

New York Lawyers' Practical Skills Series

Zoning, Land Use and Environmental Law

John P. Stockli, Jr., Esq.
Michael E. Cusack, Esq.
Herbert A. Kline, Esq.
Professor Philip Weinberg

2018–2019

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION



New York State Bar Association Continuing Legal Education publications are intended to provide current and accurate information to help attorneys maintain their professional competence. Publications are distributed with the understanding that NYSBA does not render any legal, accounting or other professional service. Attorneys using publications or orally conveyed information in dealing with a specific client's or their own legal matters should also research original sources of authority.

We consider the publication of any NYSBA practice book as the beginning of a dialogue with our readers. Periodic updates to this book will give us the opportunity to incorporate your suggestions regarding additions or corrections. Please send your comments to: CLE Publications Director, New York State Bar Association, One Elk Street, Albany, NY 12207.

Copyright 2018
New York State Bar Association
All rights reserved
ISBN: 978-1-57969-548-4
Product Number: 423919

CONTENTS

PART ONE: ZONING AND LAND USE

John P. Stockli, Jr., Esq.

Michael E. Cusack, Esq.

Herbert A. Kline, Esq.

I.	Introduction	1
II.	What Is Zoning?	1
III.	Other Land Use Mechanisms	2
	A. Site Plan Review.....	2
	B. Subdivision Control.....	2
IV.	Practical Implications of Land Use and Zoning.....	3
V.	New York Zoning and Land Use Jurisdiction.....	3
VI.	Zoning and Land Use Enabling Legislation.....	4
	A. Town Law.....	4
	B. General City Law	8
	C. Village Law	10
	D. General Municipal Law	12
	E. Municipal Home Rule Law	13
	F. Statute of Local Governments.....	14
VII.	Adoption and Amendment of Zoning Legislation.....	14
	A. Town Law.....	15
	B. Village Law	16
	C. General City Law	17
	D. Municipal Home Rule Law	18
	E. Comprehensive Plan.....	18
	F. Moratoria	19
VIII.	Zoning Board of Appeals	20
	A. Nature and Types of Variances	21
	B. Genesis of Variances	22
	C. Jurisdiction	23
	D. Interpretations.....	24
	E. Perfecting the Appeal	25
	F. The Appeal	25
	G. Limitations on ZBA Authority	28
	1. General Limitations	28
	2. ZBA Precedent	29
	3. Rehearing; <i>Res Judicata</i>	30
IX.	Area Variances	31
	A. Nature of Area Variance.....	31
	B. Standard of Review	31
	1. Neighborhood Character.....	33
	2. Alternatives to Variance	34
	3. Physical/Environmental Conditions	35
	4. Whether Variance Is Substantial	37
	5. Self-Created Hardship	38

	6. Economic Considerations; Personal Benefit/Convenience	40
	7. Court Review	40
X.	Use Variances	41
	A. Nature of Use Variance	41
	B. Standard of Review	42
	1. Lack of Reasonable Return.....	43
	2. Unique Hardship.....	44
	3. Essential Character of the Neighborhood.....	45
	4. Self-Created Hardship	46
XI.	Varying the Variance Criteria	47
XII.	Planning Boards.....	49
XIII.	Site Plan Review.....	49
	A. Nature of Site Plan Review	49
	B. Jurisdiction	50
	C. Standard of Review	51
	1. Scope of Review Authority	51
	2. Limitations on Review Authority	53
	D. Site Plan Review Application Process	54
	E. Authority to Impose Conditions	56
	1. Recreational Land and Substitutes.....	56
	2. Public Infrastructure and Improvements	57
	F. Waiver of Requirements.....	57
XIV.	Special Use Permits.....	57
	A. Nature of the Special Use Permit	57
	B. Jurisdiction	58
	C. Standard of Review	59
	1. Scope of Review Authority	59
	2. Power Reserved to Governing Municipal Board.....	61
	D. Special Use Permit Application Process	61
	E. Waiver of Requirements.....	61
XV.	Subdivision Review	62
	A. Nature of Subdivision Review.....	62
	B. Jurisdiction	63
	C. Standard of Review	64
	D. Subdivision Review Process.....	65
	1. Substantive Review Criteria	65
	2. Posting of Bond or Other Suitable Security	66
	3. Waiver of Requirements or Improvements.....	68
	4. Integration of SEQRA Process; Default Approval.....	68
	5. Filing Requirements; Other Matters	69
	a. Certification of Plat.....	69
	b. Filing of Decision	70
	c. Filing of Final Plat; Expiration of Approval.....	70
	6. Abandonment.....	71
XVI.	State-Mandated Overlays	71
	A. State Environmental Quality Review Act	71

B.	Adirondack Park Agency Regulations	72
C.	Agriculture and Markets Law art. 25-AA	72
D.	General Municipal Law	73
XVII.	Limitations on Zoning Power	75
A.	Takings	75
B.	Authority to Impose Conditions	76
1.	Constitutional Requirements	77
2.	Variance Conditions	78
3.	Special Use Permit and Site Plan Conditions	80
a.	Site Plan Review Conditions	81
b.	Special Use Permit Conditions	83
c.	Religious and School Purposes	83
XVIII.	Open Meetings Law	83
A.	Meetings	84
B.	Public Notice	85
C.	Minutes	87
D.	Enforcement	88
XIX.	Freedom of Information Law	89
A.	Full Disclosure; Exemptions	90
B.	FOIL Procedure	92
C.	FOIL Appeals	93
	Zoning and Land Use Forms Index	99

PART TWO: ENVIRONMENTAL LAW

Professor Philip Weinberg

I.	Introduction	351
II.	Overview of Environmental Law	352
III.	State Environmental Quality Review Act	353
A.	Generally	353
B.	Applicability	354
C.	Environmental Impact Statements.....	355
1.	Need for Environmental Impact Statement (EIS).....	355
2.	EIS Procedure	356
3.	Cumulative Impacts	357
D.	Alternatives.....	357
E.	Mitigation Measures.....	358
F.	Judicial Review	358
IV.	Environmental Land Use Controls	360
A.	When Is a Land Use Control a “Taking of Property”?.....	361
B.	Wetlands Regulations.....	362
1.	State Controls	362
2.	Federal Controls	363
C.	Coastal Resources.....	363
D.	Protection of Water Supply	364
E.	Adirondack Park Agency and Parkland Protection.....	365

	F. Conservation Easements.....	365
	G. Historic Preservation	366
V.	Air Quality.....	366
	A. Clean Air Act.....	366
	1. Generally.....	366
	2. State Implementation Plan.....	366
	3. Enforcement.....	368
	B. Incinerator Controls.....	368
	C. Motor Vehicles	368
	D. Public and Private Nuisance Actions	369
	E. Stratospheric Ozone Layer Protection.....	370
	F. Climate Change	370
VI.	Water Quality	371
	A. Clean Water Act and State Controls.....	371
	1. Generally.....	371
	2. Water Quality Standards.....	372
	3. Discharge Permits.....	372
	4. Bulk Storage of Petroleum.....	373
	B. Enforcement	374
	C. Nuisance and Riparian Rights Actions.....	375
VII.	Noise.....	375
VIII.	Solid Waste.....	376
IX.	Hazardous Materials and Wastes.....	377
	A. Generally	377
	B. Comprehensive “Cradle-to-Grave” Chemical Regulation	379
	C. Manufacture and Transport	379
	D. Storage and “Community Right to Know”.....	380
	E. Hazardous Waste Transport, Storage and Disposal	381
	F. Environmental Justice	382
	G. Contaminated Site Cleanup	383
	H. Pesticide Use	385
X.	Wildlife and Endangered Species.....	386
XI.	Summary of Practice	387
	Selected Bibliography.....	388
	Environmental Forms Index	391
	Table of Authorities	553
	About the Authors.....	571

MICHAEL E. CUSACK, ESQ.

Michael E. Cusack is General Counsel to the Dormitory Authority of the State of New York (DASNY). Mr. Cusack is responsible for all legal services, including legislation, litigation, contract matters, and the legal aspects of all DASNY financings. He most recently served as of counsel to the Albany, New York, law firm of Young/Sommer, LLC, where his practice included representation of upstate New York municipalities, telecommunications service providers in the siting of public utility/personal wireless service facilities and other private sector clients. Previously, Mr. Cusack served as Vice President, General Counsel and Secretary to Independent Wireless One Corporation, a Sprint PCS Network member. He holds a Bachelor of Science degree from Siena College and a Juris Doctor degree from Albany Law School of Union University, and he is a member of the American, New York State and Federal Communications Bar Associations.

HERBERT A. KLINE, ESQ.

Herbert A. Kline was with the Binghamton, New York, firm of Pearis, Kline & Barber, LLP continuously from 1957 until 2007 when he became of Counsel to Coughlin & Gerhart, LLP. Mr. Kline received his bachelor of arts degree from Syracuse University and his law degree from Harvard Law School. From 1957 through 1968, he was Assistant District Attorney of Broome County. Mr. Kline has been active in municipal law for over 50 years, serving as Town Attorney of the Town of Kirkwood since 1958. From 1979 to 2008 he served as either the Town Attorney or the Deputy Town Attorney of the Town of Colesville, and has served as the Village Attorney of the Village of Port Dickinson since 1992 and Attorney for the Town of Sanford since 2005. From 1994 to 2008 he served as either the Town Attorney or the Deputy Town Attorney of the Town of Triangle. He was elected Chairman of the Municipal Law Section of the New York State Bar Association in 1970 and President of the Association of Towns of the State of New York in 1971. He is a member of the Broome County, New York State, and American Bar Associations.

Mr. Kline is the author of *New York Municipal Formbook*, 1st, 2nd, 3rd and 4th editions (NYSBA 2013). He is also the author of *Forms and Outlines of Criminal Procedure for Town Justices and Police*, published by the Association of Towns in 1962, 1965, 1971 and 1978, and the 1977 through 2009 editions of *Small Claims Guide for Town and Village Courts*.

JOHN P. STOCKLI, JR., ESQ.

John P. Stockli is a partner in the Albany firm of Stockli Slevin, LLP. He has over 25 years of experience in land use, zoning, and real estate law related to the development of commercial and utility projects. Mr. Stockli has represented several clients on the sale and leasing of multi-asset real estate portfolios, and issues associated with the acquisition of multiple contiguous properties. He has counseled numerous clients on compliance strategies in the development context and has successfully litigated several land-use cases, including wrongful permit denials for projects ranging from wireless infrastructure to schools and religious organizations.

Since 1999, Mr. Stockli has been co-author of the New York State Bar Association's chapter on Land Use and Zoning for the *New York Lawyer's Deskbook*. Mr. Stockli has also lectured at numerous professional seminars on environmental and land-use issues, including presentations for the New York Judicial Institute; the Appellate Division, Third Department CLE program; and the Broome County Bar Association.

Mr. Stockli is a former Trustee for the New York State Interest on Lawyers Account Fund. He is a graduate of Albany Law School, where he served as Managing Editor for the Albany Law Review. Mr.

Stockli is admitted to practice before the Courts of the State of New York and the United States District Court of the Northern District of New York. He is a member of the New York State Bar Association.

PROFESSOR PHILIP WEINBERG

Philip Weinberg served as a professor of law at St. John's University School of Law in Jamaica, New York, for three decades, until his retirement in 2009. A graduate of Columbia University Law School, his primary area of practice is environmental law. Prior to teaching at St. John's University, Professor Weinberg was the Assistant Attorney General in charge of the Environmental Protection Bureau in the New York State Attorney General's Office from 1970 to 1978. He currently teaches environmental law at Pace Law School and at Columbia University.

Professor Weinberg is a member of the New York State Bar Association (Chair, Environmental Law Section 1988–1989); the New York City Bar Association (Chair, Committee on Environmental Law 1981–1984, Committee on Transportation Law, 1994–1997; Committee on International Environmental Law, 2000–2003; Chair, Downtown Redevelopment Task Force, 2003–2004); and the Association of American Law Schools (Chair, Environmental Law Section, 1983). He has given numerous NYS-BA/CLE lectures. His publications include *Environmental Law: Cases and Materials* (University Press of America, 2006); *Practice Commentary, New York Environmental Conservation Law* (McKinney's, 1984 and annual supplements); *Environmental Law and Regulation in New York* (West, 1996) (co-author); *Environmental Impact Review in New York* (LexisNexis, 1990 and annual updates) (co-author); *Understanding Environmental Law*, 2d Edition (LexisNexis 2007) (co-author); and numerous law review articles.