29.28] XV. The Tort of Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress 1112
[29.29] XVI. Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress Does Not Extend to Matrimonial Cases..... 1115
[29.30] XVII. Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress, Cohabitating Couples..... 1116
[29.31] XVIII. Fraud as a Separate Claim..... 1118
[29.32] XIX. Indemnification, Exculpatory Clauses in Marital Agreements—*Gottlieb v. Such*..... 1120

Chapter 30 Statutes of Limitations

[30.0] I. Statute of Limitations..... 1129
[30.1] II. Societal Interest and Public Policy; Benefits of the Statute of Limitations..... 1131
[30.2] III. The Second Department Holds That the Six-Year Limitations Period Does Not Apply to Motions 1134
[30.3] A. Upsetting CPLR 213(2)..... 1134
[30.4] B. Public Policy and Limitations Periods 1135
[30.5] C. Statutory Prohibition Against Contractual Extension of Limitations Periods 1136
[30.6] D. Breach of Contract..... 1137
[30.7] E. Actions Versus Motions 1137
[30.8] F. Plenary Actions 1137
[30.9] G. *Fragin v. Fragin* 1138
[30.10] H. *Bayen v. Bayen* 1138
[30.11] I. *Denaro v. Denaro*..... 1139
[30.12] J. Statutory Construction 1140
[30.13] K. *Anonymous v. Anonymous*..... 1142
[30.14] IV. Parties Not Entirely Free to Waive or Modify Statute of Limitations; GOL § 17-103 1144
[30.15] V. Time of Accrual of the Limitations Period When Final Payment Is Subject to a Condition..... 1146
[30.16] VI. Statute of Limitations for Reformation and Rescission—Actual Fraud and Constructive Fraud; Six-Year Period; Burden of Proof..... 1148

[30.17] VII. Wrongful Restraint From Commencing an Action 1150
[30.18] VIII. Statute of Limitations for a Claim Based on Constructive Fraud 1152
[30.19] IX. Statute of Limitations for Reformation; Scrivener's Error 1153
[30.20] X. Determining Limitations Period, Elements Alleged Not the Plaintiff's Theory of the Claim 1153
[30.21] A. *Powers Mercantile Corp.* and *Erbe* 1153
[30.22] B. *Chayes v. Chayes* 1155
[30.23] C. Declaratory Judgment to Enforce a Contract 1156
[30.24] XI. Escalation Clauses 1158
[30.25] XII. Revival of Debt 1159
[30.26] XIII. Recognition of and Intent to Pay a Debt 1160
[30.27] XIV. Part Payment 1163
[30.28] XV. Application of Debt, Debtor Gets First Choice; Presumption; Absence of Election..... 1165
[30.29] XVI. Summary Judgment by Creditor Where No Election Made by Either Party 1166
[30.30] XVII. Time-Barred Claims as Setoffs 1166
[30.31] A. N.Y. Domestic Relations Law § 250..... 1166
[30.32] B. History Behind Time-Barred Setoffs..... 1167
[30.33] XVIII. Diligence in Discovery of Fraud; Limitations Period Begins to Run When Defrauded Party Has Sufficient Operative Facts..... 1169
[30.34] XIX. The Burden of Proof, Date of Discovery of Fraud 1170
[30.35] XX. Statute of Limitations Versus Integral Statutory Components 1170
[30.36] XXI. Statute of Limitations, Continuing Obligations, Installment or Periodic Payments, Demand Notes, and Guaranties 1172
[30.37] XXII. Statute of Limitations and Marital Agreements—DRL § 250 1174
[30.38] XXIII. History Behind DRL § 250—Public Policy Re-tolling of the Statute of Limitations for Prenuptial Agreements—Clash of Policies: Marriage Versus Statute of Limitations 1176
[30.39] XXIV. Departmental Conflict 1178

Appendix The Marriage Toll: Pre-DRL § 250 Tolling of Limitations Period During Marriage 1179

Chapter 31 Equitable Estoppel, Laches

[31.0] I. Equitable Estoppel 1211
[31.1] II. Burden of Proof Is on the Plaintiff to Show Due Diligence 1214
[31.2] III. Judicial Estoppel 1214
[31.3] IV. Judicial Estoppel and Collateral Estoppel..... 1218
[31.4] V. Quasi Estoppel 1219
[31.5] VI. Reliance..... 1219
[31.6] VII. *Bates v. Long Island Railroad Co.* 1221
[31.7] VIII. Laches 1221
[31.8] IX. Laches Are Inapplicable to Actions in Law..... 1225

Chapter 32 General and Specific Mergers Clauses

[32.0] I. General and Specific Mergers—Fraud 1229
[32.1] II. General Merger Clauses and Parol Evidence..... 1230
[32.2] III. Specific Merger Clauses, Extrinsic Evidence, Disclaimer of Reliance..... 1232
[32.3] IV. Merger Clause and Mistake 1235
[32.4] V. Merger Exception Subject to Exercise of Ordinary Intelligence, Peculiarly Not Within the Party's Knowledge 1235

Chapter 33 Plenary Actions

[33.0] I. Action and Order to Show Cause Distinguished 1239
[33.1] II. Incorporated and Unmerged Agreements 1240
[33.2] III. Effect of a Modification to a Surviving Divorce Judgment 1241
[33.3] IV. An Unmerged Agreement Is an Independent Contract, Enforcement by Plenary Action Only..... 1242
[33.4] V. Enforcement of a Charging Lien Does Not Require a Plenary Action 1246

[33.5] VI. Expedited Challenges to and Enforcement of Settlement Agreements, Right to an Expedited Challenge to Agreements Within the Action 1246
[33.6] A. Historical Perspective 1247
[33.7] B. Action Not Terminated by Agreement Absent an Express Discontinuance or Entry of Judgment Pursuant to Stipulation 1248
[33.8] C. Challenges and Enforcements 1252
[33.9] VII. Post-Judgment Motions: Challenge Versus Enforcement of a Contract 1252
[33.10] VIII. In Personam Jurisdiction Acquired by Summons and Complaint 1256
[33.11] IX. Non-filing of Papers Necessary to Institute an Action Is a Nonwaivable Jurisdictional Defect 1258
[33.12] A. Improper Post-Judgment Commencements Upheld: *Gaines*, *Dunham*, *Didley*, *Brender* 1259
[33.13] B. Conclusion 1261

Appendix Cases Where Failure to Commence a Plenary Action Was Fatal to the Application 1263

Chapter 34 Family Court

[34.0] I. Family Court as a Court of Limited Jurisdiction 1271
[34.1] A. Subject Matter Jurisdiction 1271
[34.2] B. Restrictions 1272
[34.3] C. *Johna M.S.*: Improper Attempt to Confer Subject Matter Jurisdiction Upon the Family Court 1278
[34.4] D. *Barnett v. Burger*: Family Court May Rule on Alternate Permissible Grounds and Avoid Jurisdictionally Defective Grounds 1279
[34.5] E. Determination of Tax Consequences Outside of Family Court's Jurisdiction 1280
[34.6] II. Family Court May Modify Child Support Emanating From an Unmerged Agreement 1281

[34.7] III. Decisions Permitting Family Court to Interpret Agreements and to Modify a Judgment of Divorce *Nunc Pro Tunc* 1284
[34.8] A. *Mahoney v. Goggins* 1284
[34.9] B. *Moss v. Moss* 1287
[34.10] C. *Falguni P. v. Pinakin P.* 1287
[34.11] IV. Cases That Erroneously Upheld Family Court Decisions Which Exceeded Their Subject Matter Jurisdiction by Interpreting Contractual Terms 1288
[34.12] A. *Mahoney v. Goggins* 1288
[34.13] B. *Schiano v. Hirsch* 1289
[34.14] C. *Stearns v. Stearns* 1289
[34.15] D. *Reeves v. Samson* 1289
[34.16] E. *Mancini v. Mormile* 1290
[34.17] F. *Scalabrini v. Scalabrini* 1291
[34.18] G. *Abidi v. Antohi* 1291
[34.19] H. *Saidel v. Wolk* 1292
[34.20] V. Enforcement of Separation Agreements in Civil Court 1292

Chapter 35 Waivers

[35.0] I. Waivers, Generally; Waiver of Discovery and Recitation of Knowledge of Right to Counsel 1295
[35.1] II. Waivers, Express or Implied, Silence and Inaction May Be Determinative 1296
[35.2] III. A Waiver Must Be a Voluntary and Intentional Abandonment of a Known Right 1301
[35.3] IV. Acceptance of Late Payment Waives Right to Strict Compliance 1304
[35.4] V. Waiver of Nonwaiver Clauses 1305
[35.5] VI. Abandonment in Easements and Real Estate Is Instructive 1308
[35.6] VII. Distinction Between Waiver and Estoppel 1310
[35.7] VIII. Modification and Waiver Distinguished 1311
[35.8] IX. Provisions of First Agreement Survive a Subsequent Agreement if Not Specifically Modified in the Subsequent Agreement 1315

Chapter 36 Independent Counsel

[36.0]	I.	Effect of Independent Counsel; Counsel Is Not Required for Valid Agreement; Failure to Seek Counsel Does Not Provide Ground for Vacatur	1319
[36.1]	II.	Self-Representation, Agreement Binding, No Overreaching	1323
[36.2]	III.	The Effect of One Attorney Representing Both Parties, Overreaching	1326
[36.3]	IV.	Appellate Division "Condemns" Dual Representation, Inference of Overreaching	1329
[36.4]	V.	Direct Communication With Formerly Represented Party	1330
[36.5]	VI.	Where a Party Was Represented by Counsel, Reconciliation Agreement Was Void Where Counsel Was Not Present	1331
[36.6]	VII.	Ineffective Representation	1331
[36.7]	VIII.	Representation Does Not Preclude Claim for Duress or Overreaching	1334
[36.8]	IX.	Actual Representation Generally Precludes Later Claims of Wrongdoing or Lack of Comprehension of the Agreement	1335
[36.9]	X.	An Opposing Counsel's Recommendation of an Attorney Is Not Fatal	1339
[36.10]		A. Sufficient Time to Review the Agreement	1339
[36.11]		B. Paying for Other Party's Counsel Does Not Per Se Constitute Overreaching	1340
Appendix		Cases Discussing a Party's Failure to Seek Independent Counsel	1341

Chapter 37 Ratification

[37.0]	I.	Void and Voidable Agreements, Ratification	1349
[37.1]	II.	Ratification of Agreement as Affirmative Defense; Nature of Ratification, Methods of Ratification	1350
[37.2]	III.	Ratification of a Voidable Marriage	1355
[37.3]	IV.	No Ratification if a Party's Mental Disability Is Attributable to Overreaching and Abuse by the Other Party	1357

[37.4] V. Ratification of an Improperly Acknowledged Agreement 1357
[37.5] VI. Ratification of Void or Voidable Agreements Due to Fraud or Mistake 1357
[37.6] A. Ratification 1358
[37.7] B. Continuing Duress 1358
[37.8] VII. Timeliness of Challenge to Void or Voidable Agreements; Prompt Challenge Generally Required 1360
[37.9] VIII. Unequal and Improvident Agreements; Changes of Heart 1361
[37.10] IX. Ratification Following an Anticipatory Breach 1365

Appendix A Ratification and a Failure to Timely Seek Its Nullification 1367
Appendix B Vacatur Unavailable Over Regrets for Improvident or Unwise Bargaining 1369
Appendix C Ratification by Time 1371

Chapter 38 Comity and Bilateral Foreign Divorce Judgments

[38.0] I. Comity and Collateral Attacks on Bilateral Foreign Divorce Judgments 1377
[38.1] II. Intrinsic and Extrinsic Fraud 1380
[38.2] A. *Fickling v. Fickling* 1382
[38.3] B. *Fraguela v. Fraguela* 1383
[38.4] C. *Schaeffer v. Schaeffer* 1383
[38.5] D. *Denis v. Denis* 1384
[38.6] E. *Cofresi v. Cofresi* 1384
[38.7] F. *Altman v. Altman* 1384

Chapter 39 Counsel Fees

[39.0] I. Counsel Fees as Creatures of the Legislature; Strict Construction; Fees Are Unavailable in Actions to Vacate Agreements 1389
[39.1] II. Counsel Fees in the Face of a Contractual Provision; Contractual Silence as to Counsel Fees 1395
[39.2] A. Prevailing Party and Contractual Counsel Fee Awards 1396

[39.3] B. Indemnification of Counsel Fees May Be Gleaned From Overall Language 1400
[39.4] C. An Agreement to Obtain an Amicable Divorce 1400
[39.5] D. *Kessler v. Kessler*: Counsel Fees in the Face of a Prenuptial Agreement 1401
[39.6] E. Construing *Kessler* 1406
[39.7] F. When Attorney Fees Are Not Specified in the Agreement 1408
[39.8] III. Specificity of a Retainer Agreement 1409
[39.9] IV. Fees on Fees 1410
[39.10] V. Settlement Agreement Including Provisions to Pay Own Attorney Fees; Duty of an Attorney to Deal Honestly 1411
[39.11] A. Attorney Fee Arrangements..... 1412
[39.12] B. Discharged Counsel, With and Without Cause 1413

Chapter 40 Allegations in Vacatur Proceedings

[40.0] I. The Prima Facie Case and Evidentiary Burden in Setting Aside an Agreement..... 1417
[40.1] II. Benefits of Defending Vacatur Action by Summary Judgment Motion..... 1419
[40.2] III. Courts Must Examine Evidentiary Facts in Ruling on Summary Judgment..... 1420
[40.3] IV. Treatment of a Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim as a Motion for Summary Judgment 1422

Chapter 41 Prenuptial Agreements

[41.0] I. Prenuptial Agreements 1427
[41.1] A. Recognition of Prenuptial Agreements as Binding Contracts..... 1427
[41.2] B. Interpreting the Agreement..... 1430
[41.3] II. Procedural Requirements of N.Y. Domestic Relations Law § 236B(3) (DRL) Must Have Been Met 1432
[41.4] III. The Effect of Lack of Independent Representation by Counsel..... 1432

[41.5] IV. Insistence on Financial Terms at the Pain of Canceling the Wedding 1433
[41.6] V. The Effective Date of a Marital Agreement..... 1433
[41.7] VI. Vacatur of a Prenuptial Agreement Due to Fraud, Concealment, or Other Deception; Evidentiary Burden of Proof Rests Upon the Party Seeking Vacatur 1435
[41.8] A. *In re Greiff*: There Is No Shift in the Burden of Proof to Vacate a Prenuptial Agreement 1436
[41.9] B. Burden of Proof 1439
[41.10] C. *Greiff* on Remand 1444
[41.11] VII. Criteria for Probable Undue Influence and Unfair Advantage 1446
[41.12] VIII. Attack on Specific Clauses in Prenuptial Agreements—Waiver of Spousal Maintenance..... 1447
[41.13] IX. Waiver of Estates Rights 1448
[41.14] X. Failure to Disclose Income or Assets..... 1450
[41.15] XI. Estate Tax Consequences From Gifts in Prenuptial Agreements 1452
[41.16] A. Sufficient Time to Review the Agreement..... 1452
[41.17] B. Paying for Other Party's Counsel Does Not Per Se Constitute Overreaching..... 1453
[41.18] C. Sunset Clauses 1453
[41.19] D. New York's Marriage Equality Act, the Federal Defense of Marriage Act (DOMA), Choice of Law 1453

Chapter 42 Express Oral Agreements Between Cohabiting Partners

[42.0] I. Express Oral Agreements Between Cohabiting Partners..... 1457
[42.1] A. *Morone v. Morone* 1458
[42.2] B. The Court of Appeals Reversed 1459
[42.3] C. Implied Contract Is Not Valid 1460
[42.4] D. New York's Marriage Equality Act, The Federal Defense of Marriage Act (DOMA), Express Oral Agreements, Public Policies of Other States 1462
[42.5] II. No Interim Support for Nonmarried Parties 1463

[42.6] III. "I Will Always Take Care of You" 1463
[42.7] A. Lawful and Unlawful Objectives; Distilling Lawful From Unlawful Purposes 1464
[42.8] B. *Donnell v. Stogel* 1470
[42.9] 1. The Plaintiff's Extensive Contributions 1470
[42.10] 2. Written Compensation Package 1471
[42.11] 3. Illegality of Consideration Was Small 1471
[42.12] IV. Past Consideration 1472
[42.13] V. Burden of Proof to Establish Express Agreement 1472
[42.14] VI. Constructive Trust and Cohabiting Partners ... 1473
[42.15] VII. Quantum Meruit for Domestic Services 1478
[42.16] VIII. Constructive Trust Also Applies to Contributions of Time, Effort, and Money 1480
[42.17] IX. Statute of Frauds: Partnership Agreement, Partial Performance 1481
[42.18] X. Partnership at Will 1481
[42.19] XI. Written Agreements Among Domestic Partners—*Gonzalez v. Green*: The Facts 1484
[42.20] A. The Defendant's Theory 1485
[42.21] B. Ruling, Express Agreement 1485
[42.22] C. Mutual Mistake 1487
[42.23] D. Conclusion 1489

Chapter 43 How Courts Have Construed Contractual Language

[43.0] I. Language Used in Agreements 1493
[43.1] A. "This Agreement Is Binding Upon . . ." ... 1493
[43.2] B. "This Agreement Shall Be Governed and Construed in Accordance With the Laws of the State of New York in Force at the Date of the Execution of This Agreement" 1493
[43.3] C. Agreements to Agree 1493
[43.4] D. Mediation and Arbitration 1494
[43.5] II. Technical Meanings and Terms of Art 1494
[43.6] A. Meaning of Alimony 1495
[43.7] B. Bi-Weekly Versus Bi-Monthly 1495

[43.8] C. Definition: Income 1495
[43.9] 1. Gross Income, Gross Earnings 1495
[43.10] 2. Gross Earned Income, Gross Earnings 1496
[43.11] 3. Current Gross Income 1497
[43.12] 4. Wages Versus Gross Income, Wages Includes Retirement Income 1497
[43.13] 5. Net Income 1498
[43.14] 6. Net Pay 1499
[43.15] 7. Income per Definition of CSSA 1499
[43.16] III. Spousal Maintenance 1500
[43.17] A. Conditions Regarding the Duration of Spousal Support 1500
[43.18] B. Provision That a Spouse Will Not Work During a Divorce 1501
[43.19] C. Does "Income" of $30,000 per Year Include Benefits? 1501
[43.20] D. "In Consideration of the Other Provisions" 1502
[43.21] E. Cohabitation Clause 1502
[43.22] F. Payor "Shall Purchase and Maintain, Throughout the Lifetime Of"; Other Spouse Survives Death of Payor 1503
[43.23] G. *Kromberg* Clause 1503
[43.24] H. Non-Molestation Clause: Dependent or Independent Covenant 1504
[43.25] I. Termination of Unallocated Spousal Maintenance and Child Support 1504
[43.26] IV. Spousal Maintenance Based on Immigration Affidavit of Support 1505
[43.27] V. Child Support 1505
[43.28] A. Failure to Include Limiting Language in Agreement on Cap of Combined Parental Income 1505
[43.29] B. Trade-Offs in Lieu of Child Support 1506
[43.30] C. Bargaining Away Tax Benefits Arising From Child Support 1507
[43.31] D. "Child Support Payments in Advance" Against Future Child Support: Payments or Usury? 1507
[43.32] E. Unallocated Support 1508

[43.33] F. Termination of Unallocated Child Support; No Implied Conditions 1509
[43.34] G. Termination of Unallocated Spousal Maintenance and Child Support 1510
[43.35] H. Although Purpose of Money Is Spelled Out in Agreement, Provision Held Ambiguous 1511
[43.36] I. Child Support "Until the Attainment of Majority" 1511
[43.37] J. "Minimum Amounts of Child Support" Upward Modification Available 1511
[43.38] K. Contractual Standards for Modification of Child Support 1512
[43.39] L. Specifically Defined Emancipation Event Terminates Payment Obligation to Parent, But It Does Not End the Obligation to Support Child 1512
[43.40] M. Duration of "Additional Child Support" 1513
[43.41] N. Credit for College Room and Board Against Basic Child Support 1513
[43.42] O. Automobile Expenses for One of the Children 1516
[43.43] VI. First Priority to Care for the Children 1516
[43.44] VII. Child Care 1517
[43.45] A. Mutual Agreement to Select Child Care Provider 1517
[43.46] B. "Use of Same Child Care Person in Each Home" 1517
[43.47] C. Child Chaperone to Effect Long-Distance Travel for Visitation 1517
[43.48] VIII. Camp 1518
[43.49] A. "Day Camp" Versus "Sleep-Away Camp" 1518
[43.50] B. "Comparable Camp" 1518
[43.51] IX. Enforcement of Child Support 1518
[43.52] A. Formal Demand as a Predicate to Reimbursement for Child-Related Expenses 1518
[43.53] B. Agreement That Child Support Not Be Paid Through the Support Collection Unit 1518

[43.54] C. Notice as Condition Precedent to Child Support 1519
[43.55] X. Private School, Boarding School, Therapeutic Institutions..... 1520
[43.56] A. Special Education 1520
[43.57] B. Educational Expenses Deemed Child Support 1521
[43.58] C. Therapeutic Boarding School as Medical Expense..... 1521
[43.59] XI. Definition of College 1522
[43.60] A. Definition of College Expenses, Grants and Scholarships, Sports..... 1522
[43.61] B. Veterinary Program Is Not a College Education..... 1523
[43.62] C. *Attea v. Attea* 1524
[43.63] D. College-Level Education 1525
[43.64] XII. College 1525
[43.65] A. Contractual College Expenses, When Agreement Is Silent as to Age 1525
[43.66] B. "College Tuition and Expenses" Extends Obligation Beyond Child's 21st Birthday... 1526
[43.67] C. Support/Tuition Beyond a Child's 21st Birthday When Fully Matriculated..... 1526
[43.68] D. Child Support Until a Specific Age or Event, Attainment of a Degree 1527
[43.69] E. Attendance at a Specific College..... 1527
[43.70] XIII. Provisions Requiring Consultation With or Consent of the Non-Custodial Parent..... 1530
[43.71] A. General 1530
[43.72] B. Implicit Duty to Consult, Burden of Proof Regarding Consent 1533
[43.73] C. Parent Not Consulted..... 1534
[43.74] D. "Consultation Clause" Not Enforceable, Agreement to Agree to Negotiate..... 1535
[43.75] E. "The Well Being, Education and Development of the Children Shall at All Times Be Paramount"..... 1537
[43.76] F. When the Agreement and the Consent Must Be in Writing..... 1538
[43.77] G. How Many Consultations Are Necessary to Satisfy a Contractual Consultation Requirement?..... 1538

[43.78] H. Tacit and Implied Consent 1539
[43.79] I. Refusal to Receive Mail, No Timely Objections 1540
[43.80] XIV. College Tuition 1540
[43.81] A. College Expenses 1540
[43.82] B. "Assist Reasonably" With Child's Higher Education Does Not Distinguish Between Private or Public College 1544
[43.83] C. "Shall Endeavor" to Pay College Expenses 1544
[43.84] D. Silence in an Agreement as to College Expenses 1544
[43.85] E. College Tuition Versus College Expenses, Room and Board, Basic Child Support 1545
[43.86] F. Bills Incurred While at College 1545
[43.87] XV. Burden of Proof as to Reasonableness of Withheld Consent 1546
[43.88] XVI. Sports and Extracurricular Activities 1548
[43.89] XVII. "Residence Away From the Custodial Parent" "or Otherwise," *Ejusdem Generis* 1548
[43.90] A. College Residence Not Deemed Residence Away From Home 1549
[43.91] B. Child Support Conditioned Upon Child's Full-Time Residence With the Mother 1549
[43.92] XVIII. Definition of Medical Services; Health Care Providers 1550
[43.93] XIX. Real Property 1551
[43.94] A. Date of Sale 1551
[43.95] B. Duration of Exclusive Occupancy Not Specified 1551
[43.96] C. Duration of Real Estate Payments Until the Occurrence of an Enumerated Event 1553
[43.97] D. Buyout Price 1554
[43.98] E. Payment Schedule Must Be Honored Pursuant to the Agreement 1555
[43.99] F. Descriptions of Parcels of Land 1555
[43.100] G. Expenses 1556
[43.101] H. Credit for Down Payment; Down Payment Does Not Include Closing Costs 1556

[43.102] XX. Taxes 1557
[43.103] A. Tax Exemptions for Children; "Subject to" Federal and State Taxes 1557
[43.104] B. Change in Tax Laws Re: Deductibility of Spousal Maintenance 1557
[43.105] C. Indemnification of Tax Liabilities, Including Interest and Penalties..... 1558
[43.106] D. Joint Tax Returns and Hold Harmless Clause 1559
[43.107] E. Joint Returns and Proportional Contribution Toward Taxes..... 1559
[43.108] F. Equal Division of Tax Return..... 1559
[43.109] G. Disclosure of Front Page of Tax Return Does Not Permit Any Redactions..... 1560
[43.110] H. Directive to Parent to Execute IRS Form to Claim Child as Dependent..... 1560
[43.111] XXI. Pensions and Estates 1561
[43.112] A. Disability Pensions 1561
[43.113] B. "The Pension Shall Be Divided Pursuant to the *Majauskas* Formula," Date Payment Can Begin 1562
[43.114] C. "The [Party] Shall Opt to Have the Pension Throughout the Life of the [Party]" 1562
[43.115] D. Separation Agreement and Survivor Benefits..... 1562
[43.116] E. Military Pension Distribution 1563
[43.117] F. Language Regarding Navy Pension 1564
[43.118] XXII. Other Clauses 1565
[43.119] A. Intervening Event 1565
[43.120] B. Separation Agreement Converts Distributed Property Into Separate Property 1565
[43.121] C. Words in an Agreement Are to Be Given Ordinary Dictionary Definitions..... 1566
[43.122] D. Release of Charges by Corporate Alter Ego..... 1566
[43.123] E. Amortization Payment..... 1566
[43.124] F. Separate Property, Coming Off the Top.... 1567
[43.125] XXIII. Taxes, Capital Gains 1567
[43.126] A. Capital Gains Versus Taxes Under CPLR 5234(a) and 5236(g) 1567

[43.127] B. Transfer Taxes as a Component of Obligation to Transfer Title 1568
[43.128] XXIV. Estate Waivers 1569
[43.129] A. *In re Maruccia* 1569
[43.130] B. Inheritance Clause 1574
[43.131] XXV. Marital Residence 1575
[43.132] A. Agreement to Sell the Marital Residence... 1575
[43.133] B. Obligation to Continue Paying Half the Mortgage 1575
[43.134] C. Death, Settlement Agreements and Property Distribution 1576
[43.135] XXVI. Sale of a Business: Does the Sale of a Business Constitute a Business Profit? "Sell and Transfer" Includes Encumbrance 1576
[43.136] XXVII. Boilerplate Unrestricted Residency Clause Does Not Allow Relocation Anywhere With Child 1577
[43.137] XXVIII. Prenuptial 1578
[43.138] A. Language in Prenuptial Agreement 1578
[43.139] B. Waiver of All Rights Under the DRL and Equitable Distribution Law 1579
[43.140] C. Waiver of Rights in the Estate Is Not a Waiver of Equitable Distribution 1580
[43.141] D. Agreement as to Property Distribution in Case of Death but Not Divorce 1580
[43.142] XXIX. Distribution of Proceeds per Prenuptial Agreement 1580
[43.143] XXX. Language of the Prenuptial Agreement Followed 1581
[43.144] XXXI. Language in Prenuptial Agreement Regarding Estate Distribution 1582
[43.145] XXXII. Medical Expenses 1583
[43.146] A. Pharmaceutical Expenses 1583
[43.147] B. "Orthodontia, Dental and Ophthalmology and Necessities" Does Not Mean All Medical Necessities 1583
[43.148] C. "Medical Expenses" Includes Dental and Ophthalmology 1584
[43.149] D. "Necessary Medical Expenses" Includes Orthodontia 1585
[43.150] E. "Medical Expenses" Includes Allergy Inoculations and Dental Expenses 1585

[43.151] F. Extraordinary Medical and Dental Expenses 1586
[43.152] G. Medical Coverage; Level of Coverage Versus Cost of Coverage 1586
[43.153] XXXIII. "Prevailing Party" and Counsel Fees 1587
[43.154] XXXIV. Past Versus Future Tense, Future Services 1590
[43.155] XXXV. "De Novo" Designation in an Agreement Is Insufficient to Confer Subject Matter Jurisdiction Upon Family Court for Support Modification 1590
[43.156] XXXVI. Miscellaneous 1590
[43.157] A. Releases, "All Manner of Actions . . . Past, Present, or Future" and Fraud Claims 1590
[43.158] B. Premium Clauses in Retainer Agreements 1591

Appendix U.S. Sponsors of Foreign Nationals Must Beware! 1593

Table of Authorities 1597
Index 1739

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

ELLIOTT SCHEINBERG, ESQ.

Elliott Scheinberg, whose practice is limited to matrimonial appeals, serves on the Board of Managers of the American Academy of Matrimonial Lawyers and co-chairs its Amicus Curiae and CLE Committees. Mr. Scheinberg is also a consultant to practitioners on appeals, memoranda, briefs and motion practice in matrimonial law. He has authored a variety of chapters for Matthew Bender's *New York Civil Practice, Matrimonial Actions*; and is the author of "Grandparental Visitation: Its Evolution in New York State," which traces the history and evolution of grandparental visitation in New York, published by the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law. He has written numerous articles for the *New York Law Journal*, where he is a regular contributing author, the New York State Bar Association's *Family Law Review*, and the *New York Family Law Monthly.* His articles have been cited in McKinney's Consolidated Laws of New York Annotated and by the New York State Supreme Court. Mr. Scheinberg has written five amicus curiae briefs to the New York State Court of Appeals, having been cited in one decision, with others adopting arguments advanced in the briefs.

Mr. Scheinberg lectures regularly at the Appellate Division, Second Department, and for Bar Associations. He has been invited to lecture several times at the Judicial Institute. He is a member of NYSBA's Executive Committee of the Family Law Section and is the co-chair of NYSBA's Amicus Committee.

A graduate of the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law in New York City, Mr. Scheinberg, prior to entering law school, was a Doctoral Candidate in Romance Philology at the University of Chicago, and a Teaching Fellow in the French Department, Romance Linguistics Program, at the University of Michigan in Ann Arbor. He received his Bachelor of Science in Mathematics and French from Brooklyn College, Brooklyn, N.Y.