

New York Lawyers' Practical Skills Series

Residential Landlord-Tenant Law and Procedure

Honorable Gerald Lebovits
Damon P. Howard, Esq.
Dov Treiman, Esq.

2018–2019

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION



New York State Bar Association publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2018
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 978-1-57969-542-2
Product Number: 416919

CONTENTS

I.	Introduction	1
II.	The Tenancy	2
	A. Market Rentals.....	8
	1. The Parties	10
	2. The Premises.....	13
	3. Rent.....	14
	4. Default	15
	5. Legal-Fees Provisions.....	16
	6. Recording of Leases	22
	B. Rent Regulation	22
	1. Rent-Controlled Premises	24
	2. Rent-Stabilized Premises	28
	a. Rent Stabilization Overview	28
	b. Tenants' Rights Under Rent Stabilization	30
	c. Exemptions From Rent Stabilization	34
	3. Rent-Overcharge Claims	41
	4. Succession Rights	45
	5. Preferential Rents	48
	C. Public Housing	50
	D. Section 8 (Tenant and Project-Based) Housing.....	52
	1. The Voucher Program	52
	2. Project-Based Section 8.....	57
	E. Cooperatives and Condominiums.....	58
	1. Cooperatives Generally	58
	2. Cooperative and Condominium Conversions.....	60
	3. Condominiums.....	62
	4. Cooperative and Condominium Summary Proceedings in New York City ...	62
	5. Subsidized/Regulated Cooperatives Under the Private Housing Finance Law	63
	a. Housing Development Fund Companies	63
	b. Limited-Profit Housing Companies (Mitchell-Lama Housing).....	64
	F. Lofts.....	65
	G. Hotels and Single-Room Occupancy Buildings (SROs)	67
III.	Tenancy Protections	70
	A. Housing Discrimination.....	70
	B. Warranty of Habitability.....	72
IV.	Conveying the Tenancy	76
V.	Summary Proceedings	79
	A. Introduction to Summary Proceedings	79
	1. Overview	79
	2. The Basic Structure of Modern Summary Proceedings	82
	a. Pleadings	82
	b. Governing Procedural Statutes	83
	c. Counterclaims and Jury Waivers	84

d.	Attorney Fees and Costs	84
e.	Types of Summary Proceedings	84
B.	Holdover Proceedings	85
1.	Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants.....	86
2.	Grounds for Holdover Proceeding Against Tenants—Breach of a Substantial Obligation of the Tenancy	88
a.	Unauthorized Sublets.....	88
b.	Pets.....	92
c.	Alterations.....	94
d.	Security Deposit.....	95
e.	Specified Use or Purpose.....	95
3.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Wrongful Acts of Tenants and Nuisance	96
a.	Nuisance.....	96
b.	Hoarding	99
c.	Chronic Late Payment of Rent.....	99
d.	Access	101
e.	Destruction of the Premises	102
f.	Illegal Occupancy	102
g.	Illegal Use	102
4.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Tenants—Separate Grounds to Recover Rent-Regulated Units	105
a.	Nonprimary Residence	106
b.	Owner’s Use	109
c.	Recovery for Use by Nonprofit Institution	113
d.	Demolition	114
(1)	Application and Requirements under Rent Stabilization.....	114
(2)	Notice Requirements under Rent Stabilization.....	115
(3)	Administrative Orders, Conditions and Tenant Protections under Rent Stabilization.....	116
(4)	Distinction Between Rent Control and Rent Stabilization	118
e.	Withdrawal From the Rental Market	118
f.	Eviction Plan.....	118
g.	Failure to Renew	119
h.	Profiteering	120
5.	Grounds for Holdover Proceedings Against Nontenants.....	120
a.	Proceedings by Purchasers in Foreclosure.....	120
b.	Licensee Proceedings.....	121
c.	Squatters.....	122
d.	Occupant Remaining in Possession After Sale of the Premises	123
e.	Vendee in Possession After Default Under Contract of Sale	124
f.	Occupant Under Cultivation Agreement	124
g.	Employer-Employee Proceedings.....	124
h.	Occupant After Termination of Life Estate	126
i.	Occupant by Forcible or Unlawful Entry	126
6.	Predicate Notices	126

a.	Overview.....	126
b.	Notice to Cure.....	126
c.	Notice of Termination.....	128
d.	Timeliness of Notices Served by Mail.....	135
7.	Notice of Petition and Petition.....	136
a.	Notice of Petition/Service/Necessary Parties	136
(1)	Issuance of the Notice of Petition	136
(2)	Timing for Service of the Notice of Petition and Petition	136
b.	Contents of the Petition.....	139
(1)	General Requirements.....	139
(2)	Description of the Premises Sought to Be Recovered	140
(3)	Statement of the Parties' Interests in the Premises Sought to Be Recovered.....	141
(4)	Regulatory Status of the Premises and Compliance With the Applicable Rent Regulation Laws	142
(5)	Verification of the Petition	143
(6)	Liberalization of Pleading Requirements	144
(7)	Alternative Pleadings.....	144
(8)	Inquests	145
C.	Nonpayment Proceedings.....	146
1.	Proper Parties.....	146
2.	Elements of a Nonpayment Proceeding.....	147
3.	What May Be Recovered as Rent in a Nonpayment Proceeding	147
4.	Rent Demands.....	149
a.	Overview.....	149
b.	Contents of the Rent Demand.....	149
c.	Modifying Notice Requirements by Agreement Between the Parties	152
d.	Oral vs. Written Rent Demands.....	152
e.	Compliance With the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	153
5.	Notice of Petition and Petition.....	154
6.	Defaults.....	155
7.	Spiegel Law	156
8.	Bankruptcy.....	157
D.	Answering a Summary Proceeding	157
E.	Recovery of Use and Occupancy in Summary Proceedings	161
F.	Disclosure in Summary Proceedings.....	165
G.	Rent Deposits/Pendente Lite Use and Occupancy	167
H.	Stays, Warrant, Cures	169
1.	Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Nonpayment Proceedings	169
2.	Stays of Warrants/Execution/Eviction in Holdover Proceedings.....	171
a.	Ten-Day Stay of Warrant of Eviction in Breach of Lease Holdover Proceedings.....	171
b.	Extension of the Post-Judgment Cure to Holdover Proceedings Based on Grounds Other Than Breach of Lease	172
(1)	Non-Renewal of a Rent Stabilized Lease	172
(2)	Failure to Give Access.....	173

	(3) Nuisance.....	173
	(4) Unavailability of a Post-Judgment Cure in Certain Types of Holdover Proceedings.....	173
	(5) Public Policy Against Forfeiture of Tenancies in New York.....	175
	(6) Non-Residential Tenants and Tenants Outside the City of New York.....	175
	(7) Prevailing Landlords’ Entitlement to Attorney Fees	175
	3. General Powers to Stay Warrants in Summary Proceedings.....	175
	4. Stay of the Proceeding Itself Before or After Judgment.....	176
I.	Service of Process in Summary Proceedings	177
	1. Overview of “Traverse” in Summary Proceedings	177
	2. Service Requirements	178
	3. Challenging Service.....	182
	4. Process Server Rules and Regulations in the City of New York.....	183
	a. Overview of Rules	183
	b. Licensing Requirements/Process Servers and Process Server Agencies.....	184
	c. Mandatory Posting of Bonds	184
	d. Record-Keeping Requirements.....	184
	e. GPS Technology	185
	f. Judicial Actions and Proceedings/Claims for Improper Service/Traverse Hearings	185
	g. Exemptions	186
J.	General and Affirmative Defenses to Summary Proceedings.....	186
	1. Overview.....	186
	2. Traverse/Service	187
	3. Lack of Multiple Dwelling Registration in New York City	187
	4. Lack of a Proper Certificate of Occupancy	188
	5. Failure Accurately to State Regulatory Status and Comply With Rent Laws.....	189
	6. Omitting or Misstating Required Elements of the Petition	190
	7. Lack of Proper Predicate Notice/Rent Demand Notice.....	190
	8. Predicate Notice Vitiating/Tenancy Reinstated	190
	9. Retaliatory Eviction.....	190
	10. A Laches Defense in a Nonpayment Proceeding	191
	11. Conditions.....	193
	12. Actual Eviction/Constructive Eviction	193
	13. Statute of Limitations	194
	14. Succession Rights	194
	15. Waiver of a Breach of Lease	195
K.	Alleging a Respondent’s Military Status.....	195
L.	Competency of Parties to a Landlord-Tenant Proceeding, Including the Unrepresented, Non-English Speakers, and Those Needing Guardians Ad Litem.....	197
M.	Settlements and Stipulations in Landlord-Tenant Summary Proceedings	199

	N. Enforcing Warrants of Eviction and Orders of Possession	206
	O. Post-Eviction Relief.....	207
VI.	Landlord-Tenant Actions and Proceedings Other Than Nonpayment and Holdover Proceedings.....	210
	A. Ejectment Actions	210
	B. HP Proceedings	212
	C. Article 7-A Proceedings	218
	D. Proceedings Under the Tenant Protection Act in New York City.....	219
	1. Expanded Definitions of Harassment	220
	2. Presumption of Intent	221
	a. Penalties for Harassment	221
	E. Illegal Lockout/Unlawful Eviction Actions and Proceedings	221
	1. Overview	221
	2. Summary Proceedings to Be Restored to Possession	222
	3. Criminal Penalties.....	223
	4. Plenary Actions for Damages/RPAPL § 853	223
	5. Defenses Against Illegal Lockout Allegations	224
	F. Foreclosure Proceedings.....	224
	G. Yellowstone Injunction Actions	231
	H. Plenary Actions Between Landlords and Tenants.....	233
VII.	Abandonment and Surrender of Possession	233
VIII.	Courts That Award Possession of Real Property	236
	A. Overview of Which Courts Adjudicate Summary Proceedings in Which Geographic Locations.....	236
	B. Supreme Court.....	236
	C. The New York City Civil Court	237
	D. New York State District Courts (Nassau and Suffolk Counties)	241
	E. City Court	242
	1. The Housing Part of Buffalo City Court	242
	a. History	242
	b. Code Violation Actions	242
	(1) The Initial Impetus Behind the Problem-Solving Model— District-by-District Scheduling.....	243
	(2) Use of Housing Court Liaisons.....	243
	(3) Arraignment	245
	(4) Use of Interlocutory Orders	245
	(a) Orders to Vacate	246
	(b) Demolition Orders.....	246
	(c) Receiverships.....	246
	(d) Case-Specific Orders.....	247
	(5) The Funding Calendar	247
	(6) Sentencing.....	248
	c. Evictions	250
	(1) Accessibility.....	251
	(2) Legal Representation for Qualifying Tenants.....	251
	(3) Linkage	251

	(4) Stays Until Housing Violations Are Addressed	252
	(5) Stipulations	252
	(6) Mandatory Mediation	253
	(7) Habitability Investigations and Hearings.....	253
	(8) Duty to Repair in the Commercial Setting.....	254
	(9) Hearing Before the Court Attorney/Referee	254
	(10) Money Judgments and Appearances in the Buffalo City Court	254
	(11) Attorneys Signing Petitions	255
	(12) Control of Out Dates.....	255
	(13) Evictions in Section 8 Tenancies	256
	(14) Conclusion	256
	2. City Courts Outside Buffalo and the City of New York	256
	(1) Binghamton City Court.....	257
F.	Justice Courts.....	259
	1. Overview.....	259
	2. Eviction Proceedings Specific to Town and Village Courts in Upstate New York	259
	3. Justice Courts: Jurisdiction and Venue.....	260
	4. Notice of Petition.....	261
	5. Petition.....	262
	6. Service	262
G.	Surrogate’s Court.....	263
H.	County Courts.....	263
I.	Federal Courts	263
IX.	Appeals.....	264
X.	Conclusion.....	269
Appendix 1	Duties of Housing Court Liaisons	271
Appendix 2	Script for Arraignments.....	273
Appendix 3	Order for Access.....	277
Appendix 4	Order to Vacate	279
Appendix 5	Order Appointing Receiver	281
Appendix 6	Response to Violation Notice/Request for Rehabilitation Funding Assistance	285
Appendix 7	Petition Addendum.....	287
Appendix 8	Memorandum, Decision and Order	289
Appendix 9	Stipulation	293
Appendix 10	Referral to Department of Health for Premises Violations	295
Appendix 11	Request for Extension of Time for Issuance or Execution of a Warrant of Eviction	297
	Residential Landlord-Tenant Forms Index	301
	Table of Authorities	483
	About the Authors.....	537

HONORABLE GERALD LBOVITS

Hon. Gerald Lebovits has been a New York City judge since 2001. An acting Supreme Court justice in New York County, he serves as the president of the New York State Association of Acting Supreme Court Justices. He previously presided in Civil Court, for which he was the president of the Board of Judges of the New York City Civil Court; Criminal Court; and Housing Court, for which he served as the president of the Association of Housing Court Judges. A part-time teacher for 34 years, he is an Adjunct Professor of Law at Columbia Law School, Fordham University School of Law, and New York University School of Law and was an adjunct at St. John's University School of Law and New York Law School. Active in the New York State Bar Association, for which he has lectured at many Continuing Legal Education programs, he is a past Co-chair of the Association's Committee on Landlord and Tenant Proceedings; has authored the Bar Journal's Legal Writer column since 2001; and has published 30 articles in the Association's journals, 19 of them in the Association's New York Real Property Law Journal. A Canadian native, he graduated from the Ottawa (LL.L.), Tulane (M.C.L.), and New York University (LL.M.) law schools.

Justice Lebovits dedicates this book to his late father, Eugene Lebovits, a man of unsurpassed heroism and valor.

DAMON P. HOWARD, ESQ.

Damon P. Howard is a partner of Ephron-Mandel & Howard, LLP., and practices real estate law in New York and New Jersey, with experience ranging from commercial litigation to residential and commercial landlord-tenant issues. Mr. Howard advises property owners, developers and lending institutions on regulations affecting ownership, financing and redevelopment of residential and commercial properties, and real property tax benefits programs, and performs due diligence for buyers and lending institutions to identify regulatory issues and potential liability that may affect development plans or valuation. Mr. Howard also assists property owners and developers with strategies to optimize rent incomes in both regulated and unregulated properties. Mr. Howard has represented clients in seminal cases in the State's highest courts and represented national not-for-profit institutions with their real estate needs. He has been published by the New York Law Journal and lectured at bar association seminars and real estate classes as an expert on real estate and administrative law. Mr. Howard is a graduate of the University of Texas at Austin and the Tulane University Law School. He is admitted to practice in New York, the Southern District of New York, New Jersey, and Louisiana.

DOV TREIMAN, ESQ.

Dov Treiman chairs Adam Leitman Bailey, P.C.'s Landlord-Tenant Civil Litigation Practice and is a partner at the firm.

Mr. Treiman was in private practice for 15 years before devoting his principal time to collecting, editing, writing, and publishing materials in landlord-tenant law. His writings include articles in the New York Law Journal, the New York State Bar Association Real Property Law Journal, the New York State Bar Association Journal, and the Landlord-Tenant Practice Reporter.

Treiman is the Founding Editor and Contributor of numerous articles to the Landlord Tenant Monthly (4 volumes); Editor and Commentator, The Housing Court Reporter (24 volumes); Editor and Commentator, Treiman's Commentaries (3 volumes); Editor, the Housing Court Reporter Chronological Annotator (3 volumes); Editor, the Housing Court Reporter Plaintiff-Defendant Tables (2 volumes); Editor, the Housing Court Reporter Digest (7 volumes); Editor and Commentator, Treiman's New York Landlord Tenant Statutes Annotated (3 volumes); Editor and Commentator, Treiman's Rent Stabilization Code Annotated (3 volumes); Editor and Author, Treiman's Trial Manual;

Editor and Principal Author, Treiman's Encyclopedia and Dictionary (2 volumes); Editor and Commentator, Treiman's Leading Cases (2 volumes); Editor, Public Documents of the DHCR; Editor, the Loft Board Reporter (18 volumes); Editor, the New York City Administrative Law Reporter (3 volumes); and Editor, Landlord Tenant Appellate Reporter (7 volumes).

Of these, the most important is the Housing Court Reporter. For some 30 years, it was the standard work used by all New York City courts and landlord-tenant practitioners to search through some 50,000 cases for applicable precedents.

Mr. Treiman has also written several books on non-legal topics.

Mr. Treiman is a sought-after lecturer on landlord-tenant subjects. He has served as the principal consultant on landlord-tenant matters to the New York Times. Mr. Treiman is the chair of the Apartment Law Insider's Board of Advisors.